Contents

Article

144  Blake in the Marketplace, 1991
by Robert N. Essick

Reviews

168  Hazard Adams, Antithetical Essays in Literary Criticism and Liberal Education, reviewed by Peter Otto

171  Margaret Storch, Sons and Adversaries: Women in William Blake and D. H. Lawrence, reviewed by Nelson Hilton

Newsletter


Cover photo: "The Chaining of Orc." Relief etching, 11.1 x 8 cm., printed in black. Photo courtesy of Sotheby's New York.

© 1992 Copyright Morris Eaves and Morton D. Paley
CONTRIBUTORS

ROBERT N. ESSICK, Professor of English at the University of California, Riverside, is now co-editing, with Morris Eaves and Joseph Viscomi, a volume in the new Blake Trust series of reproductions of Blake's illuminated books.

NELSON HILTON reports that Alice Suzanne Hilton (b. 10 June 1991) seems to have negotiated merrily the "paranoid-schizoid" and with delight entered the "depressive position": ein schönes Kleines Kind.

PETER OTTO teaches English at the University of Melbourne. His recent publications include Constructive Vision and Visionary Deconstruction and (with Deirdre Coleman) Imagining Romanticism: Essays on English and Australian Romanticisms. He is currently completing a book on The Four Zoas.

EDITORS

Editors: Morris Eaves, University of Rochester, and Morton D. Paley, University of California, Berkeley.

Bibliographer: Detlef W. Dörbecker, Universität Trier, West Germany.

Review Editor: Nelson Hilton, University of Georgia, Athens.

Associate Editor for Great Britain: David Worrall, St. Mary’s College.

Production Office: Morris Eaves, Department of English, University of Rochester, Rochester, NY 14627.

Telephone: 716/275-3820.
Fax: 716/442-5769.

Morton D. Paley, Department of English, University of California, Berkeley, CA 94720.

Detlef W. Dörbecker, Universität Trier, FB III Kunstgeschichte, Postfach 3825, 5500 Trier, West Germany.

Nelson Hilton, Department of English, University of Georgia, Athens, GA 30602.

David Worrall, St. Mary’s College, Strawberry Hill, Waldegrave Road, Twickenham TW1 4SX, England.

INFORMATION

Managing Editor: Patricia Neill

Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly is published under the sponsorship of the Department of English, University of Rochester.

Subscriptions are $40 for institutions, $20 for individuals. All subscriptions are by the volume (1 year, 4 issues) and begin with the summer issue. Subscription payments received after the summer issue will be applied to the 4 issues of the current volume. Foreign addresses (except Canada and Mexico) require a $6 per volume postal surcharge for surface mail, a $15 per volume surcharge for air mail delivery. U.S. currency or international money order necessary. Make checks payable to Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly. Address all subscription orders and related communications to Patricia Neill, Blake, Department of English, University of Rochester, Rochester, NY 14627.

Many back issues are available at a reduced price. Address Patricia Neill for a list of issues and prices.

Manuscripts are welcome. Send two copies, typed and documented according to the forms suggested in The MLA Style Manual, to either of the editors: Morris Eaves, Dept. of English, University of Rochester, Rochester, NY 14627; Morton D. Paley, Dept. of English, University of California, Berkeley, CA 94720. Only one copy will be returned to authors.

International Standard Serial Number: 0160-628x. Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly is indexed in the Modern Language Association’s International Bibliography, the Modern Humanities Research Association’s Annual Bibliography of English Language and Literature, The Romantic Movement: A Selective and Critical Bibliography (ed. David V. Erdman et al.), American Humanities Index, the Arts and Humanities Citation Index, and Current Contents.
Blake in the Marketplace, 1991

by Robert N. Essick

After several extremely active years, the market in Blake's illuminated books slowed in 1991. Indeed, as far as I can determine, no complete copies changed hands. As if in compensation, both private and institutional collectors indulged in a lively exchange of Blake's drawings and separate prints. Two of the most significant works to find new owners, the splendid water color of *The Death of St. Joseph* (illus. 5) and the haunting tempera of *Evening* (illus. 6), did so without benefit of auctioneers or dealers. Both were given to the National Gallery of Art, Washington, by generous benefactors. Less important drawings, including one untraced since 1880 and another (illus. 4) lost to sight for 34 years, continued to appear in London salerooms. A partly hand-colored impression of Blake's largest print, "Chaucer's Canterbury Pilgrims," changed hands privately (see illus. 8-9). Several important separate plates, including "The Man Sweeping the Interpreter's Parlour" (illus. 10) and only the second extant impression of "The Chaining of Orc" (illus. 7), appeared in the same Sotheby's New York auction on 9 May. The sale also brought to market 10 plates from *For the Sexes: The Gates of Paradise* (illus. 1-2)—the first group to be sold since 1966—and a previously unknown relief etching of four of Blake's Virgil illustrations. The prices fetched by these works indicate that the high end of the Blake market remains largely unaffected by the widely-reported downturn in prices for Impressionist and contemporary art and the weakness in all but the very finest British paintings and water colors. "Orc" set a new record for any single print by Blake (excluding the large color prints that the marketplace always treats as paintings). "The Man Sweeping" fetched more than 10 times the price of the last impression sold at auction (1980), while the final-state plates from *The Gates of Paradise* exceeded the pre-sale high estimate by over 400%. In this context the price for the Virgil relief etching—only 50% above the high estimate—seems modest. This anomaly can be accounted for by the fact that at least one expert in the field considered the Virgil print to be a fake, and thus Sotheby's was forced to offer the work as only "attributed" to Blake. Taken together, the prices at this remarkable auction and the money paid for Blake's illuminated books over the last three years indicate that Blake is now appreciated by collectors principally as a printmaker. His drawings, particularly those lacking color, are in comparison considerably undervalued.

The Heim Gallery of London presented an exhibition of British History Paintings, 1750-1830, as its annual spring show for 1991. All but a few of the 142 paintings, drawings, and prints were for sale, generally at record prices (e.g., £500 for individual plates from the Boydell Shakespeare Gallery). There were no Blakes, but the show included several paintings by Stothard, two drawings by Fuseli, and a good many prints after both artists. All these and other relevant works are individually listed below. The handsome catalogue, complete with color reproductions and essays by Martin Butlin, Martin Postle, Peter Cannon-Brookes, David Alexander, and Geoffrey Ashton, is well worth having. I understand that the Heim Gallery has now shut its doors, perhaps for good. Another career ruined by over-reaching ambitions in history painting?

In my review of 1989 sales (Blake 24 [1990]: 220-37), I briefly noted the availability of the Edwin Wolf 2nd collection of Blake and Blakeana. After the 350 or so volumes and offprints failed to sell at a reported asking price of £100,000, the dealer (or dealers?) who owned the collection turned them all over to Sotheby's London for sale at a June auction. The books were parcelled out into 28 lots, some with as many as 25 volumes and clearly aimed at the trade rather than individual collectors. Since the total of the high estimates was only £31,750 (less Sotheby's 10% commission), the owners had decreased their expectations considerably without trying the alternative sales approach of offering the books individually or in a catalogue. The rationale for their marketing strategy escapes me.

Nine of the lots in the Wolf sale consisted of volumes with engravings by or after Blake. Since most of these lots contained more than one work, they cannot be divided sensibly into my usual title-by-title accounting of sales. Accordingly, I list immediately below the relevant lots in the Wolf auction. Most of the 19 lots of secondary works were purchased by the Japanese dealer, Rinsen. For the 2 lots containing manuscript and typescript materials, see under *Interesting Blakeana*, below.


