Blake in the Marketplace, 1986

Robert N. Essick

Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly, Volume 21, Issue 1, Summer 1987, pp. 4-14
Blake in the Marketplace, 1986

BY ROBERT N. ESSICK

After several hyperactive years, the Blake market experienced some slowing of momentum in 1986. No Blake paintings or drawings appeared at auction or in dealers' catalogues, but two slight pencil sketches (illus. 6 & 7) changed hands privately and the Tate Gallery acquired the tempera of Moses Indignant at the Golden Calf by bequest. That worthy institution also purchased at auction one of the great masterpieces by Blake's followers, Richmond's Creation of Light (illus. 9). The only newsworthy events in the market for Blake's separate plates were the appearance of a previously unrecorded state of "Mrs. Q" and the confirmation that a set of the Dante plates is indeed now worth over £20,000. But such prices still pale in comparison to the upper reaches of the art market: $11.1 million for Manet's La Rue Mosnier aux Paveurs, $5.1 million for your basic Mondrian, $2 million for James Rosenquist's F-111 (about what the plane itself originally cost), and $1.1 million for a reasonably comfy chair made in Philadelphia about 200 years ago.

Perhaps the most intriguing (non)event of the year was the failure of Songs of Innocence copy X (illus. 2–5) to find a purchaser at auction. Sotheby's estimate and reserve (the price below which the item is not sold) were simply too high for only 14 plates on 7 leaves. Although offered in a print sale, the bound collection of plates must have been perceived as a book by potential bidders, and thus its incompleteness was crucial. The fact that the book had also been on the market for a year or two before the auction and advertised in Apollo without finding a buyer might have given some hint of the lack of interest at anything close to the asking price. Perhaps the recto/verso printing, a format that hinders leaf-by-leaf sale ("suitable for framing"), helped preserve the volume from a dealer who might break it up. But while the market was displaying this reasoned restraint in late June, one-half of one plate from Innocence (illus. 1) fetched £5,800 hammer price (plus 10% buyer's premium) only five months later. I trust that this sale will not tempt owners of illuminated books to snip them into little pieces before sending them to market. Thankfully, copy X is back in the safe hands of its owner and no longer on the auction (or chopping) block.

The year of all sales and catalogues is 1986 unless noted otherwise. The auction houses listed above add their purchaser's surcharge to the hammer price in their price lists. These net amounts are given here, following the official price lists. Each year, the auction firms become a little slower in issuing their price lists. Thus, I have not been able to cover several sales coming in the last few months of the year. These will appear in the 1987 review. Copy designations and plate numbers for the illuminated books follow G. E. Bentley, Jr., Blake Books (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1977). "Butlin # ___" refers by entry number to Martin Butlin, The Paintings and Drawings of William Blake (New Haven & London: Yale Univ. Press, 1981), 2 vols.

I am grateful for help in compiling this list to David Bindman, Martin Butlin, Ruth Fine, Thomas Lange, Raymond Lister, Arthur Vershbow, David Weinglass, and Richard Godfrey and Henry Wemyss of Sotheby's.

ABBREVIATIONS

BBA Bloomsbury Book Auctions, London
cat. catalogue or sales list issued by a dealer (usually followed by a number or letter designation) or auction house (followed by the day and month of sale)
CL Christie, Manson & Woods, Ltd., London
CNY Christie, Manson & Woods, New York
illus. the item or part thereof is reproduced in the catalogue
pl(s). plate(s)
SL Sotheby's London
SNY Sotheby's New York
st. state of an engraving, etching, or lithograph
Swann Swann Galleries, Inc., auctioneers, New York
# auction lot or catalogue item number
ILLUMINATED BOOKS


"Night" from Songs of Innocence, the lower design only of the second pl. with 9 lines of the text and lower design of the first pl. on the verso. Printed in light brown, with black ink and water colors added by hand, 3.1 x 6.4 cm. Lott and Gerrish, June cat., #27, recto and verso illus. color (£1250). Now in the collection of David Bindman, London. Previously sold Sotheby's Belgravia, 5 April 1977 (£420).

Songs of Innocence, copy X. SL, 27 June, #746, pls. 13, 14, 19, 27 illus. in black and white, pls. 17, 25, 36, 54 illus. color (bought-in at £40,000 on an estimate of £80,000-100,000). See illus. 2–5 and discussion above.

