ARTICLES

120 Blake and His Circle: An Annotated Checklist of Recent Publications
by D. W. Dörriecker

166 “They murmuring divide; while the wind sleeps beneath, and the numbers are counted in silence” — The Dispersal of the Illustrations to Dante’s Divine Comedy
by Krzysztof Z. Cieszkowski

CONTRIBUTORS

KRZYSZTOF Z. CIESZKOWSKI is a curator in the Library of the Tate Gallery, London, and has recently published studies of Joseph Wright of Derby, Lady Butler, and the prizefighter Bendigo.

DETELF W. DÖRRECKER teaches the history of Western art at the University of Trier. His forthcoming articles include studies of Flaxman’s critique of Bernini in the Lectures on Sculpture and of the engravers’ struggle for full membership in the Royal Academy of Art, 1769-c. 1850.
Blake and His Circle:  
An Annotated Checklist of Recent Publications  

By D. W. Dörrebecker

In a letter to Clare Sydney Smith, dated 6 March 1932, T. E. Shaw reported on the progress he was then making with the compilation of his *Notes of the 200 Class*, a handbook for the use of the Royal Air Force's power boats. Along with the author of *Seven Pillars of Wisdom*, I too may say: "Ever so dull, these bibliographical notes, and entirely impersonal. Nobody could guess that anybody had written them. They seem just to have collected themselves." However, the sheer number of entries which, year after year, "collect themselves" in these annual reports on the current state of Blake scholarship is quite amazing. Thirteen years after the publication of *Blake Books*, G. E. Bentley's dictum that "Blake has become a growth-industry" still holds true. However, while we have been witnessing a change from a cottage industry to what threatens to be a factory one, there certainly seems to be no shortage of new approaches for analyzing and understanding (or, at least, for describing in revolutionary new terminologies) Blake's works as an engraver, painter, and poet.

I worked on the present edition of this continuing report on "Blake and His Circle" both at the University of Rochester Library and the Huntington Library in March 1989, and at Trier University Library from May to August 1989. Chronologically, coverage in this year’s checklist runs roughly parallel with the publication of *Blake*’s volume 22. As before, I have not interpreted the term “recent publications” in its narrowest sense, and I list articles and reviews published as long ago as 1980. Many 1988 issues of scholarly journals were inaccessible to me while being bound; these will be examined and the results included in next year’s checklist.

Readers will note a few changes in the organization and selection of material. While in character and coverage part I remains essentially the same, I have now decided to merge former parts II (Blake’s Circle) and III (Related Interest). Their respective contents have been reorganized into three main sections that make up what is now part II: general studies of the history, art, and literature of Blake’s times, arranged alphabetically by author; this is followed by a list of books and articles on some of Blake’s contemporaries (the “inner” and “outer” circles in which he moved), which is keyed to the names of the authors and artists who are the subject of the respective studies. The third and shortest section of part II is a miscellany (again alphabetized by author rather than subject); it mostly records contributions that have some bearing on our knowledge of the history of Blake studies. While for this section I ignored, for example, Kathleen Raine’s “Recent Poems” (as I have skipped her latest book, *The Presence*, and associated reviews), I have included a dissertation concerned with the literary traditions at work in the same author’s creative writing since I assume that such a study will contain some discussion of Raine’s indebtedness to Blake or Thomas Taylor.

While I shall continue to attempt “absolute inclusiveness” in part I, the other sections of this current checklist will now be treated more selectively than in previous years. In the future, I will not include every essay on Cowper that I happen to track down, nor will I try to list every review of a study of, say, West. For this year’s checklist, I have disregarded various articles and dissertations concerned with Cowper, Godwin, West, and Wollstonecraft. Since no other bibliographical aid to research that is known to me gives easy access to the few books, catalogues, and articles published annually on Barry, Calvert, Crome, George Cumberland, Erasmus Darwin (the study of whose scientific works mostly goes unnoticed in, say, the *MLA International Bibliography*), Flaxman, Fuseli, Hayley, Linnell, Mortimer, Palmer, Richmond, Romney, Stothard, Swedenborg, Thomas Taylor, and Varley, these will still be featured with as few omissions as possible. However, publications concerned with Cowper’s poetry and his letters in general, with Godwin’s novels (as opposed to his political and philosophical writings), with the non-British periods in Paine’s or Priestley’s political careers, with some highly specialized questions concerning the writings of Mary Wollstonecraft or the art of Angelica Kauffmann, or Benjamin West, etc., will not be represented in these reports in the future. Such partial selectiveness will allow me to supply more extensive annotations to the entries in part I, similar to those in the present issue.

Most of these notes are—or at least are meant to be—descriptive; with only a few sentences, often employing
quotations from the authors themselves, I have tried to give some idea of what to expect from a closer reading. Readers will be aware that with the limited space available for such annotation I may have occasionally misrepresented an author’s intentions. And yet, I hope that my brief summaries will function as a temptation to study more of a book or an essay, rather than as an attempt to smother the expectations raised by any given title. However, a few notes have grown into miniature reviews where I thought it permissible to include some critical remarks of my own, and not all of them are entirely appreciative.

Beginning with the 1989-1990 checklist, the same general principles for selecting the entries in parts I and II will be applied to the reviews section. Especially since they often make some independent contribution to our knowledge of the subject and will be important for any attempt to describe and understand the history and progress of Blake studies, I shall continue to list all the reviews of books that are directly concerned with the poet-painter’s works. Reviews for books in part II will be treated more selectively, excluding, for example, reviews that in no way touch on the Blakean interest that was initially responsible for my decision to list the title. Occasionally, however, it may seem appropriate to include one of the short book notes from a monthly publication such as Choice even for these studies if no other and more comprehensive review of a recently published monograph is known to me.

It is for the benefit of those readers of the annual checklists who use them as a reference tool that I have included a list of corrigenda to previous editions of “Blake and His Circle” following the index to this year’s report. The reason for most of the corrections is that a considerable number of publications were examined only after their checklist entries had appeared in print. I hope that readers will not only appreciate these corrections but, at the same time, pardon any errors in the present list.

While I remain responsible for whatever mistakes that remain, it is, as always, a pleasure to record the help I have received from various publishing houses as well as from many of my colleagues who have supplied me with inspection copies or offprints. Special mention is due to David Alexander, Kiyoshi Ando, G. E. Bentley, Jr., Peter Brier, Howard Brogan, Martin Butlin, Andrew Cooper, Pierre Danchin, Morris Eaves, Robert Essick (who, in addition to other favors, has kindly granted permission to reproduce an engraving from his collection), David Fuller, Frederick Garber, Alexander Gourlay, Christopher Heppner, John J. Joyce, Georg Kamp, Desmond King-Hele, Vibeke Knudsen, Jeni joy La Belle, Paul Mann, James McCord, Anne Mellor, Jeanne Moskal, Morton Paley, François Piquet, Kathleen Raine, Dennis Read, Sheila Specter, Michael Tolley, Pam van Schaik, Joseph Viscomi, Dennis Welch, and David Worrall, all of whom have made important contributions to the present issue of this continuing guide to current Blake scholarship.

Moreover, Patricia Neill has tactfully copyedited my typescript and checked it for continuity. (As before, our house style is based—with only a few exceptions that have been explained in previous issues of the checklist—on The MLA Style Manual of 1985.) She has thus given me every kind of assistance with seeing the present issue of “Blake and His Circle” through the press, and her efforts are greatly appreciated by the compiler. Special thanks are also due to Josefine Simon who has efficiently translated my ideas for the illustrations which accompany this year’s list into reproducible photographs.

Finally, let me say that I am sadly convinced that probably all too many publications in the field have been overlooked; I will be most grateful, then, if readers point out any such omissions that may remain for inclusion in a future edition of Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly’s annual bibliographical reports.

Note: An asterisk preceding an author’s, editor’s, or reviewer’s name marks those entries which I have, as yet, not been able to examine, and for which therefore I depend on the authority of secondary sources.
Part I
William Blake

Editions, Translations, and Facsimiles

1. Blake, William. *Jerusalem.* Toronto, ON: Aliquando P, 1982. ["And did those feet in ancient time ..." printed by William Reuter in a limited edition of 100 copies to "celebrate the 225th anniversary of William Blake's birth" (quoted from the colophon).]

2. *Blake, William. Songs of Innocence and of Experience.* Franklin Library. Franklin Center, PA: Franklin Library-Franklin Mint, 1980. [Not seen; a facsimile of Princeton's copy U in a limited edition which was brought to my notice by the combined efforts of Mary Lynn Johnson, John E. Grant, and Robert N. Essick. The facsimile, which seems to have been issued to subscribers only, was accompanied by a pamphlet of 22 pages, *Notes from the Editors: Songs of Innocence and of Experience by William Blake.*]


4. *Isaksson, Folke, ed. and trans. William Blake: Äkten skapet mellan Himmel och Helvete.* With an Afterword by Göran Malmqvist. Tystberga, Swed.: Bokförlaget Epokhe, n.d. [A facsimile of one of the Fitzwilliam copies of *The Marriage of Heaven and Hell* in four-color offset of a "mediocre quality" (Paley), and probably based on either the Dent or the Oxford University Press facsimile. Malmqvist's afterword makes extensive use of quotations from Gronbech's 1933 monograph on Blake.]

5. Lonsdale, Roger, ed. "William Blake (1757-1827)." *The New Oxford Book of Eighteenth Century Verse.* Oxford, Oxon.: Oxford UP, 1984. 686-97. [Twenty of Blake's shorter poems of the 1780s and early 1790s make their appearance in this interesting anthology which also offers selections from the verse writings of Blair (368-69), Cowper (589-616), Anna Seward (752-56), Erasmus Darwin (761-63), Hannah More (808-10), and Anna Laetitia Barbauld (817-18). Among the many poems that are almost unknown today but reprinted here is William Taylor's "The Vision" (811-12) of 1795.]

7. Stevenson, W. H., ed. William Blake: Selected Poetry. Penguin Poetry Library. London: Penguin, 1988. £3.99/$4.95 paper. [This new Penguin selection from Blake's writings is certainly much bigger than Bronowski's which it is designed to replace; it is not necessarily the better for that. "The aim of this selection is to present the best, and the most characteristic, of Blake's poetry" (20). To this end, the Songs of Innocence and Experience, Visions of the Daughters of Albion, Visions of Paradise, the Marriage of Heaven and Hell, and some of the letters to Butts, and excerpts from Vala and Jerusalem, plus "a shortened version of Milton which will give a sense of the work as a whole" (20) are included. The editor has "changed or added punctuation, ... only to what seemed a necessary minimum ... the original spellings are retained as far as possible ... his [i.e., Blake's] many capitals are left largely untouched. In this way," the editor hopes "to have clarified the poetry, while retaining the original flavour of Blake's works" (20; my emphases). A nice example of twentieth-century editorial hodgepodge, decidedly reminiscent of the claims which might have been made by the Rossettis for their selections from Blake's poetry in volume 2 of Gilchrist's Life (1863). I certainly hope that Stevenson's editorial "criteria" will not become standard.

Bibliographies, Bibliographical Essays, and Catalogues

8. Bone, J. Drummond, Bryan Burns, and Owen Knowles. The Nineteenth Century: Romantic Period. The Year's Work in English Studies 66 (1985). Ed. Laurel Brake, with the assistance of Susan Brock, et al. London: Murray; Atlantic Highlands, NJ: Humanities P; for the English Association, 1988. 343-65. [Bone supplies brief glosses on the publication of the MLA's research report on The English Romantic Poets (21#13)—curiously failing to mention the admission of Blake to the MLA's canon in the form of Mary Lynn Johnson's stunningly successful account of Blake scholarship—Watson's English Poetry of the Romantic Period (21#108), Bracher's study of Milton (20#51), Goslee's Uriel's Eye (21#50), Howard's Infernal Poetics (20#111), Paul Mann's article on "Apocalypse and Recuperation" (20#127), and a few other essays published in the same season on 344-46. For short reviews of Lyric Poetry: Beyond New Criticism, ed. Chaviva Hošek and Patricia Parker (21#37/162) and of O'Hara's Romance of Interpretation (21#219) by Nick Royle see also 24-25.]


10. Christie's, London. The Larger Blake-Varley Sketchbook. Sale cat. London: Christie, Manson, and Woods, 1989. A sale catalogue documenting the recently rediscovered second Blake-Varley sketchbook which contains some 50 previously unrecorded Blake drawings. The sketchbook was last heard of in 1864 and was bought in at £450,000 on 21 Mar. 1989 when offered for sale at Christie's Great Rooms as lot 184. The introduction to the present publication (9-12) was written by L. M. C. K. (i.e., Laura M. C. Keen), and besides seven reproductions of Varley's architectural and landscape studies, 56 pages with Blake's drawings and the original binding of the sketchbook are reproduced. The seriousness and professionalism of Blake's draftsmanship in this second series of "visionary heads" will certainly come as a challenge to those who still want to see no more than "a private joke" (Bentley, Blake Books, 1977, 21) in the existence of the Blake-Varley sketches. See also #28, 34, and 47, below.]


13. Erdman, David V., with the assistance of Brian J. Dendle, et al., eds. The Romantic Movement: A Selective and Critical Bibliography for 1986. Garland Reference Library of the Humanities 778. New York, NY: Garland, 1987. 111-34. [As in previous years, the more extensive of the brief reviews of Blake-related books which can be found in this annotated report on current scholarship have been listed separately in part III. There, this volume is referred to in abbreviated form as "RMB for 1986" (1987). Erdman's annual bibliography is also the source of citations for two articles and one exhibition review which have not been listed in previous issues of "Blake and His Circle," but are now included below.]


15. Erskine, Elizabeth, with the assistance of Mary Jean DeMarr and D. Gene England, eds. Annual Bibliography of English Language and Litera-
Malibu is Blake's large color print with "Satan Exulting over Eve" (324-25), which is reproduced both in black-and-white and in color (pl. 16). A drawing by Benjamin West in illustration of "The Fright of Astyanax (Hector Bidding Farewell to Andromache)" figures as item 149 (330-31).


19. Lee, Elizabeth. A Catalogue of Blake Material in the Special Collections of the Barr Smith Library. With an introduction by Michael J. Tolley. Adelaide, S. Aus.: Barr Smith Library, U of Adelaide, 1988. A$2.50 paper. [Documents the Blake-related holdings in the University Library's rare books collection, most of which have been acquired since 1965 to support the teaching and research of Michael J. Tolley. Some 150 items are listed and briefly described. Tolley's introduction is on vii-viii.]


21. Rorschach, Kimerly. Blake to Beardsley: The Artist as Illustrator. Exh. cat. Philadelphia, PA: Rosenbach Museum and Library, 1988. [Catalogue of an exhibition at the Rosenbach Museum (28 Oct. 1988-8 Jan. 1989) which was then shown at the Sterling and Francine Clark Art Institute in Williamstown, MA (4 Mar.-30 Apr. 1989). Among the important Blake exhibits were the "Joseph of Arimathea" drawings (see Butlin 1981, #76 and 780), here discussed as items 1 and 2 (13-14), plus four other pencil drawings by Blake, items 3-6 (see 14-18), and Richmond's study for "The Creation of Light," item 7 (18-19).]

22. Wolf, Edwin, 2nd, ed. Legacies of Genius: A Celebration of Philadelphia Libraries: A Selection of Books, Manuscripts, and Works of Art. Exh. cat. Philadelphia, PA: Philadelphia Area Consortium of Special Collections Libraries, 1988. 216-17. [Only one, yet an important Blake water color was on show in this exhibition and is here reproduced (both in color and in black-and-white) and described as item 178: "The Number of the Beast is 666" (see Butlin 1981, #522), lent by the Rosenbach Foundation.]

Critical Studies

23. Ando, Kiyoshi. "The Textual Problems of The Four Zoas (1)." Jinmon-KagakuRonshu45 (1989): 21-47. ["The ... textual confusion of Night the First is to be the major theme of this serial study" (23). Therefore, in the present article, the author begins by examining and comparing the various page orders established by editors between 1926 (Sloss and Wallis) and 1982 (Erdman) for Night the First of The Four Zoas (23-29); he then treats the "Additional/Deleted Passages of Night the First" (29-31), and follows this with a page-by-page commentary on pages 3 through 20 of the manuscript (31-45).]

24. Andreae, Christopher. "Art Untamed by Reason." Christian Science Monitor 6 July 1989: 16. [Comments on "Newton," the frontispiece to Europe, and the "ambiguity" of some of Blake's imagery which is said to be—mark this—"not without biblical precedent."]


27. Ault, Donald. "Blake and Newton." Epochen der Naturmythik: Hermetische Tradition im wissenschaftlichen Fortschritt/Grands Moments de la Mystique de la Nature/Mystical Approaches to Nature. Ed. Antoine Faivre and Rolf Christian Zimmermann. Berlin, W. Ger.: Schmidt, 1979. 364-80. [An article which, I am afraid, has been overlooked in Blake's checklists for no less than a decade. The author is here concerned with '1) the oppositions between Blake and Newton's philosophical presuppositions about the world they experience, ...; and 2) the opposition between their treatments of the reader of their works' (367). In a sense then, the essay supplies both a revised summary and continuation of some of the chapters in Ault's 1974 monograph on the same subject (see 368) and a first draft of some of the themes he is concerned with in his recent book on The Four Zoas. Both problems are seen as closely interrelated since "Blake counters the thrust of Newtonian thinking not only ideologically but by constructing [in The Four Zoas] a radical form of narration which opposes the characteristics of what can be called, for our purposes, 'Newtonian' narrative" (373).]