Another Blake collection, considerably smaller than Wolf's, was dispersed late in 1991. The group of books with Blake's commercial book engravings, basic secondary materials, and prints by Samuel Palmer was assembled by Oscar Lewenstein of Sussex. In October, the Tate Gallery acquired most of the books containing Blake's engravings. For those who might wish to make use of the Tate's holdings in the future, the following listing of volumes from the Lewenstein collection may be of use: Ariosto, Orlando Furioso (1791); Blair, Grave (1808, apparently the quarto issue); Cumberland, Thoughts on Outline (1796); Darwin, Botanic Garden (1795); Enfield, Speaker (1797); Gay, Fables (1811); Hayley, Life of Cowper (1st ed., 1803-04); Hayley, Triumphs of Temper (1807), original boards with a presentation inscription from the author; Josephus, Whole Genuine and Complete Works (C. Cooke, c. 1789-90 or c. 1790-91); Malkin, Father's Memoirs of His Child (1806); Novelists's Magazine, a group of 100 pls. from, including 5 by Blake (with the bookplate of Samuel Rogers); Ritson, Select Collection of English Songs (1783); Salzmann, Elements of Morality (1792); Scott, Poetical Works (1786); Shakespeare, Plays (9 vol. issue, 1805); Wit's Magazine (1784); Wollstonecraft, Original Stories from Real Life (1796). The remaining Lewenstein books were sold from "The Property of a Lady?" at Bloomsbury Book Auctions, London, 19 Dec. 1991, with the volumes containing Blake's commercial illustrations comprising lots 1-8. A few prints by Blake (see "The Fall of Rosamond" under Separate Plates, below), plus several by Palmer, were offered from the collection at Sotheby's London, 12 Dec. 1991, lots 171, 198-200, 203-04. None of the Palms found a purchaser.

At least two sales coming late in 1991 indicated some weakness in the Blake market, even for fairly rare materials. Note particularly the prices fetched by the auction lots containing "The Fall of Rosamond" and "Hiding of Moses" under Separate Plates, below. However, an unusual combination of Blake's Night Thoughts and Grave illustrations bound together commanded a handsome price at a New York auction in December (see Young under Letterpress Books with Engravings, below) and some of the better books with Blake's engravings from the Lewenstein collection did well in London in the same month. None of these results is a reliable predictor of what will happen to the high end of the market in coming months.
Thanks also to Robert Schlosser for his journal, I am greatly indebted to Patricia Neill for her editorial expertise.

ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BBA</td>
<td>Bloomsbury Book Auctions, London</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cat.</td>
<td>catalogue or sales list issued by a dealer (usually followed by a number or letter designation) or auction house (followed by the day and month of sale)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CL</td>
<td>Christie's, London</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNY</td>
<td>Christie's, New York</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>illus.</td>
<td>the item or part thereof is reproduced in the catalogue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pl(s).</td>
<td>plate(s)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SL</td>
<td>Sotheby's, London</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SNY</td>
<td>Sotheby's, New York</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>st(s).</td>
<td>state(s) of an engraving, etching, or lithograph</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swann</td>
<td>Swann Galleries, auctioneers, New York</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#</td>
<td>auction lot or catalogue item number</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**ILLUMINATED BOOKS**

*For the Sexes: The Gates of Paradise.* Unrecorded copy, pls. 8-17 (inscribed 1-15, 17 in the pls.) only, all in final (fourth) st., very well printed in black on wove paper without watermark. The paper has a smoother texture, and is more ivory in color, than the white Whatman wove of copy F, with which these pls. were compared. All probably from the same printing, given the uniformity in paper type, ink color, and pressure and quality of printing. Sheet sizes: pls. 3 (12.9 x 10.5 cm.), 4 (13.7 x 11.7 cm.), 5 (10.6 x 9.5 cm.), 6 (10.5 x 9.4 cm.), 7 (11.7 x 9.5 cm.), 8 (10.6 x 7.6 cm.), 13 (10.3 x 10.2 cm.), 14 (12.2 x 11.3 cm.), 15 (21.9 x 14.3 cm.), 17 (11.3 x 8.1 cm.). Pl. 15 bound into an extra-illustrated copy of Gilchrist, Life of Blake (1863), vol. 1, the other pls. mounted on sheets of wove paper and bound into the same volume. As Joseph Viscomi has pointed out to me, the sheet size of pl. 15 is very close to those in copies C and D, and thus this new group may have been produced in the same print run. For provenance, see "The Chaining of Orc" in the Appendix to this sales review. SNY, 9 May, #8, with the copy of Gilchrist also containing an impression of "Orlando Uprooting a Pine," Blake after Stothard from Hoole's translation of the Orlando Furioso, Gates pl. 7 ("Fire") illus. ($115,500 on an estimate of $15,000-25,000) to a private client bidding on the telephone. The new owner has not responded to my inquiry kindly passed on by Sotheby's. See illus. 1-2.

**DRAWINGS AND PAINTINGS**

*The Awards of Athene.* SL, 11 April, #42, the property of an American private collector, illus. (not sold on an estimate of £6000-9000). Acquired Dec. by R. Essick from the estate of the vendor through the agency of Henry Wemys of Sotheby's and Christopher Powney. See illus. 3.

*The Bed of Death.* CL, 9 July, #86, illus. (Salander-O'Reilly Galleries, Inc., New York, $3520 on an estimate of £2000-3000). The drawing is not currently for sale but is part of the private collection of the Salander-O'Reilly Galleries. See illus. 4.

*The Death of St. Joseph.* Acquired 1991 by the National Gallery of Art, Washington. See illus. 5.

*Evening.* Acquired 1990 by the National Gallery of Art, Washington. See illus. 6.

*Hecate* (or *The Night of Enitharmon's Joy*). Pencil, 24.2 x 27.8 cm., a preliminary sketch for the large color print of 1795. Butlin #319. Sold Feb. by the...
London dealer Sims Reed Ltd. to D. Heald, New York. Acquired May from Heald by R. Essick. For illus., see Blake 25 (1991): 120. The drawing has been lined in recent years with semi-transparent tissue, but when held to a backing light a pencil inscription can be seen on the verso, "3 Guineas [lined through] / 1 Guinea." The hand seems to me the same as the one exemplified by the similar verso inscription on The Dead Bad-Doers (or Dead Ardours, Butlin #232), "1 Guinea [sic] / 2 Guinea [lined through]." Butlin attributes this pencil note to the dealer Francis Harvey, and thus the Hecate drawing may have the same conjectural provenance in the second half of the nineteenth century as The Dead Bad-Doers. "Sold to [the dealer] Evans by 1863; Harvey by c. 1880." This speculation fills at least a small gap, for Butlin records no ownership for Hecate between Frederick Tatham, who died in 1878, and Otto Schulze, who sold the drawing to W. Graham Robertson in 1905.

Jonathan. Pencil, 25.4 x 18.4 cm. on paper with a "JH/1818" watermark. Unrecorded until 1986. CL, 9 July, #85, illus. (£1650 to the dealer Christopher Powney on an estimate of £2000-3000). For illus. of this Visionary Head before considerable restoration work, see Blake 20 (1986): 16.

Lady Macbeth and the Sleeping Duncan. Pen, gray and brown washes over pencil, on paper with a J WHATMAN watermark, 32.7 x 42.6 cm., datable to c. 1784-86. Inscribed "Blake" lower right, perhaps a signature, partly trimmed off. Verso pencil sketch, probably of the same subject, reversed. Butlin #249, then untraced. Available at Thos. Agnew and Sons, London, fall 1991; apparently sold early 1992 to a private collector. For illus. and details, see Martin Butlin, "Two Newly Identified Sketches for Thomas Commins's 'An Elegy' and further Rediscovered Drawings of the 1780s," forthcoming in Blake.


Two Heads in Profile (recto); detailed drawings for The Man who Built the Pyramids (verso). From the smaller Blake-Varley Sketchbook. Pencil, sheet 15.5 x 20.5 cm. Butlin #692.103, 104. Sold summer 1990 by Christopher Powney to the Snite Museum, University of Notre Dame, Notre Dame, Indiana.

SEPARATE PLATES AND PLATES IN SERIES, INCLUDING PLATES EXTRACTED FROM LETTERPRESS BOOKS

An album of mounted pls. "related to Blake including impressions from copper plates," not further described. BBA, 14 Feb., #172 (Rainer, £60).

Allen, New and Improved Roman History, 1798. Campbell Fine Art, June cat. 3, #21-23, pls. 2-4 extracted, illus. (£225 each).

Ariosto, Orlando Furioso, 1783. For Blake's pl. from, see For the Sexes: The Gates of Paradise, under Illuminated Books, above.