DRAWINGS AND PAINTINGS

Moses Indignant at the Golden Calf. Tempera on canvas, 38 x 26.6 cm., c. 1799–1800. Butlin #387. Acquired 1986 by the Tate Gallery by bequest from the estate of Ian L. Phillips. The Tate is cleaning and restoring the painting; no photo currently available. The sketch for Hecate (Butlin #319) remains in the possession of the Phillips family.

Sketch, Probably for Bunyan's Dream. Sold April by Mrs. Edna M. Maggs to R. Essick. See illus. 6.

Study for The Flight of Moloch. Sold July by David Bindman to R. Essick. See illus. 7.

MANUSCRIPTS ABOUT BLAKE


E. J. Ellis, Gilchrist, Life of Blake (1863), signed on the title-page by Ellis and dated March 1869, with his extensive annotations in vol. 1. D. Heald, March private offer, acquired by R. Essick.

SEPARATE PLATES & PLATES IN SERIES, INCLUDING PLATES EXTRACTED FROM PRINTED BOOKS

"Mrs. Q." SL, 1 Dec., #173, color printed with hand tinting, previously unrecorded state with signatures but before title inscription, illus. (£1100 to D. Heald for R. Essick).

BOOKS WITH ENGRAVINGS BY & AFTER BLAKE

Bell's Edition of the Poets of Great Britain, 1777–83. Swann, 17 April, #151, 109 vols., fancy bindings, in 2 contemporary traveling boxes ($7500); no indication that Blake's print after Stothard for one of the Chaucer volumes is present rather than Cook's of the same design.

Blair, Grave. SL, 9 Dec. 1985, #231, 1808 quarto, spotted, uncut (Seibu, £165). Phillip Pirages, Jan. cat. 10, #64, 1808 quarto "untrimmed," "Day of Judgment" illus. ($1750). Jeffrey Stern, Jan. cat. 3, #458, 1813 quarto, "original blind decorated gilt lettered cloth" (like the 1870 folio?), with 4 pls. by Blake for Lavater's Physiognomy and "nine" [sic?] pls. for Wollstonecraft's Original Stories (1796) "inserted" (£425). Claude Cox, Jan. cat. 52, #18, 1808 quarto, some spotting, uncut (£350). Wilsey Rare Books, Feb. cat. 18, #49, 1808 quarto, "original blue boards," uncut, no mention of cover label ($650). SNY, 14 Feb., #366, 1808 quarto, some soiling, some leaves loose, binding worn (£440). Claude Cox, April cat. 53, #30, 1813 quarto, publisher's blue cloth, "blocked in blind and lettered in gold" (like 1870 reissue), rebacked (£120). Swann, 22 May, #40, 1870 folio, rebound ($300 on an estimate of $80–120). Alan Thomas, May cat. 48, #41, 1808 quarto, fancy binding (£350). Ben Abraham Books, Sept. cat. 6, #11, 1808 quarto, some foxing (£1500); same copy, Jan. 1987 cat. 7, #13 (£1500). Although I have not seen either copy, the two 1813 quarto (noted above) in publisher's bindings, suspiciously like that used for the 1870 reissue, suggest that John Camden Hotten received some unbound 1813 quarto sheets when he acquired Blake's plates from Ackermann. Hotten then bound these up in the same publisher's cloth he used for his facsimile reprint of 1870.

Bürger, Leonora. SNY, 14 Feb., #367, some minor spotting and soiling, rubbed, but a good copy (Quaritch for Arthur Veshbow, £935).

Cumberland, Attempt to Describe Hafod. Cavendish Rare Books, May cat. 22, #38, with half-title, "large paper . . . seemingly a presentation copy" (£185). The fairly detailed cat. description makes no mention of the presence of the map, attributed to Blake, nor could a member of the dealer's staff, contacted after the book had been sold, recall the map's presence.

Cumberland, Thoughts on Outline. CNY, 16 May, #137, advert. leaf at end, rubbed, title-page misprint uncorrected ($385).

2. Blake. "Infant Joy" from Songs of Innocence copy X. Relief etching with white-line work, 11 x 6.8 cm., printed in green and hand colored. The flowers are tinted blue, as in 7 other recorded impressions. Photo courtesy of Sotheby's, London.


Enfield, Speaker. Peter Murray Hill, winter cat. 173, #66, 1797 ed. (£40).


Shakespeare, *Plays*, 1805. BBA, 6 March, #152, 9 vol. issue, spotted, some leaves loose (not sold).