28. Barker, Godfrey. "Unknown Blake Drawings Found." Daily Telegraph 20 Feb. 1989. ['Varley lay on a couch in a trance and mouthed names, while Blake called up the spirits.' This note on the rediscovery of the larger Blake-Varley sketchbook (for which see #10, above, and #34 and 47, below) is known to me only through a newspaper clipping, and I am unable to supply a page reference. The author too, however, would probably find some difficulty in identifying the source for his intriguing account of the Blake-Varley séances.]


30. Bentley, G. E., Jr. "The Spirits of Romanticism: The Supernatural in Coleridge's 'Ancient Mariner,' Wordsworth's 'Intimations Ode' and Blake's Book of Urizen." Dibrugarh University Journal of English Studies 6 (1987): 19-37. [Concerned with the romantics' creation of "a mythology widely accepted, or at least readily understood, which could be used as a vehicle for the most profound perceptions of the poets without appealing to gods or mythologies in which neither the poet nor his readers any longer believed" (20). Finds that "Blake, unlike Urizen, does not require that we should believe in his system; he wishes rather for us to see how it can be liberating, by reconceiving the limits of possibility in the universe" (35).]


32. Bidney, Martin. Blake and Goethe: Psychology, Ontology, Imagination. Columbia, MO: U of Missouri P, 1988. $24.00 cloth. ["This book is the first extensive comparative study of Blake and Goethe. Until now critics have been reluctant to consider them on equal terms" (x). And yet, according to Bidney, there is "the unrealized possibility of a Blake-Goethe comparison that, if carried out, might show a deep communion of imaginative thought between kindred Romantic pioneers. ... In both Faust Part II and The Four Zoas, emphasis on the universality of the poet's message contrasts with the resistant texture of a compressed style and the striking complexity of the mythological machinery. ... If the two men are found to have been journeying down parallel paths, happening upon similar insights and expressing them in similar myths—sometimes even in similar dictio and rhythms—a comparison of Blake and Goethe may provide material for an eventual reformulation of our thinking about the Romantic era as a whole" (xii). This study then is not concerned with "provable 'influence' as a basis for literary comparison," with "cause-and-effect relationships," but with "deep-rooted affinities between contemporary introspective explorers," with "spiritual kinships—expressed in similar ideas, myths, and metaphors—which offer a stimulus to the analytic understanding and the synthesizing imagination" (xii). To do so, Bidney surveys "a varied range of each man's most representative work" (xvi), concentrating on Faust and The Four Zoas. See also #39, below.]

33. Billigheimer, Rachel V. "The Female in Blake and Yeats." CEA Critic 48.4/49.1 (1986): 137-44. ["Both Blake and Yeats criticize the unliberated woman. It must be because of this parallel that in the present essay the archetypal Female in Yeats is viewed as illuminating Blake's eternal Female" (137). "Both poets, through the archetypal vision of the Female, aim to communicate a world view beyond rational boundaries. While in Blake woman's subjugation of man ... is a preparatory stage to his spiritual freedom, in Yeats woman frenetically carries out her prophetic role of inaugurating the apocalyptic birth of a new civilization" (143-44). This comparative study is part of a special Milton and Blake issue of the CEA Critic; see also #41, 81, and 171, below, as well as Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly 22 (1988-1989): 47, #96.]
34. Bindman, David. "A Second Blake-Varley Sketchbook Discovered." *Christie's International Magazine* 6.3 (1989): 2-4. [Occasioned by the sketchbook's rediscovery and its being offered for sale at Christie's on 21 Mar., this article briefly describes the volume with its "49 heads by Blake and 16 landscape drawings by Varley" (3); the author also sums up its contents and what is known of its provenance, and states that this second set of Blake-Varley drawings "eclipses the Clayton-Stamm sketchbook in almost every way" (3). Four of Blake's drawings are reproduced. See also #10 and 28, above, as well as #47, below.]


36. Bloom, Harold. "Enlightenment and Romanticism." *Ruin the Sacred Truths: Poetry and Belief from the Bible to the Present.* Cambridge, MA: Harvard UP, 1989. 115-41. [In this expanded version of the Charles Eliot Norton Lectures of 1987-1988 Harold Bloom discusses Milton on 123-30; there, he informs his readers that "Blake has not written Alexander Pope: A Poem in Two Books." Bloom revises his earlier judgment of Blake and now "begins] to fear that in Blake, the Father is Milton, the Son is Blake, who is a profound reduction of Milton and the Bible, and the Holy Ghost of inspiration is a not wholly persuasive special pleading, Blake ... could not ruin the sacred truths, either to fable and old song, or to a story that might emerge clearly from the abyss of his own strong ego, as it emerged from Wordsworth... . Blake is one of the last of an old race of poets; Wordsworth was the very first of the race of poets that we have with us still" (129). New—or at least revisionist—as this may sound, I feel the book's claims for important critical insights must be based on other, non-Blakean chapters.]


38. Bohnsack, Frances Marilyn. "William Blake and the Social Construct of Female Metaphors." *Dissertation Abstracts International* 49 (1988-1989): 2225A. U of Guelph. ["This thesis is a comparison of William Blake's 'Doctrine of Contraries' and Johann Wolfgang von Goethe's 'Principle of Polarity.'" Although "isolated from one another ... Blake and Goethe almost simultaneously rose up against the mechanistic treatment of existence undertaken by the thinkers of the Enlightenment... . Yet the two theories of opposites [that constitute the fundamental unity of the spiritual being] which emerged from the spiritual interest of these two poets were very different in kind. Whereas Blake moved from the world within to the world without, ... Goethe found in the outer world of Nature divine principles which he then applied to the inner spiritual life of man, thus moving from the [world] without to the world within, as it were... . These two conceptions I subsequently contrasted, finding Blake's metaphysical scheme a closed, inflexible system of thought relative to Goethe's open approach to man and Nature." See also #32, above.]

40. Briganti, Giuliano. "La 'strada della fantasia' di Overbeck e l'indignazione di Blake"; and "Füssli e Blake: analogie e differenze nel
Winter 1989/90

Ipittori dell'immaginario: visionario." Biblioteca Electa 6. Milan, It.: Electa, a new and revised edition of a 1977 publication, also contains additional sections on Fuseli as well as on other "pittori dell'abisso" (118) such as Romney, Mortimer, Barry, the Master of the Giants, Alexander Runciman, John Brown, and Sergel as a draftsman.

41. Brogan, Howard O. "Blake on Woman: Oothoon to Jerusalem." CEA Critic 48.4/49.1 (1986): 125-36. [Summarizes previous feminist criticism of the poet's works, then examines "Blake's attitude toward women as a consistent development by looking at it in a much broader mythological context, in relationship to the poet's personal experience in the tumultuous Revolutionary and Counterrevolutionary times in which he lived" (125), "by considering it in the light of Neoplatonic and Gnostic influence upon him" (125), to show that Blake "later developed Ololon, the good aspect of Woman as a counterbalance to Vala, and [that] he finally conceived this good aspect to be Jerusalem, Spiritual Liberty, an essential part of Divine Humanity, with even Vala redeemable" (134). The article is part of a special Milton and Blake issue of the CEA Critic; see also #33, above, and #81 and 171, below, as well as Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly 22 (1988-1989): 47, #96.]


44. Butlin, Martin, et al. William Blake and His Circle: Papers Delivered at a Huntington Symposium. San Marino, CA: Huntington Library and Art Gallery, 1989. $12.95 paper. [This volume contains reprints of articles by Martin Butlin, David W. Lindsay, D. W. Dörbecker, Aileen Ward, Morton D. Paley, and Morris Eaves, and a review by Robert N. Essick, which were simultaneously published in the Huntington Library Quarterly 52 (1989): 1-142. These contributions are listed here separately as #13, 59, 63, 111, 168, 190, and 400(3). With the exception of Lindsay's essay and, of course, Essick's book review, the contributions to the present volume grew from a series of papers first presented at a symposium on "William Blake and His Circle," held at the Huntington on 29-30 Jan. 1988, for which see #124, below.]


47. Checkland, Sarah Jane. "Scepticism over Blake Sketchbook." Times 22 Mar. 1989. [Known to me only through a newspaper clipping; reports on Christie's buying in the second Blake-Varley sketchbook at £450,000 and comments on the sale in "terms of miscalculation." See also #10, 28, and 34, above.]


50. Cirigliano, Marc Anthony. "Minute Particulars: The Theory and Practice of William Blake's Artistic Credo." Dissertation Abstracts International 49 (1988-1989): 159-60A. Syracuse U. ["The central idea of William Blake's artistic credo was his notion of minute particulars, which cannot be comprehended without a full understanding of Sir Joshua Reynolds's idea of general nature. The young Blake rejected as his intellectual sources the rules, rationalism, and general nature of Reynolds and other Enlightenment thinkers ... Given his [i.e., Blake's] emphasis on minute particulars, why does so much of his imagery seem stereotypical? For Blake, it is not stereotypical, but rather particular while embodying universal spiritual truths at the same time." From the abstract at least it appears as if the author might have learned more, both with respect to the chronology of the "young" Blake's reaction towards the academic theory of art and as regards critical logic, from a reading of related studies by Bindman, Joseph Burke, Eaves, and others.]

51. Clark, Jane. "With terrors round ...: The Dark Side of the 18th Century." The Great Eighteenth Century Exhibition in the National Gallery of Victoria. Melbourne, Vic.: National Gallery of Victoria, 1983. 165-79. [Despite the book's title, this "is not a catalogue" (10); rather, the publication "aims to dramatize the richness of the Gallery's 18th century collections." (5). To do so, Clark's concluding chapter discusses an etching by Barry, an engraving after Romney, then a recently acquired Fuseli painting, and (on 173-75) two color-printed plates with additional hand-tinting from Urizen, 101-02. The essay is accompanied by two reproductions in color and 14 illustrations in black-and-white. See also the following entry.]

52. CEB. 173-75. [There are 11 reproductions of approximate photocopy quality which accompany this conference paper on Blake's position in the tradition of the sister arts.]

53. CEA. 173-75. [There are 11 reproductions of approximate photocopy quality which accompany this conference paper on Blake's position in the tradition of the sister arts.]

54. CEA. 173-75. [There are 11 reproductions of approximate photocopy quality which accompany this conference paper on Blake's position in the tradition of the sister arts.]

55. CEA. 173-75. [There are 11 reproductions of approximate photocopy quality which accompany this conference paper on Blake's position in the tradition of the sister arts.]

56. CEA. 173-75. [There are 11 reproductions of approximate photocopy quality which accompany this conference paper on Blake's position in the tradition of the sister arts.]

57. CEA. 173-75. [There are 11 reproductions of approximate photocopy quality which accompany this conference paper on Blake's position in the tradition of the sister arts.]

58. CEA. 173-75. [There are 11 reproductions of approximate photocopy quality which accompany this conference paper on Blake's position in the tradition of the sister arts.]

59. CEA. 173-75. [There are 11 reproductions of approximate photocopy quality which accompany this conference paper on Blake's position in the tradition of the sister arts.]

60. CEA. 173-75. [There are 11 reproductions of approximate photocopy quality which accompany this conference paper on Blake's position in the tradition of the sister arts.]
whether there is "a direct visual disposal" (49). Therefore, "The poet's most useful tool for engagement strategies common to poetry and painting for engaging readers and observers" (1). On account of the vast diversity of the materials dealt with, the results do not always live up to the standards established by the Blake chapter. Analyzing works by Arnold, Blake (mostly from the Songs), Browning, Constable, Egg, Gainsborough, Gillray, Hogarth, Holman Hunt, Lawrence, Leighton, Marvell, Millais, Pope, Reynolds, Romney, Rossetti, Turner, and Wordsworth et al., Cohen wants to describe how the reader and/or observer, suspending disbelief, is drawn into the fictional reality of time and space as represented in poetry and painting. "The experience of engagement begins with a sense of being in the work and includes a conviction that the subject of the work matters; the engaged observer also accedes to a demand for some response—intellectual, moral, or emotional" (1). The discussion of Blake's particular achievement in shaping his "engagement strategies" starts out from the observation that comparison "is the poet's most useful tool for engaging an audience," and asks whether there is "a direct visual equivalent to the battery of comparative techniques the poet has at his or her disposal" (49). Therefore, "the Fly is studied to "illustrate Blake's use of metaphor whose terms are spread across the verbal and visual parts of his plate and the ways in which he relies on the engaged observer to connect his words and design" (66). This leads to a critique of previous "Misreadings" which merely tried "to adjust the symbolic import in the actions of the three figures to fit the meaning of the text" (68) and which precluded the realization of the particular "synthesis of the two arts" (66) that, according to Cohen, is to take place in the viewer. "The reader/observer's engagement with the poem and design begins at the point where the speaker identifies himself with the fly in stanza 2. From there, a successive identification with each of the figures leads to assent to the speaker's conclusions in the last stanzas" (76). The concluding chapters of the book (177-87) attempt to show that engagement is a useful and important category for the definition of what Pevsner termed the "Englishness" of English art. Since authors and artists in Britain during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries considered the engagement of their readers and viewers as essential for the social functioning of their works, and since they shared "the conviction that art must connect with the moral life" (186) of society at large, success or failure in engaging the audience (as opposed to the autonomy of aestheticism) became a measure and criterion of value in art and its theory. It is at this point that Cohen's study of models of reader/observer responses links up with both Erdman's "Historical Approach" and Barrell's or Eaves's analyses of artistic theory.


55. Cooper, Andrew M. "Blake's Escape from Mythology: Self-Mastery in Milton." Doubt and Identity in Romantic Poetry. New Haven, CT: Yale UP, 1988. 54-76. $30.00/£20.00 cloth. [Whereas the title of this chapter in Cooper's book may sound familiar (an earlier version was listed in Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly 15 (1981-1982): 85, #36), it ought to be pointed out that there also are numerous other references to Blake throughout this study of the "two quite different forms of doubt" which—according to the "premise of this book"—were produced by eighteenth-century "sensationalist psychology" (1), and these discussions of Blake are here presented in a new context. Besides Milton, Cooper examines Byron's Don Juan, Coleridge's Christabel, and Shelley's Alastor— for yoking together these texts which might "seem an exceedingly diverse group" (6), Cooper gives the following reasons. First, he finds these narrative poems united in the "common assumption ... not that physical experience is always exhilarating but that alienation from one's body ... and also from the realm of the bodily and from the processes of embodiment in general is always damaging" (2); second, the poems "actually dramatize the process of representation by which their epistemological crisis is brought before the reader" (3); third, the "technique of repeating subnarratives" in the four poems "elicits a mounting awareness of the poem's textuality which then works to counter the escapist tendencies of the Romantic imagination" (4), and, he says, his study was prompted by "the perception that Milton, Christabel, and Alastor do not make narrative sense if approached any other way" than that provided by "reader-response theory" (5). See also the subsequent entry.]

56. Cooper, Andrew M. "Irony as Self-Concealment in The Marriage of Heaven and Hell." A/B: Auto/Biography Studies 2.4 (1986-1987): 33-44. [Presents an outline of various concepts of romantic irony from Schlegel through Mellor, discusses the relation between Blake as author and the voice of the devil in the Marriage, and poses the following problem: "... if Prolific and Devouring are not only portions
of the universal mind but actual classes of people opposed as 'separate' and irreconcilable 'enemies' (E 40), then how is humanity to be redeemed? If the Devouring are to be considered weak innately and immutably, then isn't the author succumbing to the same predestinarianism he condemns accepting drastic constraints on his prophetic role? (42-43). Maintains, in conclusion, that "the irony in the author's recent book, for which see the preceding entry."]


58. Davies, J.M.Q. "Attempting to be More than Man we Become Less": Blake's Comus Designs and the Two Faces of Milton's Puritanism." Durham University Journal ns 50 (1988-1989): 197-219. [The author compares the two sets of water color illustrations at Boston and San Marino which are—very helpfully—reproduced side by side; he comments on Blake's revisions in the later series and interprets these as an attempt to visually "cast out the errors of Milton and the Puritan tradition" (219). See also Davies's earlier study of the Paradise Regained water colors in Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly 17 (1983-1984): 65, #55, and #150, below.]


61. *Eagle, Solomon. "Blake and His Myths." Books in General. 2nd ser. London: Secker, 1920. Darby, PA: Darby Books, 1983. 68-74. $25.00 cloth. [According to information provided by Robert Essick, this seems to be a reissue of the original 1920 sheets in a new binding rather than a reprint of the original edition. Since I cannot find an entry for the 1920 edition in Bentley's Blake Books, and since the volume is listed with the 1983 date in Books in Print, the inclusion of this title in the present checklist may be justified.]