3. The Awards of Athene. Pen and gray ink with light gray wash on the figures and cerulean blue wash in the background of the lunette, 19 x 29 cm. Inscribed lower right, "from Sculpture. William Blake vouched by Frederick Tatham." Butlin #96, dating the drawing to c. 1780-85. Essick collection. The personified arts include, from left to right, Sculpture holding a hammer and apparently contemplating further work on the head by her right side, Poetry holding a volume and looking heavenward (in hope of a visitation from her muse?), Painting busy at her easel, and Architecture holding a drawing of a bartizaned tower. Athene holds two laurel crowns and seems ready to award one to Poetry. Butlin suggests that the other figures are Drama (apparently the figure standing behind Sculpture and Poetry and wearing a Phrygian cap) and Music (far right, holding what may be a metronome). He also cites W. Graham Robertson's opinion that the design may be "for an advertisement of a Technical School." The lunette format suggests that the composition was intended for sculpted or painted architectural decoration above a door or window. Might this drawing have some connection with Blake's activities decorating the ceiling of the Wedgwood family home, Etruria Hall, with Flaxman's designs, c. 1785? (For information on this project see G. E. Bentley, Jr., "Blake and Wedgwood," Blake 24 [1990]: 249-50.) In Milton, Blake names "Poetry, Painting, Music, / And Architecture" as "the Four Faces of Man" in "Eternity" (E 125), but then reconfigures their relationship in the temporal world in ways far more complex than the traditional arrangement presented in this early drawing.

Blair, Grave, 1808. Campbell Fine Art, June cat. 3, #30, complete pls. extracted from the 1808 quarto, “Death of the Strong Wicked Man” illus. (bargains at £38 each).

“Chaining of Orc,” 1812 or 1813. SNY, 9 May, #6, illus. ($101,750 on an estimate of $30,000-40,000 to a Sotheby’s employee bidding for a private client who, according to Sotheby’s, wishes to remain anonymous). See illus. 7 and the Appendix to this sales review.


“Chaucers Canterbury Pilgrims,” uncolored. Donald Heald, March private offer, 5th (final) st., a previously unrecorded impression, very well printed on thin laid paper with chain lines 2.9 cm. apart, image 30.5 x 94.6 cm., plate mark 35.5 x 96.5 cm. (very faint), unevenly trimmed sheet approx. 44 x 103.5 cm. (acquired August by R. Essick). Provenance: acquired at a Philadelphia house sale by a local book and print dealer, spring 1990; acquired summer 1990 by Heald. The only other recorded example on laid paper is an impression on the identical stock in the New York Public Library. The Philadelphia provenance of the new impression, coupled with the fact that the New York print was given to the Library in Nov. 1941, makes one suspicious that both are restrikes by the Philadelphia dealer Charles Sessler, who began selling them in April 1941. However, the New York print was stained by the paste used on the backing and discolored when received by the Library; such time-caused damage could not have arisen in only 6 or 7 months. All recorded Sessler pulls are either on a wove paper with a “FRANCE” watermark or on silk. Further, the new impression shows considerably more stipple on the pilgrim’s faces than any Sessler impression I have seen, indicating that it is very probably an earlier pull. Indeed, the lack of wear on faces, and the printing of the drypoint sketching for the title letters, offset slightly from their engraved forms, are comparable to these same features in the 4th-st. impression in the Huntington Library. My tentative conclusion is that 5th-st. impressions on the type of laid paper described here are among the earliest pulls of that st.

CL, 14 May, #6, 3rd st., a previously unrecorded impression on “laid paper” (according to the auction cat.), wide margins, illus. ($12,100 on an estimate of $6000-8000).

John Windle, Oct. cat. 1, #35, 5th st., Sessler restrike, the full sheet as printed, stains from old mounting tape along margins, small repair center top margin, very small abrasion in the lower margin above “God” in the inscription, illus. ($8500)

4. The Bed of Death. Pen and gray wash, 15 x 14 cm., c. 1780-82. Butlin #139, untraced since its sale at CL, 18 July 1957, #29 (£44). Christie’s cat. of 9 July 1991 describes “rays of light” emanating from the bed, but I believe these are only lines indicating folds in the curtain behind the bed. The justification for the title, first used in the 1957 sale catalogue, is unclear, but the drawing may relate to several early works dealing with death and burial (see Butlin #135-37). Covering mirrors when someone has died is traditional, but the significance of this scene of a woman seated before a mirror, and the cause of her evident fear, should provide some entertainment for Blakean iconographers. Any suggestions will be welcome. Except for the illus. in the 1991 auction cat., I believe that this is the first published reproduction of the drawing. Photo courtesy of Christie’s London.
Dante engravings. SL, 6 Dec. 1990, #219, pl. 7 only, “The Circle of the Traitors,” and #220, pl. 3 only, “The Circle of the Corrupt Officials,” each supposedly a “proof [sic] before the edition of 1838,” but more probably an early printing on laid paper, both illus., pl. 3 showing surprisingly little burr for an early impression ($3300 each on estimates of £5000-6000 each). David Mayou, Jan. private offer, complete set, apparently on laid India (“region” of £27,000). Jeffrey Stern, Feb. cat. 9, #217, complete suite, India “on thick laid [actually wove] paper,” with 2 copies of the printed label, loose in a morocco portfolio ($30,000); previously offered Jan. 1990 cat. 8, #340, £34,000). Weston Gallery, March cat. 2, #15, “The Circle of the Corrupt Officials” only, fine impression on laid paper (and thus perhaps before the first recorded printing of 1838), illus. ($13,580); #16, “The Circle of the Lustful” only, India paper laid on wove, perhaps from the first recorded printing on thick Colombier backing paper (according to the cat. entry), illus. ($13,580). SL, 12 Dec., #172, 2 pls. only, “The Devils Tormenting Ciampolo” and “Agnolo Brunelleschi Attacked by a Six-Footed Serpent,” laid India, “probably from the 1892 edition,” some staining, some creases and tears in edges ($825 on an estimate of £1000-1500).

“The Fall of Rosamond,” Blake after Stothard. SL, 12 Dec., #171, 1st st., printed in black ink on laid paper, trimmed irregularly to and into the border line, with fragments of the imprint, with Blake’s pls. 1-3 from Stuart and Revett’s Antiquities of Athens and the 1977 British Museum Publications portfolio of Virgil restrikes ($605 to D. Heald for R. Essick). This impression of “The Fall of Rosamond” shows that the imprint was indeed present in the 1st st. (the other two recorded 1st-st. impressions have the imprint area trimmed off). The print was purchased at an unknown time by the vendor, Oscar Lewenstein, for $88 from Sotheran’s of Sackville Street, London.

(Hiding of Moses” from Remember Me! (1825). SL, 14 Nov., #101, descender of the “g” in title inscription slightly trimmed, some staining, with Lavater, Essays on Physiognomy (1810), 5 vols., uncut in modern boards, original spine labels preserved; Benoit, Blake le Visionnaire (1909); and Wright, Life of Blake (1929); 8 vols. in all from the collection of Pamela and Raymond Lister ($264 to Pickering & Chatto for John Windle for R. Essick). “Hiding of Moses” is now in the collection of Detlef W. Dörnbecker.

Job engravings. Print Connections, winter 1990-91 cat. 7, #1, pl. 6 only, published “Proof” on laid India, illus. ($1950). Weston Gallery, March cat. 2, #14, pl. 5 only, regular issue on Whatman paper, illus. ($3880). Campbell Fine Art, June cat. 3, #17, title pl. only, India paper laid on a sheet of Whatman 1825 wove (hence from the published “Proofs”), illus. ($950). Swann, 6 June, #41, pl. 6 only, published “Proof” on laid India, small nick in image, illus. (sounds like a bargain at $715). CNY, 26 Sept., #305, pl. 20 only, laid India without the “Proof” inscription, illus. (no price list received; estimate $500-700). SNY, 31 Oct., #84, complete set of published “Proof” impressions on laid India, some rippling in the India on 5 pls., early half morocco over marbled boards with original printed label on upper cover, upper cover detached and some pls. loose, pls. 3, 9, 13 illus. ($41,250 on an estimate of $40,000-50,000).