*Vetusta Monumenta*. SL, 11 March, #594, 5 vols. in 3, 1747–1835, some tears, worn (Downie, £165). This collection may include Ayloff’s *Account of Some Ancient Monuments* (1778), with 7 pls. attributed to Blake, although the cat. makes no mention of it.

Virgil, *Pastorals*. Marlborough Rare Books, Oct. cat. 117, #37, vol. 1 only, worn contemporary sheep, some browning, cut no. 1 illus. (£3800).

Wollstonecraft, *Original Stories*, 1791. Jeffrey Stern, May cat. 4, #394, lacking pl. 2 (£245). SNY, 24 Sept., #117, Stopford A. Brooke’s copy, with a duplicate set of the pls. bound in (Justi Schiller for R. Essick, £1430). The duplicates of pls. 3 and 5 are in a previously unrecorded first state. This minor discovery suggested to me that all pls. exist in 3 states. Since pls. 1 and 2 were already known in 3 states, I started searching for unrecorded first states of pls. 4 and 6. These I soon found, via photo files, in a copy of the 1791 ed. in the Rosenwald Collection, Library of Congress, call no. PZ6.W7. Since all these first states, both previously recorded (pls. 1, 2) and newly identified (pls. 3–6), have imprints, all would appear to be published states rather than working proofs.


“Return Home,” wood engraving. Lott & Gerrish, June cat., #146, from the Memoir, illus. (£400).

“Sheep of His Pasture,” engraving. SL, 26 June, #441, 2nd st., printed in brown (£440).

FLAXMAN, JOHN

Charity: Attendants Supporting a Mourning Woman. Pencil, 9¼ x 8¾ in. CL, 4 Feb., #53, with a drawing attributed to Mather Brown (£172).

Anatomical Studies, 1833. Pickering & Chatto, Oct. cat. 69, #50, foxed, worn (£350); same copy, Nov. cat. 70, #25 (£350).


Iliad illustrations. Thomas Thorp, fall cat. 458, #125, with Odyssey, Aeschylus, and Hesiod illustrations, in 1 vol., Florence, L. Piazzini, 1826 (£220). See also Flaxman, Iliad, under Books with Engravings by and after Blake.


FUSELI, HENRY

Celadon and Amelia, circle of Fuseli. Oil, 121.9 x 101 cm., after Fuseli’s painting in the Staatliche Kunsthalle, Karlsruhe. CL, 28 Feb., #164, illus. (£756).

Cleopatra Receiving the Asp. Pencil, pen, touches of wash, 21.5 x 30.5 cm., paper watermarked 1805. SL, 10 July, #50, illus. (not sold).

Dr. James Paying a Bill. Pencil, pen, wash, 11¾ x 8¾ in. CL, 8 July, #105, illus. (not sold on an optimistic estimate—and high reserve?—of £5000-7000).

Head of a Woman Wearing a Necklace and Elaborate Headdress. Pencil, 22.5 x 15 cm. SL, 13 March, #106, illus. (£3520).

Self-Portrait, in dressing-gown and night-cap, smoking a pipe. Black ink, 4½ x 5 in. CL, 8 July, #106, illus. (£4104).

Study of a Young Lady with an Elaborate Headdress. Pencil, 18 x 21 cm. SL, 10 July, #51, illus. (£2420).

Study of Mrs. Fuseli, Wearing an Elaborate Headdress. Gray wash, pen, pencil, 21.5 x 13.5 cm., anatomical sketch on verso. SL, 10 July, #49, illus. (not sold).

3 autograph notes and 2 autograph letters, 1 to “Du Rouvray” discussing an engraving of a picture of Achilles and Briseis. CL, 29 May, #310 (Browne, £432).


Boothby, Sorrows Sacred to . . . Penelope, 1796. Quaritch, Aug. cat. 39, #92, fancy binding ($1250).

Specimens of Polyautography, 1803. 12 lithographs, including works by Barry, Stothard, and Fuseli. SL, 27 June, #745, 4 pls. illus. (£9350).

Winckelmann, Reflections on the Painting and Sculpture of the Greeks, 1765. Spelman's Bookshop, Oct. cat. 9, #120 (£300).


LINNELL, JOHN

Cattle at Hampstead. Water color, 7 x 9 in., signed and dated 1824. Martyn Gregory, Nov. cat. 45, #107 (£950).