63. Eaves, Morris. "Inquiry into the Real and Imaginary Obstructions to the Acquisition of the Arts in England: The Comedy of the English School of Painting." Huntington Library Quarterly 52 (1989): 125-38. [Concerned with Blake and Barry, this article records what—to the present writer—was the most original and intellectually challenging contribution to Blake studies made during the 1988 Huntington conference. See also #44, above.]


65. Essick, Robert N. "A Copy of William Blake's Songs of Innocence and of Experience." Christie's International Magazine 5.8 (1988): 22-23. [An account of copy BB, occasioned by its being offered for sale at New York in Christie's auction of "Modern and Contemporary Prints and Illustrated Books" on 1-2 Nov. 1988. The text has been severely, though not expertly, copyedited and now unfortunately does not quite stand as submitted by the author; two of the monochrome plates are reproduced in color.]

66. Essick, Robert N. "Dating Blake's 'Enoch' Lithograph Once Again." Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly 22 (1988-1989): 71-73. [Does the publication of the first complete English translation of the Ethiopic Book of Enoch in 1821 supply a date post quem for Blake's only known lithographic print as has been suggested by John Gage? The author does not think so and brings forward new arguments to back up his own earlier suggestion for a date of c. 1806-1807.]


68. Essick, Robert N. William Blake and the Language of Adam. Oxford, Oxon.: Clarendon P, 1989. $55.00 cloth. [During the past two decades or so, the author has certainly revolutionized both our factual knowledge of Blake's printmaking processes and of their hermeneutical implications for the interpretation of his graphic works. With the present study, Essick (re)turns to the printer-poet's other medium, language;
there, he “situate[s] Blake within the history of language theory” and “generate[s] a hermeneutic on the basis of that history” (2). In this sense, then, his “book is an attempt to complete the circle of influence by returning to Blake’s writings and bringing to the study of their language a perspective informed by what we have learned from the study of his graphics and the media-consciousness they have raised” (1). In the first chapter (6-27) four of Blake’s tempera paintings are employed to reconstruct “several types of signs, both fallen and ideal” (3), which were used by Blake the artist to comment on the phenomena of language and its history. The second chapter (28-103) presents a detailed history of “the ideal of a motivated sign as the origin and telos of language” (3).

A third chapter (104-59) is concerned with “Blake’s use [and later rejection] of natural signs, primarily in his earlier poetry” (3). Blake’s literary “production practices” and “the relationship of language ideal to language performance as symbiosis rather than disjunction” (3-4) are the subject of the book’s fourth chapter (160-94). The final chapter (195-236) discusses “Blake’s imagining of a post-apocalyptic language,” replacing “transcendence with incarnation, sublimation with immanence, and questions about how far even an ideal language can become a transparent medium of something other than itself with questions about how far that other is a reified projection of the medium” (4-5).

69. Essick, Robert N. “William Blake’s ‘The Death of Hector.’” *Studies in Romanticism* 27 (1988): 97-107. [Comments upon the provenance, the style and dating, the “compositional heritage” (104), the iconographical identification, and the ideological background of Blake’s treatment of Homer’s subject in a drawing which hitherto had been known as “Jephthah Met by His Daughter” (see Butlin 1981, #451).]

70. Essick, Robert N. “William Blake’s ‘The Phoenix’: A Problem in Attribution.” *Philological Quarterly* 67 (1988): 365-81. [The essay offers a meticulously detailed investigation in the provenance and the physical properties of the manuscript, the visual and verbal parallels of its imagery in Blake’s works (particularly of the late 1780s and 1790s), and a discussion of the technique of drawing and lettering used to create the manuscript as well as of its probable date of execution. This is followed by a critique of Keynes’s “methodology of attribution/interpretation” (378), a statement on the manuscript poem’s authenticity, and some more general considerations concerning the procedures of attribution. “The case for attributing ‘The Phoenix’ to Blake as its author, calligrapher, and illustrator is very solid.... The crucial pieces of evidence are those which it would be most difficult for a forger to manufacture: the techniques used to execute the manuscript and its history of ownership. The conclusion drawn from these primary arguments is buttressed by the manuscript's more easily imitable pictorial and verbal structures, ... ‘The Phoenix’ should be included in the canon of Blake’s poetry. The illuminated manuscript, a unique companion to Blake’s printed illuminated books, should be added to the catalogue of his watercolor drawings” (376). Reproduces the manuscript for the first time.]

71. Fletcher, John. “Poetry, Gender and Primal Fantasy.” *Formations of Fantasy.* Ed. Victor Burgin, James Donald, and Cora Kaplan. London: Methuen, 1986. 109-41. [“This essay is an attempt at reading three poems, Blake’s ‘I saw a chapel all of gold,’ Elizabeth Barrett Browning’s ‘A Musical Instrument,’ and Emily Dickinson’s ‘I started early took my dog,’ in order to disclose the way they work and rework fantasies that bear on sexual difference and desire” (109). The section on “Blake and the Oedipal im-
passé” appears on 120-26; it is placed in the context of gender on 138-40.

72. Frieling, Barbara. “Blake at the Rim of the World: A Jungian Consideration of Jerusalem.” Journal of Evolutionary Psychology 8 (1987): 211-18. [The poem “represented to Blake what a Jungian would describe as the emergence of the archetype of the Self. This Fourfold process Jung terms individuation—a collapse of energy, a confrontation with the Shadow, the discovery of the Anima, and the establishment of the Ego-Self axis—has been accomplished for Albion” (216).]

73. Fuller, David. “Blake and Dante.” Art History 11 (1988): 349-73. [Convincingly demonstrates how Blake’s water color series can be seen as a direct visual commentary on Dante’s epic poem, the understanding of which is not dependent on the viewer’s intimacy with Blake’s, but with Dante’s writings. Fuller thus criticizes and corrects many of Roe’s idiosyncratic “symbolical” interpretations.]

74. Garber, Frederick. “Intertext and Metatext in Blake’s Illustrations to Thornton’s Virgil.” Centennial Review 32 (1988): 163-94. [Since the author obviously is unaware of “the criticism of Blake” published after the year 1978, he maintains that the Virgil wood engravings have received no more than “tangential” treatment in previous Blake scholarship (see 163n1). While therefore reduplicating a lot of what has been said before by such authors as Wilton and Essick, Garber’s essay still has a number of important points to raise. This is especially true as regards Phillips’ text and the peculiar problems encountered by Blake when commissioned to illustrate it, a subject which, indeed, has not previously been at the center of an interpretation of this series of designs. See also #160, below.]

75. Gardner, Stanley. Some Notes on Blake’s Songs of Innocence and of Experience. n.p. (Colchester, Ess.): U of Essex, 1988. [A short pamphlet “written to accompany an exhibition, held at the University of Essex in May 1987, of colour photographs [enlarged to twice the size of the originals] reproducing all 54 plates of copy Z” (1). The text, a plate-by-plate commentary, is based on the same author’s “retracing” of the historical contexts of the Songs. See Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly 21 (1987-1988): 56, #47. Readers who are interested in staging the exhibition at their own institution should write for further information to Dr. Peter Vergo, Dept. of Art History and Theory, U of Essex, Wivenhoe Park, Colchester, Ess. CO4 35Q, England.]


77. Ginsberg, Allen. Your Reason and Blake’s System. Hanuman Books 24. Madras, India: Hanuman Books, 1988. $4.95 paper. [Not a poem by the poet, but his critical insights and some practical down-to-earth advice for readers, first offered as a “Discourse on Urizen, Naropa Institute, Boulder, Colorado” in Apr. 1978 and now “Transcribed and Edited” by Terry Pollack, and then revised by the author in Feb. 1988 (43). “Blake’s books are useful now as explorations of the same problems we have, somewhat related to the revolutionary fervor of the Sixties in America and a subsequent so-called ‘disillusionment.’ So actually Blake is up to date in the psychology of wrath vs. pity, compassion vs. anger, that runs through all of his work and is visible for our own decade as well as his” (9-10). “If you read Blake’s prophetic books naturally check out his pictures. We get a lot of intelligence out of Blake’s own illustrations of his ideas. We can decipher his mind, visually” (38-39). “Urizen is one of Blake’s really hard, tough, mental, dry-seed works—the poetry is terrific. Thereafter Blake unfolds his primordial mind and becomes mighty, rhetorically beautiful, golden tongued and syllabically interesting. Vowels become roarers and exquisite philosophic rhapsodies are introduced, that later turn visionary in Milton and throughout Jerusalem. Blake was astonished by his own imagination” (40-41). Printed—in a miniature format and complete with out-of-register color reproductions from Urizen—in India, but also available from the publishers’ New York office (P.O. Box 1070, Old Chelsea Station, New York, NY 10113).]

78. Gleckner, Robert F., and Mark L. Greenberg, eds. Approaches to Teaching Blake’s Songs of Innocence and of Experience. Approaches to Teaching World Literature 21. New York, NY: Modern Language Association of America, 1989. $32.00 cloth/$17.50 paper. [Besides an introductory report on “Materials” for the teaching of Blake’s Songs by the editors, Mary Lynn Johnson, John E. Grant, and Brian Wilkie (3-35), no less than 16 well-known Blake scholars have contributed brief sketches (ranging from three to at most 10 pages each) of their basic approach to teaching the Songs to a variety of student audiences. Donald Ault unreads “London” (132-36), Stephen Cox takes “Risks in Teaching Songs” (88-92), Robert N. Essick teaches “Variations in Songs” (93-98), Thomas R. Frosch addresses “The Borderline of Innocence and Ex-
perience" in his classes (74-79), Philip J. Gallagher discusses the Songs in the context of biblical imagery (104-108). Wallace Jackson is concerned with "The Grounding of the Songs" (109-14) in earlier eighteenth-century poetry, Mary Lynn Johnson introduces "Feminist Approaches to Teaching Songs" (57-66), Jenijoy La Belle presents "the main features of [her] method of introducing the Songs to the young scientists at Caltech" (84-87), W. J. T. Mitchell approaches "Image and Text in Songs" (42-46), Harold Pagliaro supplies an outline for introducing students to "Blake's Psychology of Redemption" (120-26), David Simpson writes on "Teaching Ideology in Songs" (47-56), Leslie Tannenbaum demonstrates how to teach the "Biblical Contexts of Songs" (99-103), Irene Tayler informs her readers about how Blake is doing at MIT (80-83), Joseph Viscomi offers a course of "Reading, Drawing, Seeing Illuminated Books" (67-73), Thomas A. Vogler offers a "Hearing [of] the Songs" in Blake's Songs (127-31), and Brian Wilkie discusses the "Classroom Implications" of the "Point-of-View Approach to Songs" (115-19). Amongst these riches there, should be something for everyone who teaches Blake's lyric poetry, especially so if readers are willing to share the editors' "delight in imagining fruitful class discussions emanating from significant disagreements with approaches offered here" (x). For closely related articles see #118 and 171, below.

79. Gourlay, Alexander S. "What Was Blake's Chaucer?" Studies in Bibliography 42 (1989): 272-83. [Identifies the edition used by Blake while composing the Descriptive Catalogue with the London 1687 impression of Thomas Speght's edition of The Works of Our Ancient, Learned, and Excellent English Poet, Jeffrey Chaucer. The author's argument is based on a close "analysis of [Blake's] word choice, word order, and spelling in the Chaucer quotations" (272). A "systematic comparison of Blake's modernized text and the source texts available to him suggests that he could not possibly have derived his quotations from either the Urry or Tyrwhitt texts, and that the 1687 Speght edition is much more likely than the 1602 or any other to have been the source behind the Descriptive Catalogue" (273).]

80. Greco, Norma A. "Blake's 'Laughing Song': A Reading." Concerning Poetry 19 (1986): 67-72. [Concentrating on the poem's third stanza and the mention of "painted birds" and "shade," the article proposes "that 'Laughing Song' is not only ... an intriguing display of the hermeneutics of Blake's visual-verbal discourse, but also a provocative and important comment on the limitations of innocence and artistic creation in a fallen world" (69). The essential message of all the "Ha, Ha, He" chanting is said to be "that there is no escaping the determinants of temporality and materiality, even through art" (72).]

81. Griffin, Paul F. "Misinterpreting the City in Blake's 'London.'" CEA Critic 48.4/49.1 (1986): 114-24. ["In 'London,' Blake implies very forcefully that the reaction to the city which the speaker [of the poem] has is an incorrect one and shows us that the persona of 'London' in describing the plight of the harlot in the poem's last stanza is himself operating with a very limited and restrictive perspective. ... In examining this subtle critical message in the last two stanzas of the poem and in turning to other crucial passages in Blake's work these lines suggest, we can begin to understand the complex reaction to modern, urban existence underlying the more obvious social criticisms which Blake is making in the poem" (114). This interpretation forms part of a special Milton and Blake issue of the CEA Critic; see also #33, 41, above, and 171, below, as well as Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly 22 (1988-1989): 47, #96.]


83. Guth, Deborah. "Innocence Re-called: The Implied Reader in Blake's Songs of Innocence." Colby Library Quarterly 25 (1989): 4-11. [Approaching Innocence from the perspective supplied by reader-response theory, this article seeks to answer the following two questions: "if the purpose of these poems is to portray the world of Innocence, why the persistent absence of elements from the world of Ex-
perience? What is their function in these poems? And secondly, in the light of this, who is actually the implied reader of the Songs? (4-5). The author concludes that "Blake is implying that only the world of tears and knowledge, the 'fallen' inner world of adult awareness, can truly conceive of and eternalize Innocence, the child of its mind and its redeemer" (10).

84. Hall, Mary. Materialism and the Myths of Blake. Garland Publications in American and English Literature. New York, NY: Garland, 1988. $50.00 cloth. [As is stated in the 1988 postscript to the introduction, "this study was completed more than twenty years ago," and the author appears to be aware of the fact that since 1967 "much has happened in Blake scholarship that has augmented [her] perspective or offered new insights. But [?] given the context in which this is being published (probably the 'context' of the Garland series; DWD) it seems inappropriate to include new material or to change to more inclusive language."

In consequence of such lucid reasoning, Mary Starritt Hall decided to simply leave "this study in the form in which it was submitted to the English faculty of Princeton in 1967" as her doctoral thesis (6; see Bentley, Blake Books, 1977, #1775). What readers ought to expect then is a brand new contribution to late 60's Blake scholarship. Chapter 1 studies Blake's sources and acquaintances in order to supply an outline of his critique of society and its current ideology in An Island in the Moon (7-43); form and content of Tiriel, "Blake's tragedy" (69), again with extensive references to the possible sources of the author's thinking (such as Bryant's Analysis), are the subject of the second chapter (44-75); next comes an investigation into "different aspects of The Human Illusion" (76) that Hall finds represented in Urizen, Ahanta and The Book of Los, where Blake is said to have drawn critically on such authors as Monboddo and (the constantly misspelled) "Priestly" (76-120); "a night by night analysis" (121) of The Four Zoas follows in chapter 4 (121-92); with an exposition of the "direct and consistent attack on materialism" (235) in Milton in the concluding chapter (193-235) "this study has come full circle" (193). While there is reason to doubt that the author has actually seen and used all the titles listed in her impressive bibliography (236-60), she has certainly brought a wealth of reading in both primary and secondary literature to her task. It is as a compendium of Blake's possible sources in contemporary literature (mostly natural philosophy) that this otherwise unattractive reproduction of a dated thesis may still be useful.


88. Heppner, Christopher. "Blake as Humpty Dumpty: The Verbal Specification of Visual Meaning," Word and Visual Imagination. Erlanger Forschungen, ser. A: Geisteswissenschaften 43. Erlangen, W. Ger.: Universitätsbibliothek Erlangen-Nürnberg, 1988. 223-40. [Studies the visual meaning of the prints "Our End Is Come" (224-28), "Joseph of Arimathea among the Rocks of Albion" (228-30), and two of the plates from The Gates of Paradise (230-34) in the light of the verbal specification that Blake supplied by the various titles and inscriptions which he assigned to these designs in different states. Heppner argues that "with the years Blake felt a stronger urge to specify meanings verbally, rather than allow visual images simply to mean in their own way and within their own limits of explicitness. ... Blake felt free to redefine the sense of his images, to activate relational structures potential or implicit in them, but undeveloped by the titles or texts first associated with them" (229-30). The article presents the challenging conclusion that "Blake did not understand his designs to be univocal containers of explicit meaning, but rather generators of a semantic energy which could be further defined and directed by titles and texts. ... There are two possible explanations of what happened, both probably true. One is that Blake in practice lost a degree of faith in the communicative power of his designs, perhaps as a result of experiencing the incomprehension of viewers. ... The other explanation is that the texts which Blake in his later career associates with his designs should be treated as a kind of interpretive game, which he plays in conjunction with the viewer" (234-35). In addition, however, it might be argued that over the years and in the medium of language Blake similarly felt free to define and redefine the meaning of specific elements and characters of his myth, just as he changed or specified the meaning of some of his visual motifs.]]


to a summary supplied by the author, this Ph.D. thesis examines "text in which females carry out the roles of daughter, sister, wife, mother, whore, servant, and contrasts Blake's narrative action with expectations of his day for similar roles."