5. The Death of St. Joseph. Water color, 37.1 x 35.2 cm., signed with Blake’s monogram and dated 1803. National Gallery of Art, Washington, the gift (partial and promised) of Louisa C. Duemling, in honor of the fiftieth anniversary of the National Gallery of Art. Accession #1991.25.1; Butlin #511. A companion to The Death of the Virgin in the Tate Gallery (Butlin #512).
"Man Sweeping the Interpreter's Par­lour," c. 1822(?). SNY, 9 May, #7, illus. ($60,500 on an estimate of $20,000-30,000 to the dealer N. W. Lott for stock, price on application). See illus. 10 and the Appendix to this sales review.

"Morning Amusement" and "Evening Amusement," the pair after Watteau. SL, 6 June, #93, printed in black, slightly spotted and soiled, mounted in a scrap book "with other engraved plates and book illustrations of the same period and similar material," but apparently not by Blake, "Evening Amusement" illus. (Rinsen, £990).

Rees, Cyclopaedia, 1819-20. Campbell Fine Art, June cat. 3, #25-29, 5 of Blake's pls. extracted, lacking only pl. 6, details from 2 pls. illus. (£55 to £120 each).

Stedman, Narrative, 1796. Campbell Fine Art, June cat. 3, #19, pl. 10 only, "A Surinam Planter in his Morning Dress," from the 1st ed., illus. (£175); #20, pl. 1 only, "A Coromantyn Free Negro, or Ranger, armed," from the 1st ed., illus. (£145).


Virgil illustrations. Kenneth Karmiole, Jan. private offer, 9 wood engravings only, Linnell reprints bound in a green cloth oblong volume, from the collection of Moncure Biddle and with his bookplate ($1000). SNY, 9 May, #9, a previously unknown relief etching of cuts 2-5, with small patches of hand tinting in black, illus. ($15,400 on an estimate of $7000-10,000 to D. Heald for R. Essick). See also "The Fall of Rosamond" above. For more information on the relief etching, see the Appen­dix to this review and Essick, "A Relief Etching of Blake's Virgil Illustra­tions," Blake 25 (1991-92): 117-27.

Cumberland, Thoughts on Outline, 1796. R. C. Hatchwell, July private offer, uncut in original limp boards, back worn and edges rubbed, some foxing (£500).


Enfield, The Speaker, 1785. BBA, 13 June, #154, with Enfield, Exercises in Eloquence, 1780, uniformly bound in contemporary calf (Heath, £88).

Flaxman, Classical Compositions, 1870. BBA, 19 Dec., #5, waterstained, foxed, half morocco, stained and rubbed (Thorp, £33).

Flaxman, Hesiod illustrations, 1817. Swann, 28 Feb., #125, bound in contemporary morocco with the Iliad (1805), Odyssey (1805), and Aeschylus (1831) illustrations, scattered light foxing (unsold on an estimate of £600-900). BBA, 19 Dec., #4, foxed, original boards rebacked with label on upper cover, rubbed (Bookworks, £396 on an estimate of £150-250).

Flaxman, Iliad illustrations, 1805. BBA, 21 March, #259, with the Odyssey illustrations, 1805, both in original boards, broken and loose, with another set of the same (Nicolas, £888). Sl, 31 July, #599, bound with the Odyssey illustrations, 1805, some foxing and a few stains (Yamanaka, £220). BBA, 19 Dec., #3, spotted, contemporary half morocco rebacked, rubbed (Thorp, £82).


Hayley, Ballads, 1805. Simon Finch, Nov. cat. 7, #9, uncut in original boards, printed spine label, some very light spotting (£1200—probably a record asking price). Finch's catalogue does
8. "Chaucers Canterbury Pilgrims." 1810. Etching/engraving, 2nd st., left half of image. Essick collection, formerly in the possession of Mrs. Blake, Frederick Tatham, the London dealer Robson (seen in his shop by Keynes in 1912), Frank J. Hogan, David McKell, his son Dr. David McKell, and his son Donald McKell. Partly hand colored, inscribed in pencil lower left, "This print was coloured by the Artist W. Blake, and given by Mrs. Blake to F. Tatham Esqr." Wove paper, laid down to a nasty backing mat, evenly browned. Full sheet 40.4 x 96.9 cm., plate mark 35.8 x 96.6 cm., image 30.3 x 94.1 cm. The wooden backing board for the frame, covered for many years by brown paper, bears Robson's sticker. The only other recorded impression of the 2nd st. (Keynes Family Trust, on deposit at the Fitzwilliam Museum) is more completely colored in a similar style to this print; both generally follow the color scheme of Blake's tempera painting. I am more convinced than ever that the hand coloring on the impression reproduced here is by Blake himself. Several faces, particularly those of the Host, the Monk, and the Friar, exhibit a subtle combination of rose and blue to create flesh tones—a technique found in some of Blake's best nineteenth-century coloring and far beyond the skills of commercial colorists. The astute London print dealer, Andrew Edmunds, based on his inspection of color transparencies and enlargements made from them, has concluded that this impression is in part color printed (e.g., the faces of the pilgrims on the right—see illus. 9—and the body of the Host). I am equally convinced that there is no color printing. As far as I can determine, this and illus. 9 are the first reproductions of the 2nd st. large enough to reveal individual engraved lines. In the 3rd st., the hatching patterns on the pilgrims' clothing and their horses have been augmented considerably. The authorship of the pencil inscription, which I had previously and very tentatively attributed to Tatham, is an open question. The line is written in a very studied hand, with carefully formed, almost decorative, capitals, and this makes autographic identification difficult. Some of the letters are stroked in the same direction and with the same number of elements as Tatham's, but others are not. The wording makes it possible that Mrs. Blake wrote the inscription.

9. "Chaucers Canterbury Pilgrims." Right half of the same impression as illus. 8. In the 3rd st., a small building has been added to the fold in the hill just above the flat building above the head of the Priest closest to the Nun. The Nun's upper lip has been reworked, increasing its size and giving her a sour expression very different from the calm visage, perhaps with a hint of a smile, found in this 2nd st.

Hogarth, Works. Walford, Jan. cat. A/337, #147, 1822 issue ($2200). Swann, Feb. 28, #169, one of the undated Baldwin and Cradock issues, 111 pls. only, worn, “plates very good” ($1045). BBA, 25 April, #108, undated Baldwin and Cradock issue, 153 pls. on 116 leaves, contemporary half morocco, rubbed (York Gallery, $990 on an estimate of £400-600); #109, undated Baldwin and Cradock issue, contemporary half morocco, covers detached (Palgrave, £660). John Shotton, spring cat., #7, undated Baldwin and Cradock issue, half morocco worn (£1400). Swann, 5 Nov., #148, undated Baldwin and Cradock issue, disbound, letterpress damaged, some light foxing on pls. ($1430). BBA, 7 Nov., #36, undated Baldwin and Cradock issue, some leaves torn, contemporary half morocco very worn, covers detached (Talantine, £715). CL, 16 Dec., #255, 1822 ed., contemporary morocco (Bifolco, £990). Note: None of the cat. entries listed here mentions the presence or absence of Blake’s pl.


Josephus, Works. Howes, May cat. 250, #125, Bentley’s first issue, half calf rebacked (£200). BBA, 13 June, #244, C. Cooke issue, 58 of 61 pls., foxed (Bernard, £155). Eric Kline, July private offer, an issue between Bentley’s 1st and 2nd (see Appendix, below), 2nd (1st Josephus) sts. of Blake’s pls., contemporary calf, rebacked (£750); another copy, same sts. of the pls., Bentley’s 3rd issue, contemporary calf, worn (£750); another copy of the 3rd issue, Oct. private offer, contemporary calf, worn (£875).


Malkin, A Father’s Memoirs of his Child, 1806. BBA, 11 April, #327, bound with Malkin, Almahide and Hamet, 1804, some foxing, contemporary calf, worn with upper cover detached (Axe, £110). James Burmester, July cat. 14, #20, with half-title, contemporary calf rebacked (£250). Quaritch, Oct. cat. 1150, #14, with a presentation inscription from Malkin to “Dr. Pett” and an inscription by William Michael Rossetti recording the gift of the vol. from Thomas Dixon, blue morocco rebacked (£680). Simon Finch, Nov. cat. 7, #10, calf (£375).