Eve Offering the Forbidden Fruit to Adam. Water color, 21 x 16.5 cm. SL, 13 March, #66, illus. (£1320).

Job Offering up Sacrifices for his Children. Oil by Linnell and Hannah Palmer, 56.5 x 76.2 cm. CL, 28 Feb., #85, illus. (£1404). The picture bears no similarities to Blake's Job designs. Previously offered CL, 26 July 1985, #290 (not sold).

Landscape Sketch in Hertfordshire. Pencil, 25.4 x 38 cm., signed and dated 1814. Agnew, Jan. cat. 113, #79 (£350).

Mountain Track. Oil, 70.5 x 98.5 cm., signed and dated 1869–75. SL, 9 July, #96, illus. color (not sold).

Noon. Oil, 72 x 100 cm., signed and dated 1871. SL, 1 Oct., #138, illus. color (£11,000). By the 1860s, Linnell's style had become formulaic, but this very lovely painting shows his ability to exceed the usual limitations of his self-imposed conventions.

Pastoral Scene. Oil, 76.2 x 101.6 cm., signed and dated 1872. CNY, 26 Feb., #143, illus. color (not sold).

Portrait of John Chin. Oil, 28.8 x 22.2 cm., signed and dated 1816. CL, 17 Oct., #129, illus. (not sold).

Portrait of Selby Lowndes. Pencil, 6½ x 4½ in., signed and dated 1820. CL, 22 July, #27, with 5 other portrait drawings by Linnell (£64).

Portrait of the Rev. William Allies, c. 1819, and a portrait of Mary Linnell dated 1829. Pencil, 17.5 x 13 cm., the second smaller. SL, 24 April, #283, Allies portrait illus. (not sold). Offered again, SL, 16 Oct., #424 (same result).

Rev. Edward Bury. Pencil heightened with white, 24.5 x 14.5 cm. SL, 10 July, #126 (£858).

Shallows. Oil, 31 x 43 cm., signed. SL, 9 July, #97, illus. (not sold).

Shepherd and a Shepherdess. Oil, 76 x 101.5 cm., signed and dated 1872. SL, 1 Oct., #287, illus. color (not sold).

Trees in North Wales. Pencil, 4½ x 6½ in., signed and dated 1813. CL, 22 July, #7, with 5 drawings by another hand (£108).
Wooded Landscape with Figures on a Path. Oil, signed and dated 1838. CL, 25 July, #206, illus. (not sold).

MORTIMER, JOHN HAMILTON

Portfolio of 6 drawings, including anatomical studies. Pen and ink, various sizes. SL, 24 April, #233 (not sold); 16 Oct., #363 (not sold).

Group of 3 studies, and studies of 2 helmeted heads of soldiers. Pen and ink, 7¾ x 7¼ in. CL, 8 July, #81 (£453).

War Instigated by the Demon of Discord and Restored by the Virtues. Pencil, pen, wash, red chalk, 9¾ x 8½ in. oval. CL, 8 July, #80 (£702).

PALMER, SAMUEL

Figures Rowing on a Lake. Sepia wash, 3¼ x 4½ in. Martyn Gregory, Nov. cat. 45, #120, illus. (£1800).

Landscape with Windmill. Sepia wash, 3¼ x 4½ in. Martyn Gregory, Nov. cat. 45, #121, illus. (£3000).

“Bellman,” etching. Craddock & Barnard, April cat. 151, #199, 7th st., 1926 printing (£1720); same impression, July supplement to cat. 152, illus. (£1720). CL, 23 April, #621, 5th st., pencil signature, illus. (£2052). SL, 26 June, #457, 7th st., 1926 printing (£990); #458, the same (not sold).


“Homeward Star,” etching. Lott & Gerrish, June cat., #459, 4th st., 1927 printing (£300); #460, 3rd st., 1924 printing, illus. (£460).

5. Blake. “A Cradle Song,” pl. 2, from Songs of Innocence copy X. 11 x 7 cm. The white-line hatching on the background drapery and the white line delineating the woman’s profile are particularly clear in this impression. Photo courtesy of Sotheby’s, London.


“Moeris and Galatea,” etching. Lott & Gerrish, June cat., #463, 2nd st. (£160); #464, 4th st., printed in the 1920s, illus. (£300).