93. *Iliopoulos, Spyros. William Blake. Athens, Gr.: Plethron, 1985. [A monograph of 160 pages which, to the best of my knowledge, must be the first modern introduction to Blake that has been presented to the heirs of that state "in which all Visionary Men are accounted Mad Men" (Erdman, Complete Poetry and Prose 274).]

94. Imaiizumi, Yoko. "[Psychic Operations Symbolized by the Female in Blake's Jerusalem." Studies in English Literature [Tokyo, Jap.] 63 (1986): 241-56. [In Japanese; see Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly 21 (1987-1988): 58, #64, for the author's dissertation, which closes with a chapter on "the labor of brotherhood on the female side in Jerusalem" and thus probably supplied the basis for the present study or is summarized therein.]


96. Johnson, Mary Lynn. "Human Consciousness and the Divine Image in Blake's Watercolor Designs for the Bible: Genesis Through Psalms." The Cast of Consciousness: Concepts of the Mind in British and American Romanticism. Ed. Beverly Taylor and Robert Bain. Contributions to the Study of World Literature 24. New York, NY: Greenwood P, 1987. 20-43. [Argues that for Butts "as collector" form and content were not of equal importance when acquiring Blake's water color paintings; for him, "the main consideration would probably have been the unfolding meaning of the series as a biblical sequence" (21). While I am not entirely convinced that this is what can safely be assumed with respect to an eighteenth- or nineteenth-century collector, in consequence the author approaches the designs iconographically as "a biblical commentary in pictorial form," and demonstrates how they "bring out a pattern of loss and recovery familiar to readers of Blake's poetry: Humankind loses the divine vision; man and woman fall into estrangement; in the fullness of time, they awaken to a sense of shared identity with the 'Divine Humanity,' whom they come to recognize as an inward presence. Repeated motifs, especially the recurring depictions of human encounters with the divine, help to unify the series and order the illustrations as a visionary sequence" (20). Therefore, the article concentrates on Blake's typological interpretation of Old Testament passages. There is to be a sequel to the present study which presumably will treat the New Testament subjects in the series commissioned by Butts.]


103. Lamb, Jonathan. "Research Reports, VII—Job, Epitaphs, and Blake's Illustrations." Clark Newsletter: Bulletin of the UCLA Center for 17th- and 18th-Century Studies 16 (1989): 4-7. [Begin by explaining that all "stages in the privatization of the language of public instruction are marked by interpretations and imitations of Job" (4), then shows how Blake in his illustrations to the Book of Job responds "to the work he did on two poems—Night Thoughts and Elegy Written on a Country Churchyard—which are emblematically representative of the two sides of the debate" concerning the "critical response to Job" in eighteenth-century "literature of instruction" (5), and finally applies such contextualization to a reading of the seventh and the eleventh plates of Blake's series of engravings.]


Winter 1989/90

BLAKE/AN ILLUSTRATED QUARTERLY

135

1988): 1776A. U of Tennessee. ["This study investigates the roles which women play in Coleridge's and Keats's, and to a lesser extent Blake's and Shelley's, apocalyptic myths in relation to Spenser's and Revelation's..."


110. Lindsay, David W. Blake: Songs of Innocence and Experience. Critics Debate. Atlantic Highlands, NJ: Humanities P; London: Macmillan, 1989. $29.95 (£25.00) cloth/$8.50 (£4.95) paper. [Following an "Introduction" (11-15) which gives a brief general account of "how a Blakean engraved book was created" (10), the first part of the book surveys previous editorial and interpretative scholarship (17-56). The author then presents a series of his own close readings of eight of the poems in the second part of the book (57-84). These attempt to demonstrate that the particular meanings of the poems which have been perceived by Lindsay's predecessors and "which at first seem incompatible often prove on closer examination to be complementary" (57). Among the 57 critics engaged in the debate as it is here mapped by the author, Damon, Erdman, Frye, Gardiner, Gillham, Glen, Hirsch, Keynes, Leader, Raine, and Wicksteed figure most prominently. Despite many omissions and the author's failure to give an adequate picture of the varying interests which shaped the historical process of interpreting and reinterpreting Blake's poetry, Lindsay's attempt to draw together some of the major or "representative" strands of criticism concerned with the Songs may nevertheless offer a welcome aid to future research. The sparse bibliographic "References" (85-88) list no more than seven articles on the Songs that have been published in scholarly journals, they quote some outdated editions, and while he is perfectly aware of the radical differences between early and late copies of the book (see 13-14), Lindsay makes mention of only one facsimile reproduction of the Songs. Taking up less than 75 pages, his encouragement to participate "as the critics debate" (9) certainly is anything but long-winded. The ardent fervor to condense the "Survey" of the critical debate and the "Appraisal" of Blake's poetry as much as possible may have to be attributed to the format of the series rather than to the author's own decision. In effect, however, it may have been responsible not just for the use of an incomplete title for the Songs of Innocence and of Experience throughout the few pages of this extravagantly priced pamphlet, but for more serious limitations in the argument and its documentation as well."

111. Lindsay, David W. "The Order of Blake's Large Color Prints." Huntington Library Quarterly 52 (1989): 19-41. [See also #44, above."

112. Lindsay, David W., and M. A. L. Locherbie-Cameron. "Maldon in Blake's Jerusalem." Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly 22 (1988-1989): 136-39. ["In the writings of Philip Morant... Blake could have found the name of Maldon associated with druidism, oak forests, stone circles, imperial tyranny, the Roman war-god, a busy harbour, the death of Byrthnoth, and a cross on a hill" (138). Demonstrates how "the little port on the Essex coast" might have assumed in the poet's mind "a range of associations which made it a symbol of manifold significance" (139).]
113. Lundeen, Kathleen. “Urizen’s Quaking Word.” Colby Library Quarterly 25 (1989): 12-27. [An analysis of the “contrapuntal discourse” between image and text in The Book of Urizen serves to buttress the author’s argument that “this is a poem about the fall of language.” Urizen may be seen to represent and figure the conflicts of language itself—if only “we take the figures on the plates as linguistic rather than human or mythological” (12). It may be interesting, then, to read this article side by side with the interpretation of Urizen on 140-59 of Essick’s recent book, listed as #68, above.]


115. Mann, Paul. “Editing TheFour Zoas.” Pacific Coast Philology 16 (1981): 49-56. [This essay—which should have been listed almost a decade ago—is concerned with some basic methodological problems involved with the editing of Blake’s texts; the author has since enlarged upon his subject in the Santa Cruz Blake Study Group’s 1984 review of Erdman’s edition of The Complete Poetry and Prose of William Blake; see Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly 20 (1986-1987): 95, #396(1).]


117. McArthur, Murray. Stolen Writings: Blake’s Milton, Joyce’s Ulysses, and the Nature of Influence. Studies in Modern Literature 87. Ann Arbor, MI: UMI Research P, 1988. $44.95 cloth. [The book begins with “A Theory of Influence” (1-11), which discusses “two seemingly problematic pairings: William Blake and James Joyce, Milton and Ulysses” (1), and in which a “self-consciousness about writing and the corrective stealing back of writing is the basis of [the author’s] conception of influence” (9). McArthur then studies Milton (13-46) and investigates the Blake-Joyce “Case of Influence” (47-64). “The evidence demonstrates that on both a personal and an historical level Joyce felt a deep sense of kinship for the poet who seemed so different from him. This kinship reveals itself in a set of figures related to time, space, and the muse in both her domestic and social aspects that Joyce borrowed from Milton for [a] 1902 essay ... and that he reused later in crucial passages in both A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man and Ulysses. ... Joyce was especially struck by Blake’s analysis of the artistic dilemma of a writer situated within domestic cycles of estrangement and reconciliation and historical cycles of imperialism and revolution” (2). In studying the two texts that, on account of “massive differences” in stylistic structure and content, at first appear to be “polar opposites” (1), McArthur stresses “a series of remarkable parallels ... Each title indicates a relation to an epic poet and a specific epic, Paradise Lost and the Odyssey, that they will interrogate, take apart, and put back together again” (2). The author subsequently applies his findings of structural similarities in Milton and Ulysses to an interpretation of Joyce’s writing procedures, concentrating on four chapters of Joyce’s work (65-146). This book is the published version of McArthur’s thesis, which has been listed previously in Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly 21 (1987-1988): 59, #84.]
poet's contribution to the history of ideas about heaven.]  

120. McGann, Jerome J. "Blake and the Aesthetics of Deliberate Engagement"; and "The Idea of an Indeterminate Text: Blake's Bible of Hell and Dr. Alexander Geddes." Social Values and Poetic Acts: The Historical Judgment of Literary Work. Cambridge, MA: Harvard UP, 1988. 32-49 and 152-72. $32.95 cloth. [The second of the two Blake chapters in McGann's most recent monograph is a reprint of an essay which has been listed previously in Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly 21 (1987-1988): 59, #87. Together with the Blake section in part 1 on "The Historical Work of Imagination" it is here incorporated in a sequel to McGann's earlier Romantic Ideology. Both publications are part of a project to "sketch a theory of historical method for Euro-American literary studies which would be grounded in the practice of a critical hermeneutics." In this context, the present publication "argues the critical relevance of the 'canonical' literary archive for a radical and non-canonical approach to literary studies" (vii). McGann discusses Blake's Marriage of Heaven and Hell and The Book of Urizen in such historical contexts as supplied by Kant's Critique of Judgment, Geddes's biblical scholarship, and Coleridge's Biographia Literaria in an attempt to show "that poetic discourse has other obligations than to speak for the orders of the state, however liberal and pluralistic those orders may be; indeed, to argue that poetic discourse, perhaps more than any other of the human sciences, has special resources for carrying out this critical and antithetical role, a role which is ... now sorely needed" (viii). McGann also draws the reader's attention to "Blake's centrality to this book ... Blake's historical position, in particular the antithesis to the line of Kant which his theory and practice represented, is a constant focus of attention. Blake's work—its major themes, forms, and polemics—has thus had a significant directorial effect on the way I managed my materials" (ix). Therefore, one will also find numerous references to Blake scattered throughout those pages of the present study which are not part of the two Blake chapters themselves.]  

121. Meister, Barbara. "The Interaction of Music and Poetry: A Study of the Poems of Paul Verlaine as Set to Music by Claude Debussy and of the Song Cycle Songs and Proverbs of William Blake by Benjamin Britten." Dissertation Abstracts International 48 (1987-1988): 3105A. City U of New York. ["Through detailed descriptions and analyses of the music and texts of ... the song cycle constructed by Benjamin Britten of selections from Songs of Experience, Proverbs of Hell and Auguries of Innocence by Blake, I hope to have demonstrated the composer[s] use of gestural analogues to complement, define and enhance the poetry, thereby creating music which serves as surrounding matrix, extension and interpretation of the original literary material."]  


123. Mellor, Anne K. "Blake's Songs of Innocence and of Experience: A Feminist Perspective." Nineteenth Century Studies 2 (1988): 1-17. [Starting off with a brief introduction to "two distinct modes of feminist literary criticism" (1), their theories (such as "gynocriticism"), their politics, and their results for the act of reading, Mellor advances six questions which are provoked by "raising the issue of gender in relation to Blake's Songs" (4). In answering these questions the author finds that although "some Blake scholars have recently hailed this poet and painter as an early advocate of women's rights, such advocacy seems in the light of recent feminist theory to be ungrounded" (14).]  

124. Mellor, Anne K. "A Symposium on William Blake and His Circle." Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly 22 (1988-1989): 29-30. [Reports on the papers read at the conference which—in conjunction with the exhibition of works from the Essick collection—was organized by the U of California, the California Institute of Technology, and the Huntington Art Gallery in Jan. 1988; see also Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly 22 (1988-1989): 40, 45, 51 and 62, #18, 63, 125 and 295, as well as #43, 44, 59, 63, 111, 168, 190, and 400(3) in the present checklist.]  


126. Moskal, Jeanne. "Forgiveness, Love, and Pride in Blake's The Everlasting Gospel." Religion and Literature 20.2 (1988): 19-39. [Sees "the thematic links among the sections" of The Everlasting Gospel as clustering "around forgiveness ... [as the poem's] central idea" (22) and supplies a contextualized map of the meaning of the three concepts named in the title.]
fits the movie, *Chariots of Fire*, for the film is as much about private vision, about 'mental fight,' as about Olympic running" (230). The author disagrees "with those who have found *Chariots of Fire* bland, saccharine, or sentimental. But it is *innocent* of that corrosive liberal tendency to cede any idealism about athletics, religion, or national pride to conservative or reactionary forces" (231).


135. Pierce, John Benjamin. "Blake's Writing of *Vala* or *The Four Zoas*: A Study of Textual Development." *Dissertation Abstracts International* 48 (1987-1988): 2881A. U. of Toronto. ["Bentley and Erdman have supplied detailed bibliographical accounts of the manuscript, but no one has yet given a satisfactory theoretical account of the steps in Blake's composition and transcription of the manuscript. From the bibliographical facts, I attempt a theoretical discussion of the development of narrative, theme and image in the manuscript." See also #23, above, and the subsequent entry as well as #146, below.]

136. Pierce, John Benjamin. "The Shifting Characterization of Tharmas and Enion in Pages 3-7 of Blake's *Vala* or *The Four Zoas*." *Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly* 22 (1988-1989): 93-102. [See also the preceding entry.]

137. Piquet, François. "Blake et ses monstres." *Visages de l'angoisse*. Ed. Christian La Cassagnère. Publications de la Faculté des Lettres et Sciences Humaines de l'Université Blaise-Pascal 29, Clermont-Ferrand, Fr.: U de Clermont-Ferrand II, 1989. 141-63. [The frightening visionary imagery in Blake's *Urzien* and other illuminated books and his apocalyptic beasts are studied by the author to show that "le monstre blakien se manifeste comme une négation des négations" (160). Blake's monsters "sont à eux-mêmes leur propre exorcisme." And yet, "en projetant l'hyperbole du monstre, l'imagination aiguise en secret les armes qui le terrasseront" (161).]

138. Piquet, François. "Retranscriptions romantiques d'un voyage au bout de la nuit: Fuseli et Blake illustreurs de *Macbeth*." *Polysèmes* 1 (1989): 13-37. [The author examines the differing approaches represented by Blake's reading of Shakespeare's play "qui le déchiffre au travers d'une grille procurée par une mythologie privée" and by Fuseli's "retranscription picturale qui explore le non-dit du texte." Moreover, and especially when working on his "Pity" and "Hecate" color prints, Blake is said to have read *Macbeth* "de manière analogique et homologique, et il en dégage des types et des situations éternels" (34). Since Barthes' distinction between two types of intertextuality supplies the author with his criteria for judging the quality of works of art, Blake's nonillustative use of fragments from Shakespeare's text comes off as "infinement plus riche" (14) than Fuseli's artistic..."
strategy, which aims at an illustrative "retranscription" of the most fruitful moment of a particular scene in Shakespeare's play.]


141. Raine, Kathleen. "Blake's Eye of the Imagination." Harvest: Journal for Jungian Studies 30 (1984): 37-47. [Describes Blake's concept of the imagination as opposed to "sense-perception" (42), and discusses his position in the history and the future of "a mechanized science" (41) on one hand, and "the perennial philosophy" (38) on the other. Also contains a general account of the author's view that "essentially Blake and Jung were exploring the same tradition," and of her personal experience of having been brought "into conflict... with the orthodoxy of the Universities both in this country [i.e., Great Britain] and in the United States, irremovably established on positivist premises" (38), on premises, that is, with which she believes, not just Blake's thought itself, but also its interpretation is absolutely incompatible.]


143. Read, Dennis M. "The Rival Canterbury Pilgrims of Blake and Cromek: Herculean Figures in the Carpet." Modern Philology 86 (1988-1989): 171-90. [The author, having laid the foundation in a series of previous articles on Cromek, convincingly rehabilitates the publisher of Blake's Blair designs and establishes that because "there is no evidence that Blake was working on his own Canterbury Pilgrims before this time [i.e., May 1807], it seems very likely that Cromek's taunt to Blake to paint a better Canterbury Pilgrims than Stothard's is the genesis for Blake's rival project" (175). The article contains a detailed account of the documentary evidence concerning the quarrel between Blake and Cromek (some of it new and hitherto unpublished). It also describes Cromek's successful canvassing for subscriptions for the print after Stothard's painting, his advertisements and exhibitions of the painting, and his promotional tours of the provinces between 1807 and 1809. In addition, Read suggests that in Milton Blake's Satan ought to be identified with Cromek (see 183), and that the Miller and the Plowman in Blake's Chaucerian design contain cryptic portraits of Cromek and Blake himself (see 180-81) that serve as a visual analogue to "Blake's foremost purpose for painting and exhibiting his Canterbury Pilgrims," which according to Read was "to expose the ways he [i.e., Blake], had been personally exploited and abused by Cromek" (182). Read's demonstration "that the idea to paint an illustration of the Canterbury pilgrims and make an engraving of the painting originated with Cromek, not Blake" thus arrives at much the same conclusions as those of Aileen Ward's study which was published almost simultaneously (see #167, below). The arguments countering Blake's own charges against Cromek which are supplied in both of these essays mutually supplement and corroborate each other; taken together I feel they succeed in rewriting a particularly important chapter in Blake's biography.]