Novelist’s Magazine. Heritage Book Shop, Feb. private offer, vol. 8 (Don Quixote) only, both title pages dated 1792, pls. in 2nd sts. (£350); same
copy, John Windle, Oct. cat. 1, #41 ($475).


Salzmann, Elements of Morality, Juvenile Library ed., c. 1815. BBA, 19 Dec., #7, lacking pl. inscribed 20 (but with a duplicate of the pl. inscribed 30 bound in its place), some tears, morocco-backed boards, slight wear (£264 to Quaritch for R. Essick).

Scott, Poetical Works, 1782. The Bookpress, April cat. 56, #392, contemporary calf (£375).


Shakespeare, The Plays, 1805. Robert Clark, Oct. cat. 25, #231, 10 vols., contemporary calf, worn, one backstrip missing, some spotting of pls., "good working or rebinding set" (cheap at £110). John Windle, Oct. cat. 1, #48, 10 vols., slight water stains in final 3 vols., full margins, diced calf (bit pricey at £2750).


Stuart and Revett, The Antiquities of Athens, 1762-1816. Sothean, April cat. 1017, #79, 5 vols., including the supplement of 1830 (£8700). CL, 7 June, #116, vols. 1-3 only, 1762-1794, some unspecified pls. missing, some spotting, worn (no price list received; estimate £300-500). CNY, 5 Dec., #339, 4 vols., 1762-1816, half morocco ($5280). See also "The Fall of Rosamond" under Separate Plates, above.


Young, Night Thoughts, 1797, uncolored. CL, 26 June, #248, 12 pls. shaved, no mention of the "Explanation" leaf in the cat. description, some offsetting, contemporary half calf, title page to Night the First illus. (Joseph, £3520). Simon Finch, Nov. cat. 7, #11, the "Explanation" leaf loosely inserted at the end, trimmed, but "a remarkably large copy," with an impression of William Bell Scott's etching of Blake (based on the Phillips portrait) inserted. H. Buxton Forman's copy with his engraved label, half calf (£4500). CNY, 6 Dec., #167, without the "Explanation" leaf, a few stains, half morocco, p. 19 illus., bound with Blair, The Grave, 1813 folio issue, some foxing ($4950 on an estimate of £2000-2500).

INTERESTING BLAKEANA

J. T. Smith, Remarks on Rural Scenery, 1797. Simon Finch, April cat. 6, #240, contemporary morocco, pls. washed, engraved title page illus. (£750). Charles Wood, April cat. 75, #177, original boards uncut, title page illus. (£800); #178, half calf (£550). As both dealers indicate, the list of subscribers includes "William Blake Esq." Smith met Blake in 1784, but the chance that the subscriber is our Blake is lessened considerably by Smith's practice of placing the word "Engraver" after all others named in his list who followed that profession.

Salzmann, Gymnastics for Youth, 1800. Jeffrey Stern, Feb. cat. 9, #150, contemporary calf rebacked (£1200). I no longer believe that the 10 pls. in this work were engraved by Blake—see Essick, William Blake's Commercial Book Illustrations (1991) 124-25.

An engraved portrait of William Cowper based on T. Lawrence's drawing. Campbell Fine Art, June cat. 3, #18, described as a proof before letters of Blake's plate published in Hayley's Life of Cowper, 1803-04, illus. (£375, purchased by the Tate Gallery). The print is in fact the 1st st. of Francesco Bartolozzi's pl. of the same portrait. Exhibited at the Tate Gallery, 10 July - 3 Nov. 1991, and misattributed to Blake in the handlist of the exhibition, William Blake and His Followers, p. 12.
11. "Group of Negros, as imported to be sold for Slaves," Blake's pl. 6 in J. G. Stedman, Narrative, of a Five Years' Expedition, against the Revolted Negroes of Surinam, 1796. Hand colored impression, 18.1 x 13.4 cm. Essick collection. The very slight engraved suggestions of vegetative patterns on the Africans' clothing have been enlarged and extended considerably by the overlay of hand coloring. These tendril and leaf motifs are similar to those on Mnetha's dress in Har Blessing Tiriel and on the bedspread in Har and Heva Asleep, both among Blake's illustrations to Tiriel (c. 1789, Butlin #198.4,11), and on the curtain forming the backdrop in A Girl and a Bearded Man Embracing (c. 1785-90, Butlin #85 recto). The closest parallel is offered by the patterned dress worn by one of the youths in Blake's Age Teaching Youth, a water color of c. 1785-90 (Butlin #91). The blue and rose red colors of the vines and leaves in the Stedman plate—an unusual choice for such motifs—is the same as the coloring on the dress in Age Teaching Youth (see Butlin's color illus. 179). This remarkable parallel offers some credence to the suspicion that Blake may have had some hand in providing coloring models for his plates in Stedman, although there is evidence to suggest that the coloring was based on Stedman's original water colors (none of which for Blake's plates survives). Similar, but less well defined, versions of the vine and leaf motifs in the same two colors are present in the hand-tinted copy of the 1796 ed. in the Huntington Library. In hand-colored copies of the 1806 and 1813 issues I have seen, the decorations on the Africans' clothing are covered with uniform washes that obscure the engraved tendrils.

After being informed of the truth about this pl., Michael Campbell of Campbell Fine Art very responsibly informed Robin Hamlyn of the Tate, which decided to keep the print.

William Hayley, letter to John Johnson, 27 Nov. 1803. SL, 18 July, #205, with a reference to an engraving in Hayley's Life of Cowper (see the Appendix below), 3 pp. (Quaritch, £550 on an estimate of £600-700). Quaritch, Oct. cat. 1150, #68 (£1200). According to the auction cat., the passing mention of "our good Lady H" refers to Emma Hamilton, but surely Quaritch's catalogue is right in identifying the woman as Lady Hesketh, Cowper's ever-solicitous cousin who was much involved with Hayley's composition and publication of the Life of Cowper.

Skeletons Abducting a Woman. Pencil, pen, gray wash drawing, 24.8 x 35 cm., inscribed "W. Blake. 1804." CL, 9 July, #10 (£88 on an estimate of £200-300). Sold as "English School, circa 1780," but Martin Butlin has suggested in correspondence that the drawing is by the Danish artist Nikolai Abildgaard (1744-1809).


Frederic Shields, drawing for the dust jacket and cover of Gilchrist, Life of Blake, 1880. Acquired summer 1991 by the dealer Christopher Powney from David Bindman; sold August by Powney to R. Essick. See illus. 12.

Anne Gilchrist and her son, Herbert. 38 letters to, some concerning Gilchrist's Life of Blake, from John Linnell Sen.,

William Muir, facsimile of Blake's *Europe*, no. 7 of 50 copies, hand colored, bound in multi-colored calf with decorations based on Blake's frontispiece, probably executed by an amateur. Robert Clark, Feb. cat. 23, #184 (£380). Item #185 is Muir's facsimile of *America*, no. 31 of 50, no information on coloring, similarly bound, the cover decorated with "snakes, birds & cavitating figures" (£380).


12. Frederic Shields, drawing for the dust jacket and cover design for Alexander Gilchrist, *Life of William Blake*, 2nd ed., 1880, based on Robert Blake's drawing in William Blake's Notebook, p. 5. Pen and black ink, black and brown washes heightened with white, 23.5 x 14.3 cm. on tracing paper mounted on an olive brown sheet. Apparently Shields traced the design directly from Blake's Notebook, then in Dante Gabriel Rossetti's possession. The back of the mount bears several pencil inscriptions related to the production of the cover. The longest, in what looks to me like Rossetti's hand, reads as follows: "Leave plenty of Black—don't thin the black lines or washes(? too much—so that when a proof is taken we can put more white in if needful." Essick collection.
BLAKE'S CIRCLE AND FOLLOWERS

Works are listed under artists' names in the following order: untitled paintings and drawings sold in groups, single paintings and drawings, letters and manuscripts, separate plates, books by (or with plates by or after) the artist.