“Morning of Life,” etching. SNY, 7 March, #403, 6th st., pencil signature and inscribed “Trial Proof—Very Good” (£1210).
6. Blake. Sketch, Probably for Bunyan’s Dream. Pencil, approx. 16 x 12.7 cm., on laid paper watermarked M & J LAY 1816. Inscribed by Frederick Tatham, lower right. Essick collection. Butlin, #830, dates the drawing to c. 1824–27 and suggests that it is an alternative version for the first design in Blake’s water-color series illustrating Pilgrim’s Progress. This textual source, however, does not offer an easy identification of the hovering figure (unless she is a personification of “the Similitude of a Dream”) or the figure walking away on the left.


“Sepulchre,” etching. Lott & Gerrish, June cat., #462, 2nd st., illus. (£180).

“Skylark,” etching. Lott & Gerrish, June cat., #452, between 6th and 7th st., laid India, illus. (£750); #452, 7th st. (£425).

“Sleeping Shepherd,” etching. SL, 25 April, #365, 3rd or 4th st. (not sold).

7. Blake. Study for The Flight of Moloch (Milton’s “Nativity Ode”). Pencil, approx. 26 x 20.3 cm., c. 1815, Butlin #541. Essick collection. The underdrawing of the 3 figures nearest the bottom of the sheet accords with their positions and gestures in the first series (1809) of the “Nativity Ode” water colors (Whitworth Art Gallery), but the overdrawing on these figures and the arm positions of the idol, the outline of his crown, and the leg positions of his spirit departing at the top all follow the later series of c. 1815 (Huntington Library). Thus, this working sketch is the intermediary between the two finished versions of this design.


Hamerton, Etching and Etchers. Lott & Gerrish, June cat., p. 64, 1868 ed. with Palmer’s “Early Ploughman” (£850); 1880 ed. with Palmer’s “Herdsman’s Cottage” (£550).
8. The Vision of the Lazar-House (Milton's Paradise Lost). Engraved by Moses Haughton after the painting by Henry Fuseli for his "Milton Gallery." Etching/engraving with aquatint, 53.8 x 67.2 cm., open-letter proof (first published state?), published 10 Oct. 1813. Essick collection. The painting is lost, but two preliminary drawings survive. This large print is now quite rare. David Weinglass tells me that, in his researches for a catalogue of prints after Fuseli, he has not found another impression (the one listed by the Victoria & Albert Museum as being in its collection cannot be located.)


Palmer, S., An Address to the Electors of West Kent, 1832. Marlborough Rare Books, Oct. private offer, disbound (£450).


Palmer, S., *Shorter Poems of Milton*, 1889. CNY, 16 May, #183, large paper, publisher’s vellum, pl. 3 foxed ($220). CL, 30 May, #269, original cloth scuffed (Vine, £97).

RICHMOND, GEORGE (excluding later portraits)

Group of 7 drawings, pencil, ink, and water colors, including 3 washerwomen; Calais, 1828; Moses, c. 1820–23; a devil; bearing wood. 11 x 7½ in. and smaller. CL, 29 April, #10 (not sold).

*Adam and Eve in the Garden of Eden.* Pencil and colored chalk, 44.5 x 61 cm. SL, 10 July, #88, illus. (£880).

*The Creation of Light.* SL, 12 March, #75, illus. color (£52,800 to Spink for the Tate Gallery). See illus. 9.

ROMNEY, GEORGE (excluding portrait paintings)

Folio of 46 drawings, mostly pencil, various sizes, including studies for the Opening of the Ark, Charity, Canidia, L’Allegro, Titania’s Chariot. SL, 13 March, #64, 2 illus. (£3520).

Folio of 22 drawings, mostly pencil, various sizes. SL, 16 Oct., #343, 1 illus. (£418).

Folio of 22 pencil drawings, 28 x 42 cm. SL, 16 Oct., #342, 1 illus. (£330).

Folio of 9 drawings, pencil, various sizes, including studies for Banquo and the Ghost, Fall of the Rebel Angels, prison scenes, the flood. SL, 13 March, #65, 1 illus. (£1210).

*Clustered and Embracing Figures: Study for Howard Visiting the Lazaretto.* Pencil, 5½ x 9¼ in., with 2 others. CL, 18 March, #78 (£151).

*Couple Walking, Arm in Arm.* Pencil, 11 x 14¼ in. CL, 18 March, #77 (£205).

*Studies for Cimon and Iphigenia.* Pen and wash, 10¼ x 16 in. CL, 8 July, #25 (not sold).