145. Reif, Rita. "Blake by Blake." New York Times 28 Oct. 1988, natl. ed.: 18/C30L [Under this well-coined title the column reports on Songs, copy BB, then (i.e., on 1 Nov.) to be auctioned at Christie's. See also #35 and 65, above.]

146. Rosso, George Anthony, Jr. "Blake's Prophetic Workshop: Narrative, History, Apocalypse in The Four Zoas." Dissertation Abstracts International 48 (1987-1988): 2069A. U of Maryland, College Park. ["The dissertation examines the formal and social dimensions of ... The Four Zoas, an 'unfinished' poem that functions as the workshop where Blake forges his mature prophetic vision. The poem and its allusive narrative texture place special demands on the reader, which I attempt to meet by approaching it from a variety of critical positions. This pluralist approach, however, serves a fundamentally historical perspective that places The Four Zoas in the tradition of English poetic prophecy, with its vision of personal and societal transformation."]


150. Simons, Louise. "And Heaven Gates Ore My Head": Death as Threshold in Milton's Masque." *Milton Studies* 23 (1987): 53-96. [Comments on Blake's *Comus* designs (see 69-71, 76-78, and 83-86) as exteriorizing the "eschatalogical perception of evil" (88) that are to be found in the text of Milton's Ludlow Mask. Both sets of Blake's water colors are reproduced.]

151. Smirnow, Dmitri. *Tiriel: Oper nach William Blake: Uraufführung*. Ed. Paul Esterhazy. Trans. Marie-Luise Bott, et al. Freiburg i. Br., W. Ger.: Freiburger Theater, 1989. [The Russian composer, whose readings in Blake have already inspired more than a dozen of his compositions, discovered that the *Tiriel* manuscript constitutes "an ideal, almost finished libretto for an opera" (6). Besides the editor's German translation of Smirnow's adaptation of Blake's text for his opera (21-36), this illustrated brochure (which was issued on the occasion of the world première of the work on 28 Jan. 1989) contains a summary of the plot of acts I-III, a chronology of Blake's life and works, Smirnow's essays on "Tiriel von William Blake und meine Oper" (6-20) and "Mein musikalischer Weg" (52-55), an unsigned "Tiriel-Lexikon" based on Damon's *Dictionary* (43-47), and a few "Anmerkungen zur Partitur" by Gerhard Markson (48-50). The score for Smirnow's opera is available from the Musikverlag Hans Sikorski, Hamburg, W. Ger.]

152. Southall, Raymond. "The Social Origins of English Romanticism." *Gulliver* 25 (1989): 125-36. [Part 1 of this short essay sums up the "Marxist" interpretation of the Industrial Revolution and its effects on eighteenth-century culture with little concern for all but the most fundamental dialectics (125-26); Marx, I feel, would not have been particularly happy with this simplified account. This is followed, in part 2, by an examination of Barry's "Progress of Human Culture" in the context of the American and French Revolutions, the machine breaking at Arkwright's Birkacre mill, and the Gordon Riots (126-28). Southall then interprets Wright of Derby's "series of eight paintings of a cottage on fire" as foreshadowing Turner's "Romantic pessimim" and as iconographically representing "a fearsome awareness of the threat posed by 'progress' to the very foundations of social order" (130). Part 3 examines Blake's revolutionary imagery, his "promethianism" of the 1790s, and his "flaming line" (131-35). The author's sole authority on Blake is Michael Davis, and he appears to be unaware of the existence of Bermingham's and Barrell's studies of the *Dark Side of the Landscape* in British eighteenth- and nineteenth-century art. Because of this lack of familiarity with some more recent factual and methodological approaches the article reads as if it had been written at least 15 years ago; even then, I am afraid, the author's endeavors would have had to be described as amateurish in the extreme.]

155. Stempel, Daniel. "Identifying Ahania: Etymology and Iconology in Blake's Nomenclature." *Studies in Romanticism* 28 (1989): 95-119. [A far-ranging study of the "precise significance" (118) of names in Blake's myth; the author employs the rules and arguments of eighteenth-century etymologists, especially of Jacob Bryant (95-101), to show that Ahania's name refers to the allegorical virtue of Charity/Charity and is related to Giotto's representation of Charity at Padua (101-12). Ahania's role in The *Four Zoas* is described as representing "divine love" (112), and Stempel then pursues this further by asking whether "the crucial distinction between Divine Reason and Divine Love can be traced in the names of the daughters of Ahania and Urizen" (116). Finally Stempel argues that Blake's etymology for Ahania reflects some of the central issues that were brought forward by the poet in his critical marginalia to Swedenborg's *Divine Love and Divine
Wisdom (118-19). See also #153, above.


159. Thines, Georges. "L'enfer de Blake et l'enfer de Faust: les voies poétiques de la métaphysique." Courrier du Centre International d'Études Poétiques 171 (1986): 3-37. [This study of the "certitude théologique" and the "aporie philosophique" (3) of the theme of hell in the myth of Faust and in Blake's Marriage takes up almost the entire issue of the Courrier for Sept.-Oct. 1986. On the cover, the title of Thines's essay is abbreviated to "Blake et Faust"; this study has now been incorporated in slightly revised form into the author's book on Le mythe de Faust et la dialectique du temps, which was published by L'Age d'Homme and which also re-uses material from his study of the imagery of hell in Blake and Rimbaud, for which see Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly 22 (1988-1989): 50, #122. In examining the relationship between author and reader and "the constructive action of the creative processes of the imagination" as described in The Marriage of Heaven and Hell, Thines is primarily concerned with "the question of duality [in Blake] because it is of direct bearing upon the elucidation of Faust's metaphysical project" (5). He arrives at the conclusion that, unlike the author of the Marriage, Faust, because "he is a stranger to the Poetical Genius ... and [because he] still believes in Reason, ... does not succeed in transcending the miraculous on the infernal roads of creation, in substituting the fugitive act of magic by the durable work of [poetic] expression" (36-37).

160. Tolley, Michael J. "Thornton's Blake Edition." University of Adelaide Library News 10.2 (1988): 4-25. [Upon studying Blake's woodcuts in their proper context, Tolley's "intuition" interestingly objects "against received opinion." This makes him argue "that Thornton expected his readers to notice the difference" between Blake's works and the prints which accompany his, and in fact, that Thornton "had pinned his enterprise on the success or failure of Blake's innovative works of printing" (5). After studying the primary sources relating to the projected edition, the author's challenging "conclusion is that, far from being embarrassed by the presence in his book of an artless unskilled worker, Thornton had gone out of his way to promote Blake in his new edition of an already successful school text" (11). Includes a commentary on each of the wood engravings, subtitled "Notes to Blake's Woodcut Illustrations to Ambrose Philips for Thornton's Virgil"; see also #74 and 105, above.]


163. Van Schaik, Pam[ela]. "The 'Divine Image' and 'Human Abstract' in a Selection of William Blake's Illustrations to Edward Young's Night Thoughts." De Arte [Pretoria, U of South Africa Sept. 1985: 4-22. [The author has "selected a dozen of Blake's designs to Night Thoughts to show how they not only amplify, and sometimes subvert, Young's ideas, but also reflect Blake's own vision of the fall and redemption of man. ... In exploring the similarities and differences between Young and Blake I shall draw on Vara, as well as other of Blake's poems, in order to convey the unity and coherence of his imaginative vision" (4). The designs discussed and reproduced for this purpose are (though not arranged in this order) NT 53, 69, 87, 142, 162, 200, 206, 209, 317, 409, 446, and 512. Van Schaik stresses "the similarities between Blake's and Young's visions, rather than their differences, as is usual in writing of the two poets, for, despite Young's orthodoxy, he offers much of what Blake would have termed pure 'Gold'" (20).]

164. Vidal, Derek J. "The 1795 Tate Gallery Prints and Blake's Poetic/Pictorial Aesthetics." Rutgers Art Review 4 (1983): 46-60. [Vidal is concerned with the "conflict that arises between Blake's [poetical] condemnation of closed forms and his rejection of the Fallen human body, ... and ... the [pictorial] glorification of the human body and his endorsement of bounding lines and forms." Finding that this "contradiction is best exemplified in Blake's Tate Gallery colorprint series of 1795" (47), Vidal returns to a "dilemma" (60) which has previously been at the center of Anne Mellor's 1974 monograph on Blake's Human Form Divine and, in fact, her contribution to the Damon festchrift of 1969.]


166. Villalobos, John C. "William Blake and Biblical Criticism." Dissertation Abstracts International 49 (1988-1989): 261A. U of Southern California. ["This tripartite study attempts to delineate how Blake drew from and
criticized [the exegetical] interpretive traditions [of the seventeenth and eighteenth century], focusing on the biblical patterns and scriptural allusions of Jerusalem. The first part of the study is an historical introduction to the theological orientation of the period. ... The second part ... is a review of Blake's comments on the deists and rationalists. ... The third part ... sets forth the larger biblical design of Jerusalem. It describes how the numerous biblical allusions are intentional and significant rather than incidental or random."

167. Ward, Aileen. "Canterbury Revisited: The Blake-Cromek Controversy." Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly 22 (1988-1989): 80-92. [The present study is the expanded version of a paper which was first read at the Yale Center for British Art in Sept. 1982 as the author's contribution to the symposium on William Blake: His Art and Times, organized by the Center on the occasion of its important Blake exhibition. Concerned with Cromek's commission for Stothard to design a painting of the Canterbury Pilgrims and Blake's rival version of the same subject, Ward's revisiting of the Blake-Cromek controversy reestablishes Cromek's reputation: "no hero" (88), yet not the creepy figure known from Blake's writings and those of most of his biographers since Gilchrist. This willingness to accept a thoroughly biased and "Blakified" version of what actually happened, based almost exclusively on the artist-poet's "own testimony" as it was "passed on to Gilchrist" (80), is here taken to pieces. Ward's careful examination of the evidence and her reconstruction of the chronology of events shows that "there seems no reason ... to doubt Cromek's word when he congratulated himself for thinking of such a glorious Subject" (83). Here, as well as in others of her conclusions, Ward's seems very close to Read's demystification of the "Cromek affair" (see #143, above, for his article on the same subject as Ward's 1982 paper which, however, was published almost simultaneously). Both scholars, however, have evidently arrived at their results quite independently and set out from different starting points. This is endorsed, for example, by their mutually exclusive readings of the hidden iconography of Blake's print: while Read believes to have detected a crypto-portrait of Cromek in the figure of the Miller, Ward feels convinced that "Cromek must have appeared to Blake as 'the Age's Knave,' the reincarnation of Chaucer's Pardoner" (88). The arguments central to both essays therefore supplement rather than duplicate each other.]

168. Ward, Aileen. "'S. Joshua and His Gang': William Blake and the Royal Academy." Huntington Library Quarterly 52 (1989): 75-95. [Interesting for challenging "received opinion" about Blake's early years and his artistic training; offers a stimulating account of Blake's hypothetical reaction towards the RA's schooling while he himself was one of the students. This, according to Ward's convincing argument, had many more facets to it than previously assumed. However, and especially in the absence of any new documentary evidence, one will have to take some of Ward's more daring conclusions as, at best, new hypotheses. For example, she is certainly correct in pointing out that it is "uncertain" how many weeks, months, or even years "Blake decided to remain in the [RA] Schools" (78). She then states that "the evidence suggests" that he spent, if not "the regular term [which] was for six years," at least a few years at the Schools. For her "evidence" she cites the relatively large number of seven designs exhibited by Blake "between 1780 and 1785, the span of his six-year term" (78) at the RA's summer exhibitions, and their qualification as "history paintings" (79). And yet, referring to the same source used by Ward for her account of the RA Schools, one will immediately be supplied with the following caveat: "The term of studentship was ... six years. ... These figures must be regarded, however, only as years of eligibility. Undoubtedly many of the students did not complete their full term but there are no details of attendances at this early date nor any record of the termination of studentships"; Sidney C. Hutchison, "The Royal Academy Schools, 1768-1830," Walpole Society 38 (1960-1962): 130. Aileen Ward may of course have strengthened her argument by reference to Raimbach's testimony; this engraver, from 1799 onwards, "sedulously pursued [his] studies at the Royal Academy for about nine years"
Memos and Recollections of the late Abraham Raimbach, Esq., Engraver, ed. M. T. S. Raimbach (London: Shoberl, 1843) 26. So much for the regularity of the six-year term. What was the rule and what the exception in the period of attendance at the academy schools during the 1780s has yet to be learned. Furthermore, I think it is necessary to ask for some hard evidence before accepting such a revision of the history of Blake's early artistic career, since this in turn would necessitate essential changes in the previous evaluation of his particular stylistic development and his achievements. No such evidence is known to me, and therefore to accept Ward's hypothesis would seem synonymous.
with assuming Blake to have been an extraordinarily lazy student: it would have taken him years to produce so few academic studies that today no more than two of these (disputable) drawings can be associated with his attendance of the life class; see Butlin, *Paintings and Drawings of William Blake*, 1981, #71-72. Here as elsewhere one's willingness to accept Ward's contextual "evidence" will determine the need to rewrite earlier accounts of Blake's life during the 1780s. Such minor criticisms aside, the two articles recorded in this and in the preceding entry—both of which seem to contain material for the author's forthcoming biography of Blake—raise high expectations for that long-awaited publication. See also #44, above.


171. Welch, Dennis M. "Romanticism and Revolution: Teaching Blake's Songs." *CEA Critic* 48.4/49.1 (1986): 108-13. ["In an introductory and interdisciplinary humanities course dealing with major themes of the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, Blake's songs provide ideal texts for examining the revolutionary spirit of Romanticism" (108). An illustrated addition (see figs. 13-18) to the collection of essays edited by Greenberg and Gleckner (see *#78* and 118, above) and part of a special Milton and Blake issue of the *CEA Critic*, see also #33, 41, and 81, above, as well as Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly 22 (1988-1989): 47, #96.]

172. Welch, Dennis M. "William Blake's 'Jesus': The Divine and the Human Reality, Incarnate in the Imaginative Acts of Self-annihilation, Forgiveness and Brotherhood." *Ultimate Reality and Meaning* 10 (1987): 101-20. [Presents an "Overview of Blake's Theology" (102-04), an introduction to his "Early Works" (105-07) and "Minor Prophecies" (107-09), then discusses Blake's idea of Jesus in *The Four Zoas* (109-12), *Milton* (112-14), and *Jerusalem* (114-17). In his conclusion Welch characterizes Blake's "belief in a personal as well as cosmic and metaphysical God, who reconciles identity and community, the particular and the universal, the many and the one" (118).]

173. Wells, David. *A Study of William Blake's Letters*. Tübingen, W. Ger.: Stauffenburg, 1987. DM 36.00 paper. [The published version of a 1986-1987 Ph.D. thesis accepted at the U of Zurich, Switz. The author offers the first critical and systematic account of Blake's letters, which are here studied in four chronologically arranged chapters (see 19). The purpose of this study is to investigate Blake's own letters and to show their considerable importance in Blake scholarship. The letters contain a wealth of information that has been extensively relied upon by critics of every persuasion, and a survey of the themes expressed in them reveals that Blake's first critic was, in fact, Blake himself" (10).]


Part II

Blake's Circle: Works of Related Interest for the Study of Blake's Times, His Contemporaries, Followers, and Students

**General Studies**


tions of his works in this book on the representation of light in the history of art. If the author still refers to "God Judging Adam" as "Elijah and the Fiery Chariot," this matters little; Annigoni is not concerned with Blake's iconography at all, but very much enraptured by "la luce trionfa" in his paintings, which are said to be characterized by "follia" and "parossismo" (379).


179. Bindman, David. *The Shadow of the Guillotine: Britain and the French Revolution.* Exh. cat. London: British Museum Publications, 1989. £14.95 paper. [This catalogue for an exhibition at the British Museum shown from June to Sept. 1989 considers "the British response to the French Revolution in the light of the visual culture of the period." All the objects in the exhibition, mostly dating from 1789-1799, were "in one way or another, public works, designed for general consumption." The introduction (see 26-78) and the catalogue entries (see 79-218) are concerned with "the question of the persuasive power of images, not only in their own time but also in ours." Bindman tries to explain why and how "a partial vision of events has triumphed despite all the attempts of historians to give a more balanced view" (9). Barry (#156), Romney (#158, 160), Fuseli (#157, 159), and Blake (#161-64) are treated and represented in the chapter on "British Artists and Writers and the Revolution" (166-78) and the respective section of the exhibition. There are also numerous references to the effects of the Revolution on other members of Blake's cultural environment (such as Bartolozzi, Darwin, Par- ington, Gillray, Godwin, Hayley, Heath, Joseph Johnson, Louterbourgh, Paine, Priestley, Schiavonetti, Sharp, Horne Tooke, the Wedgwoods, West, and Wollstonecraft) throughout the book. See also the preceding entry and #185, below.]