BARRY, JAMES

Ecce Homo (recto); Classical Figures (recto). Pen and ink, brown wash, 30.5 x 19.8 cm., signed and inscribed with the recto title. CL, 9 April, #6, illus. (£660).

"King Lear Weeping over the Body of Cordelia," engraved by Legat for Boydell’s Shakespeare Gallery. Campbell Fine Art, June cat. 3, #7, etched proof trimmed to the image, illus. (£160).


A Series of Etchings by James Barry, 1808. Campbell Fine Art, June cat. 3, #1-6, 6 pls. extracted, all illus. (£160 to £350).

CALVERT, EDWARD


FLAXMAN, JOHN

See also Flaxman under Letterpress Books with Blake's engravings, above.

A folio of 12 sheets of drawings, six with verso studies, one by another hand, for funeral monuments, portraits, a bird, figures and heads, pencil or pen and ink, with a drawing of figure studies on blue paper and 3 drawings "attributed to the artist." SL, 11 April, #7, the folio drawings dated to c. 1780, 4 drawings illus., including one inscribed "WB" and "W Blake del." (not sold on an optimistic estimate of £4000-6000). These drawings are from a larger group attributed to Flaxman in Iolo A. Williams, "An Identification of Some Early Drawings by John Flaxman," Burlington Magazine 102 (1960): 246-50.

Designs for Chess Pieces. Pen and brown ink, brown wash, 11 x 19 cm., with 3 other drawings attributed to Flaxman or Stothard, illus. (not sold on an estimate of £400-600).

Flaxman, portrait of, by John Jackson. Oil, 76 x 63.5 cm. CL, 1 March, #23, illus. (not sold on an estimate of £3000-5000).

Midsummer Night's Dream, an illustration to. Wash, with touches of blue and pink by another hand (now almost completely removed by cleaning). Acquired fall 1991 by the Fitzwilliam Museum, Cambridge, with a companion drawing by Henry Howard also illustrating Shakespeare's play.

"Summer" and "Autumn," lithographs after Flaxman, round, 37.5 cm. diameter. CL, 18 Sept., #104 (£132).


Flaxman, Anatomical Studies, 1833. Robert Clark, May cat. 24, #222, a late reissue of c. 1879 (according to the dealer), original late nineteenth-century red cloth, worn (£200). Marlborough Rare Books, Sept. cat. 42, #143, original green cloth rebacked (£320).

Flaxman, Lectures on Sculpture. The Chaucer Head, June cat. 13, #562, 1829 ed., half morocco (£120). Dawson Book Service, Oct. cat. 35, #163, 1838 ed., contemporary calf (£140). Note: The 2nd ed. is often priced higher than the 1st because the illustrations in the 1838
vol. were the first impressions of 1829, mistakenly printed on leaves too small for use in the 1st ed.


Homer, *Iliad* and *Odyssey* illustrations. Weissert, Jan. cat. 47, #56, engraved by Riepenhausen, 1817 (DM800). Grant & Shaw, Aug. cat. 8, #79, 1833 ed. of the *Iliad* and *Odyssey* illustrations, published 1852. Swann, 19 Nov., #166, 22 vols., half sheep very worn, some damp-staining, “visual inspection recommended” ($1320 in spite of the warning signals in the cat. description and an estimate of $400-600).

The three witches appearing to Macbeth and Banquo. Oil, 87 x 112 cm., from the collection of the late Professor Richard G. Carroll. CL, 12 April, #38, illus. color ($71,500 on an estimate of $70,000-100,000).

Fuseli, a miniature portrait of, by Moses Haughton. Sold by a descendant of George Heath to Elizabeth Bentley; given by her to G. E. Bentley, Jr., July 1991. A very similar version is in the Ashmolean Museum, Oxford.

Letter to the publisher Cadell, recommending “A Young Engraver of Very great Promise,” Alfred Freebairn, 1824. SL, 13 Dec. 1890, #454, with 18 other letters by various English artists (not sold; estimate £500-600).

"Hamlet" and "King Lear," engravings by Thew and Earlom for Boydell's Shakespeare Gallery. BBA, 7 Nov., #69, with 6 undescribed pls. also from the Boydell series, some short tears and dust staining (Finbar Macdonnell, £121).


Bible, published Macklin, 1800. Blackwell's, May cat. 12, #713, 6 vols., contemporary full blue morocco gilt extra ($1400); same set, James Cummins, May cat. 31, #14 ($4000).

Fuseli, Henry

Eve, after the Sentence and Departure of the Judge, Despairing, Supported by Adam. Oil, 152.5 x 72.5 cm., exhibited in Fuseli’s Milton Gallery, 1799-1800, no. XXI. CL, 12 July, #45, from the collection of Dian and Andrea Woodner, illus. color (not sold on an estimate of £70,000-100,000).

King David Being Warned by the Prophet Nathan. CL, 2 July, #192, from the collection of Ian Woodner, illus. ($30,800 on an estimate of £12,000-18,000). See illus. 14.

Kriemhild and the Dead Siegfried. Black chalk with India ink wash, 38.5 x 50.5 cm. Heim, May-June cat., #140, illus. ($79,000—a very optimistic asking price).

An Old Prophet Preaching. Pencil, gray and pale green wash, 16 x 13 cm.


Works of the British Poets, ed. Park, 1805-08. Stuart Bennett, March cat. 17, #129, 42 vols., with the supplement of 1809 in 6 vols., contemporary half morocco (£1500).


LINNELL, JOHN

43 landscape drawings by Linnell and members of his family, some dated 1807-26, mostly pencil, some with washes or colored chalks, various sizes, with 20 drawings by John Bell. Sl, 11 July, #117 (not sold on an estimate of £600-800).

18 water colors (all but one a landscape), 1 crayon drawing, and 1 oil sketch by members of the Linnell family, some (perhaps all?) from the collection of Mrs. Edith Bell, John Linnell’s granddaughter. Martyn Gregory, Oct. cat. 58, #71-90, 14 illus. The works by John Linnell are as follows: #71, *Derbyshire Landscape*, water color, 7 x 10 in., signed and dated 1814, illus. (£2800); #72, *Entrance of the River Lea into the Thames at Blackwall*, water color, 16¼ x 22¼ in., signed (£1650); #73, *Sunset: Return from the Harvest*, water color, 10¾ x 14¼ in., signed and dated 1863, illus. (£3800); #74, *Cloud Study*, oil, 7½ x 8¼ in., signed and dated 1845, illus. (£2200); #75, *Cloud Study*, crayons, 7½ x 9½ in. (£650); #76, *Study of Hills and Clouds, North Wales*, water color, 11 x 18½ in., signed, illus. (£3300).

*Landscape with David and the Lion*. Oil, 139 x 216.9 cm., signed (£4400). Apparently the same work, previously sold SL, 16 Nov. 1989, #95 (£70,400 on an estimate of £20,000-30,000).

*The Bay of Naples*. Water color heightened with gold, 19.7 x 42 cm., signed. CL, 9 July, #120, illus. color (£7150 on an estimate of £6000-8000).

*Cypresses at the Villa d’Este, Tivoli*. Water color, 51 x 71 cm. SL, 14 Nov., #163, illus. color (£22,000 on an estimate of £20,000-30,000).

*Old England’s Sunday Evening*. SL, 14 Nov., #126, illus. color (£110,000—an auction record for a late Palmer). See illus. 16.

MORTIMER, JOHN HAMILTON

*Beaching a Fishing Boat in a Gale*. Pen and black ink, 20 x 28 cm. SL, 11 July, #70, from the collection of Colin Hunter, illus. (£4400). Apparently the basis for Robert Blyth’s etching after Mortimer of 1783.

*Study for the Presentation of the Magna Carta to King John*. Pen and brown ink, gray washes, 20.5 x 26 cm. Sotheby’s Sussex, 20 May, #346 (no price information, but apparently not sold on an estimate of £600-800). The same work, Sl, 14 Nov., #89 (not sold on an estimate of £400-600).

*Etchings Dedicated to Sir Joshua Reynolds*, set of title and 15 pls., 1778. Sny, 9 May, #81, bound with “Revengeful Monsters” (1780), slight foxing, half morocco (£1320).