*Study for Viscountess Bulkeley as Hebe.* Pen, pencil, wash, 7 x 3¼ in. CL, 18 March, #73, illus. (£1188).

*Study of a Woman Holding a Lyre.* Ink and wash, 23 x 18 cm., foxed. SL, 16 Oct., #385, illus. (£330).

9. George Richmond. *The Creation of Light.* Tempera on panel, 47.5 x 40.5 cm., signed “George Richmond/1826” lower right. The Tate Gallery, the new owner of this magnificent painting, is now repairing the minor damage left of the figure and above his head. Blake executed the same subject as a water color for Thomas Butts (Burlin #433). Might there be some compositional relationship between Blake’s design, untraced since 1853, and Richmond’s? There is no record of Richmond having access to Butts’s collection, where Blake’s drawing would have been by the time Richmond met Blake. Photo courtesy Sotheby’s, London.

*Suppliant and Commanding Figures.* Pencil, 15 x 22½ in. CL, 18 March, #75, illus. (not sold).

*Tancred Supported by Erminia and Vafirino,* 3 studies for. Pen and ink, averaging 7½ x 6¼ in. CL, 8 July, #24 (not sold).

*Temptation of Christ and Angels in Flight,* 2 in 1 frame. Pencil, dated “Sept 93,” 5½ x 8½ in. and smaller. CL, 18 March, #75, 1 illus. (not sold).
STOTHARD, THOMAS

Methought I was enamoured of an Ass. Water color, 5 × 5¾ in. CL, 18 March, #47, illus. (£378).

Triumph of Britannia. Oil on panel, 29 × 95 cm. SL, 12 March, #69, illus. color (£2860).

"Pilgrimage to Canterbury," etching/engraving by Heath and Schiavonetti, 1817. CL, 13 May, #43 (£291).

"Power of Innocence" and "Innocent Stratagem," stipple engravings by J. Strutt. CL, 11 Nov., #41, some staining, with 2 other prints (£110).

"Shakespeare's Seven Ages of Man," engraved title and 7 pls. BBA, 5 June, #498, hand colored, foxed (Fogg, £242).


Collins, Poetical Works, 1797. Jeffrey Stern, May cat. 4, #430 (£70).

Defoe, Robinson Crusoe, 1790. Claude Cox, May cat. 54, #73 (£120).

Hayley, Triumphs of Temper, 1799. Deighton Bell, July cat. 236, #431, rebacked (£35).


DISCUSSION

with intellectual spears & long winged arrows of thought

Reply to Mary V. Jackson
by Charu Sheel Singh

Mary V. Jackson's aim in reviewing my book, The Chariot of Fire: A Study of William Blake in the Light of Hindu Thought, (Blake 18 (1984):721–25), is brought out in the concluding paragraph: "this study is not a search for the truth or a truth or even the facts, but an effort to vindicate one faction and bury its opponents." To this end she begins her review by quoting from the foreword written by P. S. Sastri where he says that British literature cannot be viewed "through the insular binoculars of the British Isles alone," if that literature has any permanent value. While accusing me of always quoting out of context, and being parochial, Jackson shows remarkable talent in the art of rhetoric by not quoting from the foreword: "Without rejecting what Blake inherited from Christianity, he brought out the impact of the Gita on Blake's poetry. Mr. Singh's problem was not Blake's Christian framework, for this has been overworked by able scholars." The language and terminology that Jackson does not understand, she calls "undigested lumps of arcane terminology." But this merely begins a list of blunders.

The quotation from Trevelyan, which seems to Jackson "apropos of nothing" (p. 122), in fact, is the starting point of the discussion that considers British colonialism in India from the earliest times up to roughly Blake's time. Sometimes Jackson says exactly what I have said, but her "peevishness" (the word occurs many times as an accusation upon the author) completely blinds her to the facts. The lines she quotes are these: "no real attempts were made by the Europeans to study Indian culture in its full outgrowth although they were not ignorant of a culture 'fully conscious of its own antiquity'"; she then draws a typically wayward conclusion: "the large number of studies and translations that Singh himself catalogues suggests there was some interest in some aspects of that culture." In fact, the catalogues I have given are in support of my assertion that Western scholars were not ignorant of a culture "fully conscious of its own antiquity."

In the next paragraph the reviewer says that when the accounts by the eighteenth-century indologists were largely reliable, why should I have belabored Europeans' sins of neglect? This observation she makes when a simple survey is being carried out to the point of establish-