180. Chan, Victor. "Rebellion, Retribution, Resistance, and Redemption: Genesis and Metamorphosis of a Romantic Giant Enigma." *Arts Magazine* 58.10 (1984): 80-95. [This lavishly illustrated essay centers on a discussion of the image of the giant in Flaxman, Blake, and Goya as well as the context of this imagery in both contemporary literature and political caricature prints.]

181. Dickey, Stephanie. "The Passions and Raphael's Cartoons in Eighteenth-Century British Art." *Mar­ syas* 22 (1983-1985): 33-46. [From Blunt and Collins Baker to Lindberg, La Belle, Warner, and Chayes, "Blake's drafts on Michelangelo" (Baker) have attracted a considerable amount of scholarly attention. The practical outcome of Blake's admiration for the second of his high Renaissance heroes has not yet been studied with similar exactitude. The present article, while referring to Barry and Fuseli only in passing (41-42) and not mentioning Blake's case at all, nevertheless offers a wealth of pertinent information for those who might wish to inquire further into his use of pictorial traditions of expression in general, into his use of Raphael-esque prototypes for the grammar of the passions in particular, or into their relevance for the development of his own personal strategies of representation.]

182. Einberg, Elizabeth, and Judy Egerton. *The Age of Hogarth: British Painters Born 1675-1709.* Tate Gal­ lery [Catalogues of the Permanent] Collections 2. London: Tate Gallery Publications, 1988. [Blake's engraving after Hogarth's "Beggar's Opera, Act III" of 1788-1790 is described and reproduced as #117 on 145, and referred to on 75 and 81. Boydell's publication of prints after Hogarth is mentioned on 81, 110, 140, 145, and 147. A new catalogue of the Tate's Blake holdings by Butlin in the same series has been announced.]


184. Erdman, David V. "Treason Trials in the Early Romantic Period." *Wordsworth Circle* 19 (1988): 76-82. [Concentrates on Tom Paine, with a few asides on Blake and Horne Tooke, to describe "what constituted 'treason' and/or 'sedition' in the decades following the French Revolution" (76).]

185. Gaborit, Jean-Rene, ed. *La Révolution Française et l'Europe 1789-1799.* Exh. cat. 3 vols. Paris, Fr.: Réunion des musées nationaux, 1989. Fr 400.00. [The catalogue for the "XXe exposition du Conseil de l'Europe" at the Grand Palais, Paris (16 Mar.-26 June 1989). The overwhelmingly rich materials for the study of the historical and cultural effects of the Great Revolution that were presented a little confusingly in the exhibition are well documented in this impressive catalogue and here become somewhat more accessible by means of the extensive index in vol. 3. For David Bindman's "Liberté française, esclavage anglais" see 2: 568-70 and the subsequent catalogue entries.]

168-79 and 189-96) and briefly discussed (209-17) in this concluding chapter of the handbook to an exhibition that was jointly presented by the National Gallery of Art and the Phillips Collection (6 Nov. 1988-22 Jan. 1989) in Washington under the title "The Pastoral Landscape: The Legacy of Venice and the Modern Vision." Gowing's co-authors were Robert C. Cafritz and David Rosand.


190. Paley, Morton D. "The Art of The Ancients." Huntington Library Quarterly 52 (1989): 97-124. [With an appendix on "The Aders Collection" (122-24); besides some 30 halftone illustrations, two paintings by Calvert and Richmond are reproduced in color. See also #44, above.]

191. Postle, Martin. "Patriarchs, Prophets and Paviours: Reynolds's Images of Old Age." Burlington Magazine 130 (1988): 735-44. [An article which originated in a paper read at the 1986 Reynolds symposium at the Royal Academy of Arts in London; not only does it trace a motif in Reynolds' oeuvre which would have been of interest to the creator of Tiriel and Urizen, but it also compares Reynolds' "Ugolino and His Children in Prison" and "Lear in the Storm" with Mortimer's and Barry's visualizations of King Lear. Postle draws a clear line between Reynolds' "dispassionate stance" and that inherent in "Barry's patriarchal type—the type favoured also by Fuseli, Mortimer and William Blake" (744).]


193. Smith, Bernard. European Vision and the South Pacific. 2nd [rev.] ed. New Haven, CT: Yale UP, 1985. [In addition to the reproduction of two of Blake's signed and documented commercial engravings, the reader will here find an attempt to attribute to Blake at least part of the execution of Basire's 1776-1777 plates after the designs of William Hodges (see 173-75). This study—the importance of which has little to do with these passing references to Blake—is now also available in an affordable paperback printing.]

194. Stafford, Barbara Maria. "The Eighteenth-Century: Towards an Interdisciplinary Model." Art Bulletin 70 (1988): 6-24. [A report on "The State of Research," part of a series of articles recently featured in the Art Bulletin, which includes a section on "Print Culture" (16-18). While the article certainly has no direct bearing on the more specialized field of Blake studies, this suggestive overview of current interdisciplinary approaches in art historical research on the eighteenth century may open up new vistas for contextualized studies of Blake's work as an engraver and a painter.]


196. Thale, Mary. "London Debating Societies in the 1790s." Historical Journal 32 (1989): 57-86. [The materials here presented by Thale add to the accounts of the London Corresponding Society as given by E. P. Thompson et al., and they may be useful for renewed "historical approaches" to the context in which Blake's work of the years following the French Revolution was produced.]


*See also #5 and 197, above, as well as #223, below.*

**George Cumberland**


**Erasmus Darwin**

203. Coddington, Anne Lillian. "Erasmus Darwin: The Whole Man and His Concept of Love." *Dissertation Abstracts International* 48 (1987-1988): 590B. Rutgers State U of New Jersey, Newark. [Examines Darwin’s early poetry, *The Botanic Garden*, and *The Temple of Nature* in an attempt “to explore ... his concept of universal love as a living principle in which all life participates ... Darwin’s major poems emphasize four kinds of love: sexual love, despotic love, sentimental love, and celestial or universal love. ... This study ... attempts to show how the love and sympathy expressed in the poems are a reflection of his own life and relationships. The evolution of love, initiated by Divine love, moves in ascending and descending motion through the four forms of love and variations on these forms. In Darwin’s terms, Sympathy, in its dual role of fellow-feeling (female) and love in action (male) provides the guiding thread to truth and wholeness.”]


205. King-Hele, Desmond [G.]. "Chronicle of the Lustful Plants." *New Scientist* 22 Apr. 1989: 57-61. [An essay in celebration of the 200th anniversary of the publication of *The Botanic Garden*, commenting on the evolution of the poem and on its publication history, on Darwin’s poetical strategies in the creation of “erotic situations ... mythological or historical episodes related to the particular plant” (59) he was describing, and complete with brief references to Darwin’s “surprising influence over many poets now recognised as his betters, such as Blake” (57).]


*See also #5 and 179, above.*

**John Flaxman**


See also #16, 176, 180, and 183, as well as #249, below.

Henry Fuseli

210. Bechtold, Carmen. "Die ‘Nachtmahr’: Johann Heinrich Füsslis Alptraumdarstellung." Minster 42 (1989): 150-52. [In this summary of a 1987 M. A. thesis (U of Karlsruhe, W. Ger.), Bechtold offers an iconographical interpretation of Fuseli's "Nightmare" which is based on Janson's well-known attempt to understand the painter's invention by reference to Fuseli's unhappy love for Anna Landolt (see 151-52). The author has studied popular ideas about the causes and effects of nightmares in both contemporary and classical literature and finds that this knowledge corroborates a personalized, "psychological" reading of Fuseli's subject. She does not explain, however, why in 1782 Fuseli's painting met with what she believes to have been a mostly unfavorable public reception (see 150), whereas the various prints reproducing the painting seem to have been extremely successful on the art market. It may well be that in order to actually grasp the importance of Fuseli's "Nightmare" one will at least have to reverse the sense of direction in Bechtold's analysis of the relation between the artist's private experience and the painting's function in the public sphere. See also Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly 22 (1988-89): 53, #141.]

211. Fingesten, Peter. "Delimitating the Concept of the Grotesque." Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism 42 (1983-1984): 419-26. [Despite the author's efforts to delimitate the concept of the grotesque, Fuseli's "Nightmare" is considered a good example (422-23); why that is so was not quite clear to me, though I, too, look "with admiration" at the "prophetic expression of a psychic state, a complex mixture of fear and lust, the horrible and the beautiful, dream and reality" (422) in Fuseli's painting.]


216. Ruzicka, Joseph. "Fuseli, Napoleon, and The mistocles at the Court of Admetus." Master Drawings 26 (1988): 253-58. [Comments on a Fuseli drawing which was auctioned at Sotheby's on 19 Mar. 1981 and was not previously known to modern Fuseli scholarship; explains the iconography of the drawing by identifying both Fuseli's literary source in Cornelius Nepos and his visual sources in antique sculpture.]


219. Weinglass, David H. "Johann Heinrich Füssli." From Liotard to Le Corbusier: 200 Years of Swiss Painting, 1730-1930. Ed. [Marcel Baumgartner and Hans A. Lüthy, for the] Swiss Institute of Art Research. Exh. cat. Zurich, Switz.: Coordinating Commission for the Presence of Switzerland Abroad; Swiss Institute for Art Research, 1988. 66-71. [Three of Fuseli's paintings are discussed as #10-12 in this sumptuously produced catalogue, which was published on the occasion of an exhibition held at the High Museum of Art, Atlanta, GA (9 Feb.-10 Apr. 1988). Two paintings by Angelica Kauffmann were shown as #5-6 and are described by Paul Lang (56-59).]

220. Weinglass, David H. Paradise Illumined: Fuseli, Stobard, Westall and Burney, Milton's Late 18th-Century Illustrators. Exh. cat. Kansas City, MO: U of Missouri, 1989. [This catalogue brochure is bound to be an exceedingly scarce item in the near future, and those readers who are interested in late eighteenth-century
book illustration ought to send out their orders soon (the price of the exhibition flyer is probably minimal). It was issued to accompany an exhibition held on the occasion of the Central Renaissance Conference at Kansas City (27 Mar.-19 Apr. 1989). Most of the 31 prints on show (after Edward Francis Burney, Fuseli, Mortimer, Romney, Schall, Stothard, and Richard Westall) were lent from the author's extensive private collection, and only four of the items had to be added from UMKC's special collections libraries. Weinglass provides a one-page introduction, bibliographic identifications for the exhibits (3-7), a list of around 20 "Books with Milton Illustrations" (8-11), a "Select Bibliography" (12-13), and an index of artists and engravers.

See also #16, 40, 51, 76, 138, 176, 179, 181, 188, 191 and 195, above, as well as #225 and 275, below.

William Godwin


See also #76 and 179, above, as well as #262, below.

William Hayley


See also #179, above.

Angelica Kauffmann

148-49. [There is also a number of references to paintings by Fuseli.]


See also #16, 176, 187, and 219, above.

Johann Caspar Lavater


See also #76, above.

John Linnell

See also #186 and 190, above.

John Hamilton Mortimer
See #40, 176, 191, and 220, above.

Thomas Paine


235. Turner, John. "Burke, Paine, and the Nature of Language." Year-


Samuel Palmer


238. Lister, Raymond. Catalogue Raisonné of the Works of Samuel Palmer. Cambridge, Camb.: Cambridge UP, 1988. £65.00 cloth. See also #16, 186, and 190, above, as well as #286, below.

Richard Price


Joseph Priestley

240. Golinski, J. V. “Utility and Audience in Eighteenth-Century Chemistry: Case Studies of William Cullen and Joseph Priestley.” British Journal for the History of Science 21 (1988): 1-31. [Priestley was Blake’s chemistry man per se; moreover, this article places special emphasis on the interrelation between Priestley’s science and his radical philosophy and political thought.]

See also Enlightenment and Dissent 1-4 (1982-1985), formerly the Price-Priestley Newsletter, for an extensive series of hitherto unrecorded essays on Priestley by Roderick S. French, James J. Hoccker, Chubei Sugiyama, Alan Ruston, Colin Bonwick, Margaret Canoran, Jack Fruchtman, Jr., John G. McEvoy, Robert E. Schofield, Ruth Watts, G. M. Ditchfield, Mike Gray, Alan P. F. Sell, H. J. McLachlan, and Alan Tapper; see also #179, above.

George Richmond

See #21, 185, and 190, above.

George Romney

See #16, 40, 51, 53, 176, 179, 220, and 224, above.

John Gabriel Stedman

241. Price, Richard, and Sally Price, eds. John Gabriel Stedman: Narrative of a Five Years Expedition Against the Revolted Negroes of Surinam. Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins UP, 1988. [Stedman’s unexpurgated text, here printed for the first time from the recently discovered original manuscript of 1790; the editors have supplied extensive scholarly notes on the eighteenth-century editing and publishing history of the book, as well as on the engravings executed by Bartolozzi, Blake, et al. from the author’s own amateur designs.]

Thomas Stothard

242. Gombrich, Ernst H. “A Primitive Simplicity: ‘Einfache Nachahmung der Natur, Manier, Styl’ in englischer Sicht.” Kunst um 1800 und die Folgen: Werner Hofmann zu Ehren. Ed. Christian Beutler, Peter-Klaus Schuster, and Martin Warnke. Munich, W. Ger.: Prestel, 1988. 95-97. [A short note which outlines the use of the term “manner” in British art criticism, for example, in the writings of Hogarth, Barry, and Constable. The central source for the author's argument, however, is a letter by John Hoppner in praise of Stothard’s “un-mannered” design in his treatment of the Canterbury Pilgrims. The document, first published in an issue of Prince Hoare’s Artist on 6 June 1807, is well-known to readers of Mrs. Bray’s 1851 biography of Stothard; some, however, may find it worthwhile to learn from Sir Ernst about one of the various terminological and interpretative contexts in which it can be placed. See also page 175 in Read’s essay on Blake’s and Stothard’s versions of the Canterbury Pilgrims (#143, above) for “the possibility that Cromek embellished and altered” the text of Hoppner’s original letter before using it for his own promotional purposes in 1807.]


See also #16, 143, 167, 176, and 220, above, as well as #275, below.

Emanuel Swedenborg


Thomas Taylor


John Horne Tooke


John Varley


Josiah Wedgwood

thesis, which was previously listed in Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly 17 (1983-1984): 70, #167.

See also #16 and 179, above.

Benjamin West


253. Staley, Allen. Benjamin West: American Painter at the English Court. Exh. cat. Baltimore, MD: Museum of Art, 1989. $19.95 paper. [This publication—a monograph with an added list of works on show rather than the regular exhibition catalogue—accompanied a major West exhibition that was recently at the Baltimore Museum of Art (4 June-20 Aug. 1989). Chapter 6, entitled “Revelation and Revolution” (85-91) treats that group of paintings from West’s oeuvre which is particularly close to Blake’s Bible water colors in iconography, though not necessarily in form and content.]


See also #16, 17, and 179, above.

Mary Wollstonecraft


257. Butler, Marilyn, and Janet Todd, eds. The Works of Mary Wollstonecraft. The Pickering Masters. 7 vols. London: Pickering, 1989. [The second volume contains Wollstonecraft’s translation of Salzmann’s Elements of Morality (1-210), the fourth her Original Stories (353-450), both of which were originally illustrated with engravings executed by Blake. The series for Original Stories is reproduced.]


263. Thomlinson, Vivian Aytes. "Pragmatics and the Rhetoric of Feminism: A Speech Act Study of *A Vindication of the Rights of Woman* and *The Subjection of Women*." *Dissertation Abstracts International* 48 (1987-1988): 930A. Texas Woman's U. [Wollstonecraft's and Mill's "works are analyzed using the following criteria: authorial intent, with that intent being the advocacy of women's rights and the author's persuading readers to assume the stance of women's rights advocates; cultural, social, and rhetorical context; biographical data concerning each author; and the status of women at the time each work appeared."


See also #179, above.

Other Publications of Related Interest: A Miscellany


268. Fine, Ruth E. "Jenkintown to Washington: Moving the Lessing J. Rosenwald Collections." *American Book Collector* ns 2.5 (1981): 45-52. [Of interest to the history of one of the most important twentieth-century Blake collections; a few of the Blake items in the Rosenwald collection that were moved to the Library of Congress and the National Gallery of Art are referred to (see 51).

269. Freeman, John. "Romantic Attachments." *Times Higher Education Supplement* 18 Aug. 1989: 15. [An article which traces the links between the "Woodstock decade" and the English romantics: "There was a rock group in the US named 'The Doors' in homage to this phrase of Blake's [about cleansing 'the doors of perception'], and quotations from the poet appeared as graffiti on London walls signed in some cases 'Billy Blake.' Blake and his modern disciple Ginsberg enjoyed enormous popularity."

270. *Freiberg, Stanley K. Mad Blake at Felpbam: A Dramatic Monologue in Two Acts*. Victoria, BC: Newport Bay Publishing, 1987. [I have to admit that I failed to trace either an entry for this title in Canadian Books in Print or even an address for the publishers.]