*Cassandra,” etching. Campbell Fine Art, June cat. 3, #97, 1816 Palser printing, illus. (£115).


PALMER, SAMUEL


*The Bay of Naples*. Water color heightened with gold, 19.7 x 42 cm., signed. CL, 9 July, #120, illus. color (£7150 on an estimate of £6000-8000).

*Near Underriever, Sevenoaks, Kent*. Black chalk and water color, 26.7 x 37.5 cm. Agnew’s, 118th Annual Exhibition of Watercolours and Drawings, Feb., #25, illus. (£17,500).

*Sheep in the Shade*. Pencil and water color with touches of white, 37.5 x 53 cm., signed. Cl, 12 Nov., #138, illus. color (£12,650).

The *Villa d’Este from the Cypress Avenue*, an illustration to Dickens’ Pic-

*tures from Italy*, 1846. Pencil, approx. 13.5 x 8 cm. SL, 14 Nov., #38, illus., with 2 other drawings by Palmer, one pencil and the other gray wash over pencil, and 3 drawings by J. C. Hook, all from the collection of A. H. Palmer (surprisingly not sold on a modest enough estimate of £200-300).

Autograph receipt signed, “Received of Mrs. Jukes for this morning’s lesson, £6.6.0. Samuel Palmer,” 26 April 1850. Michael Silverman, July cat. 1, #29 (£275).


“Morning of Life,” etching. SL, 12 Dec., #204, 7th st., laid India (not sold).


“Rising Moon,” etching. Print Connections, winter 1990-91 cat. 7, #11, 7th st. (£420). SL, 12 Dec., #200, 7th st., “a very good impression” (not sold); #201, 7th st., laid India, minor foxing and ink-staining (not sold).


Dickens, *Pictures from Italy*, 1846. George’s, April cat. 715, #68 (£300). The 19th Century Shop, April cat. 20, #63, original cloth (£950). The 19th Century Shop prides itself on asking higher prices than anyone else.


19 Dec., #56, small paper, original cloth, little rubbed (Maggs, £88).


15. Henry Fuseli, *The Spirit of Knowledge*. Pencil and gray ink, 18.1 x 22.2 cm. Possibly an unpublished frontispiece design for William Roscoe's translation of Luigi Tansillo's *The Nurse*, 1798. Clearly a scene of instruction, like Blake's earlier designs, *Age Teaching Youth* (c. 1785-90, Butlin #91), the title page to *Songs of Innocence* (1789), and pl. 10 in *The Marriage of Heaven and Hell* (c. 1790). Like the adult in Fuseli's drawing, the posture of the figure on the right in the *Marriage* illumination shows a strong indebtedness to the sibyls and prophets in Michelangelo's Sistine frescoes. Reproduced with permission of The Leger Galleries, London.

**RICHMOND, GEORGE**


**ROMNEY, GEORGE**

A sketchbook of 67 leaves, 20.7 x 16.5 cm., containing drawings (pen and brown ink, some washes), drafts of letters, accounts, and diary excerpts, apparently dating from the early 1770s. CL, 9 July, #27, 6 pages illus. color (not sold on a brave estimate of £15,000-25,000).
STOTHARD, THOMAS

14 drawings for book illustrations, including designs for *Filial Affection, The Decameron, The Harper, and Gertrude of Wyoming*. The majority inscribed, pencil, pen and brown ink, gray wash, 4 with water color, 13.7 x 14 cm. Cl., 9 July, #26 (£495 on an estimate of £300-600).

4 studies of figures, pen and ink. Sotheby's at Castle Howard, 12 Nov., #539 (£286).

A Biblical Drowning. Pencil and water color, 11.5 x 7 cm. Sotheby's Sussex, 20 May, #342, with 5 unrelated drawings by various hands (no price information; estimate £300-500).

*Canterbury Pilgrims* [sic?]. Pencil, pen and brown ink with water colors on most figures, 16.8 x 49.2 cm., indis­tinctly inscribed "Milan . . .," the top left corner repaired. Cl., 9 July, #25, illus. (£495 on an estimate of £500-700). The auction cat. claims that this water color copy by Stothard of his famous design is "remarkably faithful to the original," but other than the panoramic format, and the fact that a group of people on horseback are pictured, this design looks nothing like the engraving of Stothard's "Pilgrimage to Canterbury" or any drawn or painted version of it I have seen. The middle of the composition is dominated by two dark-skinned figures wearing Moorish hats. The inscription hints at an Italian subject.

*Cimon and Ipibigena*. Oil, 92 x 72.4 cm. Heim, May-June cat., #36, illus. color (£28,000—perhaps a record asking price for any work by Stothard).

*Katherine and the Tailor*. Oil, 70 x 53 cm., illustrating *The Taming of the Shrew*. Heim, May-June cat., #122, illus. color (£6800).

*The Portland Vase*. A pair of studies of the front and back, water colors, 30.5 x 22.5 cm., perhaps associated with Wedgwood's production of copies of the vase. Sotheby's at Castle Howard, 12 Nov., #540 (£7150 on an estimate of £500-800).

*Sin and Death at the Gates of Hell*. Oil, 12.7 x 16.5 cm. Heim, May-June cat., #97, illus. color (£3250). A subject a bit out of Stothard's usual line, but intriguingly handled in an evocative oil sketch.

An album of prints after Stothard, apparently all book illus., in 2 vols. octavo with approx. 460 pls. from *The Royal Universal Pocket Atlas*, Rogers' *Poems and Italy*, and works by Byron, Scott, etc. David Waxman, Sept. cat. 4, #112, dated to c. 1830, full morocco, rubbed (£500).

*Pilgrim's Progress*, the set of 17 large pls., 1788-93. BBA, 25 April, #58, 15 pls. only, some foxing, with a group of miscellaneous prints by and after other artists (York Gallery, £176). Ximenes Rare Books, Nov. cat. 93, #366, light soiling of the pls., contemporary morocco, fore-edge painting of Bedford Bridge (£2000—a price determined by the fore-edge decoration). Swann, 24 Oct., #53, modern calf, front cover detached (£66).


European Magazine, 1782-84. BBA, 13 June, #159, vols. 1-46, 1782-1811, foxed and worn (Joseph, £1320 on an estimate of £400-600); #160, a collection of c. 560 pls. from, perhaps includ-
man Life, 1819, diced calf rebacked (£38).

Rogers, Poetical Works, 1856. Frew Mackenzie, Nov. cat. 25, #412 (£40).


Thomson, Jahresszahlen, 1796, with a title-page vignette after Stothard. Bas- senge, 15 Nov. auction, #2609 (estimate DM350).


Young, Works, 1813. Hamburger Antiquariat, March cat. 211, #987 (DM750).

VON HOLST, THEODORE

Bertalda Frightened by Appearances. Oil, 79.5 x 61.5 cm. Heim, May-June cat., #142, illus. color (£35,000).

Hero and Leander in a Moonlit Seascape. Oil, 128.5 x 101.5 cm., signed on reverse. Cl. 12 April, #37, illus. color (£3850 on an estimate of £6000-8000).

Appendix: New Information on Blake’s Engravings

16. Samuel Palmer, *Old England’s Sunday Evening*. Water color and body color with scratching out and gum arabic, 30 x 70 cm., signed and dating from 1874. This work strongly resembles Palmer’s etchings of the same period, particularly in the rendering of the sky. Like the prints, this water color harkens back to the work of Palmer’s Shoreham period, but it also marks the difference between recollection and immediacy, between the studied execution and elaborate building up of forms in Palmer’s later work and the spontaneous line and exuberant coloring of his youth. Photo courtesy of Sotheby’s London.

drypoint sketching of the title letters, slightly above and to the right of the engraved forms, as does the fourth-state impression in the Huntington Library. If the drypoint inscriptions distinguishing the fourth state had simply worn away, without purposeful work with a burnisher and/or scraper, these other delicate features would also have worn away or at least shown considerable wear. Thus I conclude that a fifth state was indeed created, although it is possible that someone other than Blake, such as Frederick Tatham, removed the drypoint inscriptions after Blake’s death.