275. Isaac, Peter. "Collecting William Bulmer Fine Printer: Contemporary Collectors II." *Book Collector* 37 (1988): 225-34. [Bulmer, an important figure in the history of fine printing and illustrated books of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth century, was connected with Blake's circle through the Boydells in various ways. The author of this article has also published a Checklist of Books, Pamphlets and Periodicals Printed by William Bulmer (3rd rev. and enl. ed., Wylam, Northum. : Allenholme P, 1986) and A Tentative Checklist of Bensley Printing (Wylam, Northum. : Allenholme P, 1989). Isaac's compilations—lists of short-titles without any detailed descriptions of the separate items—give access to a large variety of materials that may be of interest for a study of the cultural changes which resulted in (and were created by) the...
new market for illustrated books in Blake's England. Fuseli and Stothard were employed to design many of the plates for the books printed by Bulmer and Bensley. Blake not only owned at least three of the books that exhibit Bensley's fine typography, he also designed the plates for two books printed by Thomas Bensley (i.e., Malkin's Memoirs and Cromek's edition of Blair's The Grave), and he had previously contributed reproductive engravings to the Fuseli-Hunter edition of Lavater's Essays, also printed by Bensley. The first and second editions of Isaac's Bulmer checklist appeared in 1961 and 1973.

276. Liao, Ping-hui. "Inscription, Memory, Transgression: Sung-Yüan Poet-Painters." Dissertation Abstracts International 49 (1988-1989): 249-50A. U of California, San Diego. [This dissertation examines the visual-verbal dialectics in the works of Sung-Yüan poet-painters and of William Blake. The author finds that just as in the works of the late Yuan painter-poets, the "use of [verbal] counter-parts" to the "pure images" in an attempt "to tease out the inherent negativity is also apparent in the work of William Blake."]


278. Morris, Bruce, ed. "An Unsigned Review by Arthur Symons of W. B. Yeats's Ideas of Good and Evil: An Edition with Commentary." Eire-Ireland 24.1 (1989): 120-27. [The editorial commentary as well as the text of the review that is here convincingly attributed to Symons contain numerous references to the Blakean interests of both the author of Good and Evil and his reviewer. See also #284, below.]


282. Sanesi, Roberto. "Sutherland-Blake." L'arte a stampa May-June 1979: 8. [Comments on Sutherland's "visionary portrait" of Blake which is based on Deville's life mask.]


286. Yorke, Malcolm. The Spirit of Place: Nine Neo-Romantic Artists and Their Times. London: Constable, 1988. £20.00 cloth. [Blake, Calvert, and Palmer are referred to not just in the introduction, but throughout the pages of this book on artists such as Paul Nash, John Piper, and Graham Sutherland.]


412. Reiman, Donald H. Romantic Texts and Contexts [22#177]. Reviewed


Weintraub, Stanley 254
Weisberger, R. William 325(3)
Weiskel, Thomas 37, 459
Welch, Dennis M. 171, 172
Wells, David 173
Wendorf, Richard 440
Werner, Bette Charlene 441
Williams, Gloria 17
Williamson, Karina 364(2)
Wilson, David A. 236, 443
Williamson, Karina 36(2)
Wilk, Brian 73, 300(3)
Wilk, Henry R. 327(3)
Wilk, Joseph 395(4)
Wilk, Joanne 444
Wilson, Malcolm 286, 446
Wishman, Thomas 312(2)
Wittreich, Joseph 325, 395(4)
Wolf, Edwin 2nd 22
Wolfson, Susan J. 317(11), 360
Womersley, David 362(7), 385(7)
Woodman, Thomas 417(3)
Woodring, Carl 329(6)
Woo, Robert 445
Wordsworth, Jonathan 445
Worrall, David 318
Wortham, Thomas 390(2), 412(3), 430(2)

Y
Yarrington, Alison 209
Yeger, Myron D. 418(5)
Yorke, Malcolm 286, 446
Yoshihara, Fumio 175

Z
Zakai, Avihu 403(2)
Zemka, Sue A. 366(6)
Ziolkowski, Theodore 311(3)

Corrigenda to Previous Checklists, 1986-1988

The following items, quoted from secondary sources in the original checklist entries, have since been examined and their publication data verified, so that the asterisks which marked them as "not seen" can now be deleted: Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly 20 (1986-1987): 76-100, 55 (published London: Tate Gallery Publications, 1983; 2nd printing in the new format, 1987; distributed in the US by Salem House), 77, 81 (correct date of publication to read 1982), 86, 100, 101, 105, 111, 144, 162, 173 (originally published in Delhi, India: Ajanta, 1983), 211, 213, 250 (the chapter on "Blake" is 35-61), 257, 264, 254, 255, 257, 261, 265 ("Blake: The Exultation of Fluidity" is 29-62), 283, 285, 299 (in the title, read Revolution Controversy; 21*255 and 22*279 to be corrected accordingly), 305, 310, 312 (the subtitle does not appear on the book's titlepage), 324 (the correct subtitle reads Mainly of Writers and Artists; Grigson's rather unfriendly recollections of Todd appear on 45-46), 329 (the journal title ought to read Princeton University Library Chronicle, and the correct page references are 230-35), 340 (the correct subtitle reads Pursuit of the Particular Real; item 20*546 to be corrected accordingly), 343, 353, 358(3), 406(1) (the reviewer was A. A. Ansari), 421(3) (where, instead of 41, read 41-43), 455(4) (where the volume identification has to be specified as 2.1); Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly 21 (1987-1988): 52-73, #1, 3, 4, 7, 11 (correct date of publication to read 1987), 13 (read The English Romantic Poets; Mary Lynn Johnson's admirably balanced critical report on Blake literature takes up 113-235), 25 (the Blake chapter is on 222-57), 35, 38, 47, 61 (the brief notes concerned with Blake are on 18-21), 93, 118, 149 (see below for added annotation), 154, 158 (correct date of publication to read 1983), 159, 165, 181, 187, 191, 192, 193, 197, 209, 215 (correct volume reference to read 15.1, page references to read 55-59), 223, 231 (for Yeats and Blake, see especially 27-32), 253(4), 268(3), 275(1), 318(2), 329; Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly 22 (1988-1989): 36-70, #2, 10 (see revision, below), 42 (correct FMV volume identification to read 1.3, rather than 3), 99 (the page references ought to read 49-65), 107 ("Torrington and Blake: Reformist Text and Radical Image" is 252-62, and "Samuel Palmer's Virgil con Amore" is 284-303), 108, 126 (book's title to read The Romantics; correct page references for Pointon's article are 77-114), 131 (the book was published in 1986, not 1987; "William Cowper: Invitations to the Micromos" is 49-92), 132 (a 2nd printing came out in 1988), 136, 157, 163, 170, 171 ("Romantic Theory and English Reading Audiences" is 135-71), 174 (the "Introduction" to Innocence etc. discussed on 44-52), 177, 179 (Blake discussed throughout the book, yet see especially chapter 7, "Apotheosis of the Chap-Book," 208-40), 183, 193 (page reference to read 77-77), 212, 225, 226, 238, 247 (hardbound copies of these hard-boiled story are published by Delacorte P.), 268(1), 288, 357(1), 363(2) (the correct title of the journal is History: Reviews of New Books), 369(2).

Two entries have to be deleted altogether, i.e., 20*194 which was replaced by 21*117, and 21*251(3), for which see now 22*268(3). In volume 20, the reviewer's first name in #372(1) has to be corrected to read Herrmann instead of the anglicized Herman, and in volume 21 the title in #330 ought to read Strangeness and Beauty (as in the main entry, #226) instead of Strangers and Beauty. In the checklist for volume 22, the following printing errors call for correction: the correct date of publication of #105 is 1986, not 1987; in the title of #105, "Book Illustration" has to be spelled in two words, and in the annotation to the same entry read "general introduction"; double quotation marks have to be inserted at the beginning of the title of #209, and the single quotation mark preceding the hero's name in the title of #218 has to be deleted.

I seize upon the opportunity to completely revise at least two of the entries for books I had not seen myself when describing them for earlier issues of this report on "Recent Publications" in the field of Blake studies:

21*149. Boime, Albert. Art in an Age of Revolution 1750-1800. A Social History of Modern Art I. Chicago, IL: U of Chicago P, 1987. [Besides sections of chapters on "William Blake" (308-49) and on "Blake, Science, and Industry" (349-70), this important handbook contains discussions of the art of "Wedgwood" (87-93), "Kauffmann" (108-16), "West" (116-37), Darwin, Priestley, and "The Lunar Society" (201-13), "Barry" (227-33), "Fuseli" (260-77), on Fuseli's "Nightmare," Couts, Darwin, and Cowper (279-308), and on "Flaxman and Wedgwood" (370-82); Boime therefore offers a most useful introduction to an understanding of Blake's art in context.]

22*116. Sanesi, Roberto, ed. William Blake Opere. Trans. Giuseppe Conte, Roberto Sanesi, and Dario Villa. Classici della Fencina. Milan, It.: Guanda, 1984. Lit 90000. [A bilingual edition of Blake's "Works": the scholarly apparatus here offered to Italian readers of Blake consists of Sanesi's "Repertorio" (xvi-xlvi), an essay by Stefano Zecchi, "Nelle foreste della notte: L'illuminismo millenarista di William Blake" (xlxxi-xlxxv), a few pages of biographical and bibliographical information (lxx-lxxx), and textual notes "solo indicative della complessità dei problemi sollevati dai testi" (805-32). Whereas Blake's writings up to c. 1795 are given in their entirety (with the exception of parts of the Notebook poems), Vala, the marginalia, the letters, and Jerusalem are represented by excerpts only. Still, Sanesi's "Fenice" edition certainly has a chance to function as the Italian Keynes or Erdman editions of Blake's oeuvre, and as such may well cause a further increase of critical interest in Blake's poetry on the peninsula.]
"They murmuring divide; while the wind sleeps beneath, and the numbers are counted in silence"¹

The Dispersal of the Illustrations to Dante's Divine Comedy

By Krzysztof Z. Cieszkowski

Blake's illustrations to Dante's Divine Comedy, the unfinished series of water colors and drawings on which he was working at the time of his death, are generally regarded as among the greatest of all his later works. This series is dispersed among several public collections in three countries, which militates against attempts to examine the series as a whole, particularly as there is still no adequate edition reproducing all the water colors in color.

In my essay I trace in detail the process whereby the series of Dante water colors was divided and dispersed in 1918, and the responses such division occasioned. I do not attempt to judge either the legitimacy or the legality of such a proceeding, preferring to accept it as a fact of history determined by economic and administrative factors operating at the time. In the study of Blake we are all dependent on the history of the works that have come down to us. It is a legacy of this process that works now in institutional collections are located in different places and are likely to stay there. Both accident and design have contributed to this state of affairs.

The sale of the Linnell collection of works by William Blake at Christie's in London on 15 March 1918 remains a landmark in the process of transfer of Blake's works from private ownership into the possession of public and national institutions. The collection of works commissioned and otherwise acquired by John Linnell in the last decade of Blake's life remained intact throughout the nineteenth century, but by 1918 its dispersal seemed unavoidable. As early as 1913 Charles Aitken (1869-1936), Keeper (from 1917, Director) of the National Gallery of British Art (as the Tate Gallery was then designated), and Laurence Binyon, Keeper of Prints and Drawings at the British Museum, had made approaches to Linnell's descendant Herbert Linnell (d. 1937), a solicitor and partner in the London firm Finnis, Downey, Linnell, and Chessher, on the subject of the anticipated dispersal of the collection. On 4 December 1913 Linnell replied to Aitken:

With regard to our collection, it will, at some future date, have to be dispersed, although I grieve to think that it should become necessary. I will certainly let you know in good time before anything is done. I had a similar request from Mr. Binyon some little time ago. My hope is that all the works will be retained in this country and not find their way to America.²

This approach came to nothing, and four years passed before the question of the dispersal of the Linnell collection once again arose. In the event, announcement of the sale in early 1918 could not have come at a worse time for the Tate Gallery. The director had no purchase grant at his disposal, wartime circumstances had removed most potential sources of funding and relegated the acquisition of works of art by the nation to a very remote place in the public consciousness, and the imminent implementation of the Curzon Report on the administrative separation of the Tate Gallery from its parent body the National Gallery necessarily resulted in a period of managerial uncertainty for the Gallery.

In particular, attention centered on lot 148, the unfinished series of 102 illustrations to Dante's Divine Comedy, which in the 1840s Samuel Palmer recalled seeing at their inception:

On Saturday, 9th October, 1824, Mr. Linnell called and went with me to Mr. Blake. We found him lame in bed, of a scalded foot (or leg). There, not inactive, though [almost] sixty-seven years old, but hard-working on a bed covered with books sat he up like one of the Antique patriarchs, or a dying Michael Angelo. Thus and there we were.⁴

At some point prior to 1918 the "great book (folio)" had been separated into its constituent leaves, and Aitken was anxious that the 102 drawings that comprised the Dante series should be treated as separate items in the Christie's sale. Neither the Tate Gallery nor any of the other institutions that had their eye on the Dante drawings could afford to bid for the entire series, and there were real fears that only an American private collector would be able to raise the necessary finances to acquire all 102 drawings. Aitken's attempts to persuade Herbert Linnell to subdivide lot 148 were unsuccessful. On 11 March 1918 Linnell wrote:
I submitted your proposal to Messrs. Christie Manson & Woods and I have discussed the matter with Mr. Hannen to-day, and, in view of what he tells me, I am afraid the sale will have to go through with the catalogue as settled. It would only create difficulty and trouble, probably in more than one quarter, to do anything else. Had I heard from you before the catalogue was settled, the position would have been different, although I must candidly confess I think the drawings ought to be kept together, as a whole. I realise it is impossible to secure this except by someone purchasing for his own collection, or to present to one of the Public Galleries. (TG)

The suspicion remains that the convenience of the auction house took precedence over the interests of either the vendor or the potential purchasers of the works.

A week of hectic activity ensued, as Aitken attempted to raise the money that would secure the Dante series for the Tate Gallery. He sent out a circular to the Gallery’s benefactors and associates, appealing for subscriptions:

The Trustees think that this is an occasion when some of those who have given evidence of their interest in the Gallery and goodwill & have consented to become Associates might be willing to help them either by subscribing or by securing financial support from others... It is desirable that the intention of the Trustees to acquire some of the drawings at the Linnell Sale should be kept strictly private.4

Among those promising to subscribe were Sir Hickman Bacon, Mr. Geoffrey Blackwell, D. Y. Cameron, A. M. Daniel, Joseph Duveen, Frank Gibson, Lord Howard de Walden, Lady Jekyll, J. T. Middlemore, M. P., W. Graham Robertson, C. L. Rutherston, Arthur Studd, Mrs. Watts and Lady Wernher; the request was turned down by George Moore and May Morris, among others.

In addition to canvassing financial support, Aitken also had to ascertain the intentions of other collectors; assurances that they would not be bidding for the Dante illustrations were obtained from W. Graham Robertson, Archibald G. B. Russell (who wrote “You must get the Dante!”) and Alice Carthew. In a confidential letter to Carthew, Aitken spelled out his intentions and expectations regarding the sale, assuring her that “we want most the ‘Dante’ in view of what is coming to the nation otherwise,” and that the expected sale price would be £6,000, of which he had already received assurances of £4,700. He continued, “It is possible Melbourne [i.e., the National Gallery of Victoria] or one or two rich benefactors may put up the rest. We would appear to be the case in a letter received by Aitken from Sydney C. Cockerell, who wrote saying illness prevented him from attending the sale: “A friend of the Fitzwilliam is likely to be a largish buyer, [but Cockerell himself would not] be bidding for the Dante, of which, to my mind, a quarter is more than the whole” (TG).

Division of the series was unavoidable if the Tate was to acquire any of the works at all, but even this eventuality seemed to present insurmountable problems at the beginning. Charles Ricketts, Aitken’s closest accomplice in the project, wrote that “Alas I know no one for the moment who would help over the Blakes. I rather hope America will also prove sniffey, our provinces are hopeless.”

American participation was to be guardedly welcomed: mass purchasing of art works on the European market by American collectors with financial resources vastly superior to those at the command of their European counterparts was already a fact with which European collectors had to become reconciled, and Aitken and Ricketts appear to have wanted to involve American collectors in their plans in a secondary and subsidiary capacity, thereby heading off any attempt on their part at buying the Dante series outright. Shortly before the sale took place, Ricketts wrote to Aitken:

On principle I rather dislike the remnant being sold to America, i.e. part of it. I think the entire series as such has a National interest and America might think twice before purchasing what we don’t want. I also do not care for a gift to Liverpool; Liverpool has behaved badly, the act would not reconcile (vide Cecil Smith) they might even decline; if gifts are in contemplation I feel the BM [crossed out], Birmingham, Oxford, even Melbourne who all came to the rescue should have gifts, and if our £50 can strengthen the British Museum I am most keen that it should.

In the absence of much of the correspondence that passed between museums and collectors at this time, many of the references in this letter
(e.g., to Liverpool's alleged bad behavior) remain tantalizingly obscure.

In his notes on the sale (TG), Aitken compared the listing of the Dante drawings in the Christie's catalogue with that in Gilchrist's Life of William Blake and annotated a copy of the Christie's list, marking each drawing A, B, or C, in accordance with its presumed desirability. Such questions as the degree of completion of the drawing, the amount of color that had been applied to the original pencil sketch, and the quality of the design appear to have been considered in making such a value judgment.

Bidding began at 2,000 guineas (£2,100), and the Dante illustrations were bought at the sale for the sum of 7,300 guineas (£7,665), the National Art-Collections Fund acting as banker for an unofficial consortium of interested public institutions. Founded in 1903, the National Art-Collections Fund was (and is) devoted to enriching the public galleries and museums of Great Britain, and assumed this coordinating role with relation to the Linnell Blakes in accordance with its stated object: "to secure Pictures and other Works of Art for our National Collections." An invoice (for the Dante drawings and other works bought by the consortium) issued by Christie's to "Tate Gallery, C. Aitken, esq" and dated 17 (or possibly 7) April 1918 reads: "To a/c as rendered £9022.13 (TG). In its subsequent 16th Annual Report (1919), the National Art-Collections Fund (of whose council Aitken was at this time an honorary member) reported that "The National Art-Collections Fund acted as banker for this combined purchase fund, thus enabling several public galleries which wished to acquire some of the drawings, but lacked funds to buy the whole collection, to combine in a joint purchase." The Dante series appears as item 276 in the Fund's list of acquisitions.

The subsequent division of the series was undertaken according to an elaborate codified system devised by Aitken and supervised by Binyon, the collector Charles Ricketts, and Charles Holmes of the National Gallery. Holmes had originally suggested a method of dividing the series:

I have been amusing myself with thinking over a way to divide those Blake Drawings fairly so that nobody can feel aggrieved afterwards; and submit the appended suggestion for you to use or not as you think fit.

(1) Let each Institution be allotted one ticket for each complete £100 contributed towards the total of 7665, i.e. 76 tickets in all.
(2) Let each Gallery choose one Drawing in the order of the magnitude of their several contributions; then put the remaining tickets into a hat and let each Gallery choose when its ticket is drawn out. This will distribute fairly the best 76 drawings.
(3) Let the 77th Drawing be chosen by the contributor of the odd £65. (4) The remaining 25 Drawings, the least important of all, could then be dealt with in the same way, if desired.

The system as finally applied, at a meeting in London, was a variant on Holmes's suggestion. The twelve drawings presumed to be the least important or attractive to the participants were put aside as the "débris" (Ricketts's phrase) of the series, and the remaining 90 divided into three categories; each contribution of £250 entitled the participant to one share consisting of one drawing from each category. Charles Aitken drew up a memorandum on the procedure:

Purchase of 102 Illustrations to DANTE by WILLIAM BLAKE at the Linnell Sale at Christie's, March 15th 1918.

The price was £7665. Ninety of the 102 drawings were completed. Twelve were so slight and in pencil as to be of little value. The ninety finished drawings were divided into three categories:

30 "A" Drawings
30 "B" Drawings
30 "C" Drawings

To work a plan out in round figures it was assumed that £7500 was subscribed as follows in £250 shares there being thirty such shares for the ninety drawings:

- Melbourne £3000 (12 shares)
- Tate Gallery £3000 (12 shares)
- British Museum 500 (2 shares)
- Birmingham 500 (2 shares)
- Oxford 250 (1 share)
- Mr. Ricketts & Mr. Shannon 250 (1 share)

It was decided to allot on the principle of one £250 share entitling to a selection of 1 "A" drawing, 1 "B" and 1 "C". Melbourne, therefore, having 12 £250 shares received 12 "A", 12 "B" and 12 "C" drawings, 36 in all, as the Tate also: the British Museum 6 each, and Oxford and Ricketts and Shannon 3 each.

The twelve slight drawings were taken over by the Tate for the balance (£7665 - £7500) £165. They are not worth even this sum probably and one of the other galleries wished to take them.

Melbourne had the first choice and in picking a careful plan was worked out and adopted with the approval of all galleries concerned, to secure fairness proportionate to the size of the subscription.

In the event the Tate's proportion was reduced from 36 drawings to 24. Ricketts wrote a postmortem on the meeting in a letter to Aitken, and this gives something of a taste of the atmosphere in which the series was divided:

I thought Birmingham's selection masterful in every way; I admit I have come out monstrously well— I thought Binyon impassive, rather asleep in fact. I wonder what became of Oxford who ought to have been there. I agree with you Ross behaved splendidly, he secured a sound average without undue claims upon that which should be here. I only regret the Giant which I think is one of the 5 best. So all is well and we are all to be congratulated. I think the series will prove most popular in the best sense with visitors to the Tate, it would have been a scandal and a disaster had the set left the country.
Elsewhere Ricketts congratulated Aitken on the successful conclusion of the project to acquire the drawings, “I feel you worked heroically in this matter which was badly started.” 12 Congratulations came from various quarters. Alice Carthew wrote to Aitken— “I was so glad to see that you had got the Blake Dante. In the course of sharing up, I wondered whether by any chance you might have a picture or two over that might be offered to a private person or two?” 13 To which Aitken replied, “I think we should very probably be glad to part with some of our Dante drawings in order to reduce our commitments. I believe America would like some. I will keep you informed, when we have settled details.” 14 Among the letters of congratulation was one from George H. Leonard, of the University of Bristol; he had lectured on Blake to the troops on the Western Front (but been prevented from showing slides of works by Blake—slides of works by Watts, however, were permitted), and wrote to Aitken:

I wanted to write as a private person, to thank you for what you have done in getting these things for the Nation—and Empire. There are public thanks, I know, of a sort—but I thought I should say that there are private people who care very much indeed to know that treasures like these will now be available for all, and who feel they must add their private thanks to you and others.15

Unfortunately, not everybody was pleased with the outcome of the division of the series. Robert Bateman and Walter Butterworth, Curator and Chairman respectively of the Whitworth Art Gallery, Manchester, had offered a sum of £500 towards the purchase, “if assured of first choice of good drawings” (TG). The extant correspondence does not make clear whether this stipulation was unacceptable to the organizers of the purchase, whether the offer was received after the purchase had already been undertaken, or whether the offer was simply mislaid or otherwise forgotten; in any case the Whitworth was excluded from the final share out, and angry letters followed. Butterworth wrote to Aitken:

Those concerned in forming a Fund to secure the Dante series and other Blake drawings, took no trouble to advise the Manchester Whitworth Institute, and perhaps similar galleries, nor to invite their co-operation. The W.I. [Whitworth Institute] Council knowing nothing of this project, decided to bid up to £2000.... you answered that “the majority decision was that those bodies who had joined in before the sale should divide out.” From this decision we were excluded and eventually we were offered certain drawings.... They can justly be described as almost the dregs of the collection.... 16

And again, two weeks later

It seems extraordinary to me that when those concerned came to know of our efforts, before & after the sale, they carefully excluded our important British water colour Gallery from the possibility of acquiring a share of good Blake drawings. Doubtless you did your best in an emergency, but we have not been well treated.17

Elsewhere, Aitken wrote that Manchester’s Chairman, Walter Butterworth did not consider that the proposition was a sound business proposition and he was not prepared to consider it. He felt that the Whitworth Institute had not been fairly treated as they had been prepared to come into the scheme before the sale and that therefore they were in a different category from the other Galleries which had not offered to provide money towards the purchase. He felt they ought to have been allowed to share in the first division and that we had been greedy... the cream of the collection had been skimmed off and that which is left was a number of 2nd and 3rd Class Blakes which we and they did not particularly want. (TG)

With most of the correspondence missing or untraced, and that which is extant necessarily providing a selective and onesided picture, it is impossible to determine the rights and wrongs of this misunderstanding. Similarly, Mr. Erskine and Mr. James L. Caw, of the National Gallery of Scotland, Edinburgh, didn’t consider the purchase of the works they were offered to be justified.

The result of the distribution of the Dante drawings was that the Tate Gallery acquired twenty of the drawings, drawing on funds from the National Gallery (£581 from the Clarke Fund), the National Art-Collections Fund, and
a number of individual benefactors, including Lord Duveen (who contributed £2,000), Lady Wernher and Sir Edward Marsh. A typed report for the National Art-Collections Fund reads:

The 90 best were divided into 30 shares of 3 each (A, 1B, 1C) @ £250 a share.

The National Art-Collections Fund has 12 shares = 36 drawings, and also took 12 more drawings, from the 90, for £165 ($]. The Fund thus had 48 drawings in all. Of these 48 drawings, it is prepared to offer 20 A drawings to the National Gallery, British Art, and 20 B drawings to be sold in America - if possible.

1 to be presented to the British Museum (Purgatorio, Canto 2, "The Angel Boat") in respect of an extra £50 subscription by Mr. Charles Ricketts.

1 to be presented to Truro in respect of Mr. de Pass's subscription of £50 - to be selected out of the B drawings (21 in all) leaving 20 to be sold in America.

6 very slight drawings (as under) to be presented to the British Museum, Print Room.

(Hell cantos 21, 24, 33, 33; Parad. cantos 19, 28). (TG)

The remainder of the Dante drawings went to the National Gallery of Victoria, Melbourne (36 drawings, through the Felton Bequest), the British Museum (13 drawings), the City Art Gallery, Birmingham (6 drawings, through the Public Picture Gallery Fund), the Ashmolean Museum, Oxford (3 drawings) and the Truro Museum (1 drawing, presented by Alfred de Pass). Charles Ricketts acquired four works, which in 1943 entered the Fogg Art Museum at Harvard University, together with a further 19 works which had passed through various American private collections. Thus the unfinished series is currently divided between seven public and university collections in England, Australia, and the United States—a situation that would appear destined to remain unchanged.

The Fogg Art Museum, Winter 1989/90

of the transactions leading to their acquisition of the Dante drawings in their collections, but the other two institutions (Truro and Melbourne) have most helpfully located the relevant correspondence in their files at my request.

Among recipients of the subscription notice sent out by Charles Aitken (see above) was Alfred de Pass, the generous and frequent benefactor of the Royal Institution of Cornwall, Truro. On 21 July 1918 he wrote to George Penrose, Curator of the Institution, "Mr. Charles Aitken of the Tate Gallery writes me that the National Art Collections Fund have at my request decided to give a Blake drawing of the value of £100 to the Truro Museum and will go through them with me to see which one to present." Later in the same year, on 7 November 1918, de Pass wrote to Penrose: "Now I hear from Mr. Aitken, Tate Gallery, that he and Mr. Holmes of the National Gallery have selected a Blake water colour drawing. The Purgatorio Canto 9 The Angel with the sword marking Dante with the sevenfold P." Unfortunately, de Pass (whose subscription appears to have been conditional on one of the drawings being sent to the Truro Museum) seems to have been less than impressed by the drawing when he actually saw it: "I saw the Blake drawing we are to have. Some would think it dear at £ 3.10." The works that came into the possession of the National Gallery of Victoria, Melbourne, were acquired under the terms of the Felton Bequest, on the recommendation of its London adviser, Robert Ross. Ross, a friend of Wilde, Beardsley, and Beerbohm, had been appointed the fifth successive London Adviser to the Felton Bequest in May 1917, but his tenure of the post was cut short by his untimely death in October 1918. On 8 March 1918 Ross cabled the Felton Trustees:

Christies sale fifteenth March Linnells famous collection Blakes see Gilchrists life volume two page twentytwo and following last possible public sale Blakes keen competition high prices expected if Blakes wanted Ross strongly recommends various purchases cable general instructions up to fivethousand guineas.

A handwritten note appended to a terse report to the Committee reads "Approved. Felton Committee. 14.3.1918." On 30 June 1918 Ross wrote an exhaustive account of the purchase, addressed to the Secretary of the Public Library, Museum and National Gallery of Victoria, including the following:

I am satisfied with the result, and only hope that the purchase will satisfy the Trustees of the Felton Bequest and the National Gallery; and that the drawings which I was able to secure will arouse in Melbourne as much interest and appreciation as they did in London.... I am well aware that Blake's art does not appeal to everyone, and that the acquisition of so many examples might be open to criticism from those to whom his peculiar genius makes no appeal.... The action of the Melbourne Trustees is deeply appreciated by the Trustees and Directors of the English Galleries, and I think I can say that it will lead in the future to great benefits so far as the Melbourne Gallery is concerned, a precedent of mutual goodwill and understanding having been established.

Although the trustees approved the purchase, the public were distinctly less favorable when in 1921 the drawings eventually arrived in Melbourne. The art critic of the Melbourne Argus wrote:

Thirty pictures by Blake are on view, and the price paid was £4,000, which seems to be very much in excess of their value... no justification can surely be shown for the purchase of so many artistically inferior pictures, which will no doubt before long find their way to the cellars.

These expectations appear to have been realized: "Met with hostility and considerable public criticism on their arrival in 1921, they lay unused in drawers for over twenty years, until resurrected by Daryl Lindsay..." The delay in the arrival of the drawings in Melbourne was due to the photography and publication of the entire series while it was still in the capable hands of the National Art-Collections Fund, before
dispersal to the various institutions on whose behalf it had been acting. With the help of Emery Walker, the Fund itself issued the facsimile series as a portfolio—one color plate accompanied the complete series in monochrome. On 30 May 1922 Sir Robert Witt, Chairman of the Fund, was able to report: “The Drawings by William Blake of Dante’s Divine Comedy, which we informed you were being published by the Society, have now been issued. We believed it to be in the interests of British art, and a worthy monument to a great English artist who never stood higher than he stands to-day.”

Two hundred fifty copies of the Blake portfolios were printed in 1922; the balance sheets of the National Art-Collections Fund for the years 1922 and 1923 (in the Annual Reports for 1923 and 1924) list an income from the sale of Blake portfolios of £550.13.5 and £37.2.6 respectively.

The dispersal of the Dante illustrations can be adduced as an example of the principle of entropy applying to art collections and to compound works susceptible to subdivision. In this instance most criticism of the proceedings would appear to be anachronistic and out of place. Conditions of finance and administrative control have altered so fundamentally in the subsequent seventy years that it is difficult, and probably fruitless, to speculate on alternative procedures that might have been implemented with the intention of assuring the integrity and completeness of the Dante series. Furthermore, the complete series could only be located (presumably) in one of the seven institutions which possess parts of it at present, and the problems of display of such a quantity of works would possibly outweigh any advantages that completeness might bring. There is much to be said for Cockerell’s opinion that, in some ways, “a quarter is more than the whole” (TG).

In addition, the presence of the Blake drawings in America and Australia has had a substantial influence on the growth of Blake’s reputation outside Britain, and it can be argued that the cultural claims of Cambridge, Massachussetts, and Melbourne, Victoria, to the drawings of Blake are perhaps as great as those of London, Oxford, Birmingham, or Truro. Ultimately, the excellence of color reproduction in books and prints suggests that dispersal is not the tragedy that it might at first appear. Although a substantial number of the drawings have been reproduced in color, there is still room for a complete color facsimile edition of the Dante illustrations.

The writer gratefully acknowledges the generous assistance and advice received from Martin Butlin, Keeper of the Historic British Collection, Tate Gallery; Jennifer Booth, Archivist, Tate Gallery Archive; Joan Linnell Burton; Finnis, Christopher, Foyer & Co., Solicitors, London; H. L. Douch, Curator of the Royal Institution of Cornwall, Truro; Stephen Wildman, Deputy Keeper (Prints & Drawings) of the Department of Fine Art, City of Birmingham Museums and Art Gallery; and Irena Zdanowicz, Senior Curator of Prints & Drawings, National Gallery of Victoria, Melbourne. Crown copyright material in the Tate Gallery is reproduced by permission of the Controller of Her Majesty’s Stationery Office, London.

2 Public Records of the Tate Gallery, Acquisition File 10 BLAKE (hereafter cited as TG).
3 G. E. Bentley, Jr. Blake Records (Oxford, 1969) 291. The date 1824 has been criticized as too early, but no conclusive proof has been assembled for disputing Palmer’s dating of the encounter.
4 Copy in TG.
5 TG.
6 Undated; in TG.
7 Dated “Friday 12” [March 1918]; in TG.
9 Holmes to Aitken, 16 March 1918; in TG.
10 Photocopy received from National Gallery of Victoria, Melbourne.
11 Undated; in TG.
12 Postcard dated 29 April 1918; in TG.
13 21 March 1918; in TG.
14 23 March 1918; copy in TG.
15 7 April 1918; in TG.
16 21 May 1918; in TG.
17 6 June 1918; in TG.
18 Letter to the writer from Abigail G. Smith, Assistant to the Archivist, 14 January 1985.
19 Letter to the writer from Stephen Wildman, Deputy Keeper (Prints & Drawings), Department of Fine Art, 2 January 1985.
20 Letter to the writer from Nicholas Penny, Keeper of Western Art, 12 December 1984.
21 Transcribed in letter to the writer from H. L. Douch, Curator, 10 December 1984.
22 Transcribed in letter to the writer from H. L. Douch, 10 December 1984.
24 In possession of the National Gallery of Victoria, Melbourne; photocopy sent to the writer.
25 National Gallery of Victoria, Melbourne; photocopy sent to the writer.
26 National Gallery of Victoria, Melbourne; photocopy sent to the writer.