P. 90, a previously unrecorded impression (IB) of “The Chaining of Ore,” now in an anonymous private collection. Wove paper, 17.9 x 12.4 cm. Although somewhat more richly printed than impression IA, the inscribed date is still uncertain (1812 or 1813). Bound into vol. 1 of a copy of Alexander Gilchrist, *Life of William Blake* (1863). Acquired at an unknown time by a British diplomat, Hugh Frazier (or Frazer). Both vols. of the biography were sold to a Venezuelan diplomat in the United States after World War II. Disbound and sold by a member of the Venezuelan diplomat’s family, Sotheby’s New York, 9 May 1991 (see sales review above). Possibly the same as untraced impression 1, lent by Mrs. Gilchrist to the 1880 Boston exhibition and by E. W. Hooper to the 1891 Boston exhibit. Bound into vol. 2 of the 1863 Gilchrist from which this print was extracted is a copy of Horace E. Scudder, “William Blake, Painter and Poet,” *Scribner’s Monthly* 20 (1880): 225-40, a general article that begins with a reference to the 1880 Boston exhibit. See illus. 7.

P. 107, a previously unrecorded impression (2P) of “The Man Sweeping the Interpreter’s Parlour,” second state, now in the possession of the dealer N. W. Lott. Well printed, except for a strip along the left margin, on wove paper, 10.8 x 19.4 cm. For provenance, see “The Chaining of Ore,” above. Disbound from an extra-illustrated copy of Gilchrist’s *Life of Blake* and sold at Sotheby’s New York, 9 May 1991 (see sales review above and illus. 10).

P. 134, “The Fall of Rosamond.” For a previously unrecorded impression showing that the imprint was present in the 1st st., see under *Separate Plates*, above.

Pp. 178-80, “Edmund Pitts, Esq” In “James Earl: American Painter of Loyalists and His Career in England,” *The American Art Journal* 20 no. 4 (1988): 34-58, Robert G. Stewart claims that the “small head” exhibited by “J. Earle” (usually spelled “Earl”) at the Royal Academy in 1787, no. 12, is “thought to be the profile portrait of Edmund Pitts which was engraved by no less an artist than William Blake . . .” (38). No further explanation as to who thinks so or why is given. Keynes, apparently without knowing of the exhibited work, also attributed the design of the plate to the American artist in his separate plates catalogue of 1956 (78), but see p. 180 of my *Separate Plates* catalogue for Keynes’s later and more convincing attribution of the portrait to the surgeon Sir James Earle (1755-1817). In the second state of the plate, "Armig" appears after “Earle,” indicating that the artist was the bearer of a coat of arms. Earle the surgeon was knighted in 1802, whereas the American artist never achieved that distinction.

relief etching of Blake's Virgil illustrations, cuts 2-5, with several significant variations in the postures and clothing of the figures, the arrangement of the sheep, and numerous details. Image 14.2 x 8.5 cm.; single plate mark around all four images, approx. 14.6 x 8.8 cm. Only known impression disbound from an extra-illustrated copy of Gilchrist Life of William Blake (1863) and sold at Sotheby's New York, 9 May 1991, lot 9, printed on a wove sheet 15.8 x 9.9 cm. and with touches of hand tinting in black, illustrated in the catalogue (see sales review above).


William Blake's Commercial Book Illustrations

P. 23, Josephus, Works. A copy now in the RNE collection represents a second issue of The Genuine and Complete Works of Flavius Josephus, datable to c. 1786-87. The title has not yet been changed to The Whole Genuine and Complete Works and lacks the final line on the title page of that issue ("And sold by all other Booksellers in Great Britain"), but does contain the reference to Edward Kimpton and other features of The Whole Genuine and Complete Works title page. These characteristics would seem to place this issue between the A and B issues in Bentley 1977, pp. 585-86. This issue not recorded in Bentley corresponds to the "B" issue in Roger R. Essick and Robert N. Essick, William Blake: Book Illustrator, vol. 2 (Memphis: American Blake Foundation, 1979) 23.

Pp. 25-27, The Protestant's Family Bible. John E. Grant has kindly pointed out to me in correspondence the existence of Grazia Bernini Pezzini, Stefania Massari, and Simonetta Prosperi Valenti Rodinò, Raphael Inventa: Stampe da Raffaello nelle Collezioni dell'Istituto Nazionale per la Grafica (Rome: Quasar, 1985). This volume contains reproductions of the print by Lanfranco and Chapron of Raphael's Bible plus several other series, not mentioned in my entry, which could also have been the basis for Blake's plates: Baldassarre Aloisi Galanini (published 1613), Orazio Borgianni (published 1615), Cesare Fantetti (published 1675), Antoine Aveline (apparently copies of Chapron's plates, first half of the eighteenth century), and Giovanni Ottaviani (published 1776). Grant also suggests that I should have mentioned that the river in Blake's second plate ("Lot's Escape") may have been suggested to him by the two small triangles of water in Raphael's fresco (and in some of the engravings of it) on which Blake's plate is based, and that the entry on this same plate should have mentioned, as related designs, Blake's Night Thoughts water color no. 158 (the title page to Night V) and his tempera of Lot and His Daughters. The Night Thoughts design shows Lot's wife turning to look back at the burning city, but her posture is not clearly related to Raphael's version. The castellated wall in the background of the Night Thoughts illustration may have been influenced by Raphael's similar wall. Lot and His Daughters is of course a different subject and to my eyes shows no compositional relation to Raphael's fresco or Blake's plate based on it. The tempera does picture Lot's wife and a burning city in the distance, but these motifs are standard features of the compositional tradition Blake follows closely—see for example Rubens' version (engraved by Jacob Coelmans, 1702), a large plate of the subject by William Kent (no later than 1748), and many early Bible illustrations in the extra-illustrated Kitto Bible in the Huntington Library.

P. 43, The Original Works of William Hogarth, Blake's engraving of "Beggar's Opera, Act III." I should have recorded the inscriptions on the banner hanging above the stage, "VELUTI IN SPECULUM" (as in a mirror) and "UTILE DULCI" (the useful with the agreeable, from Horace). The crest top center bears the familiar motto of the Order of the Garter, "HONI SOIT QUI MAL Y PENSE" (shame to him who thinks evil).
have pointed out that this portrait of Thomas Alphonso Hayley (1780-1800) illustrates William Hayley's verse "Epistle VI" on the death of his natural son, a student of Flaxman's in the art of sculpture. For a reprinting of this plate in brick red, see Tuer under Letterpress Books with Engravings by and after Blake, above.

Pp. 88-89, Hayley, Life of Cowper, 2nd ed., vol. 2, 1803. I should have pointed out that Blake's pl. 4, the weatherhouse and Cowper's tame hares, is in the 2nd ed. printed, along with its accompanying letterpress text, on the recto of an unnumbered leaf following the blank verso of p. 415. In the 1st ed., the plate and letterpress text are printed on p. 415. The move was necessitated by additions to the text that carry the "Appendix," concluding on p. 414 in the 1st ed., on to p. 415 in the 2nd ed.

P. 89, Hayley, Life of Cowper, pl. 5. "A View of St. Edmund's Chapel" after Francis Stone. In a recently discovered letter to John Johnson of 27 Nov. 1803, Hayley refers to the drawing for that plate. According to Quaritch's catalogue 1150 of October 1991, p. 49, Hayley thanks "Johnny of Norfolk" for his "rapid & kind tho not very masterly experience," but Johnson was not involved in acquiring the drawing for that plate. According to Bentley 1977, p. 956, this reissue consists of remainder sheets of the 1811 edition with new title pages.

Appendix II. False and Conjectural Attributions

P. 122. In his "Introduction" to William Blake, Songs of Innocence and of Experience, ed. Andrew Lincoln, Blake's Illuminated Books, Vol. 2 (London: William Blake Trust/Tate Gallery, 1991) 14, Lincoln states that "early in his [Blake's] professional career he was commissioned to engrave designs for [William Enfield's] The Speaker (c. 1780), . . . and for Mrs [Anna Letitia] Barbauld's Hymns in Prose for Children (1781)." Lincoln has generously informed me in correspondence that this second attribution is an error; there is no evidence that Blake executed or was commissioned to execute plates for the Barbauld volume.

P. 123. Detlef Dörnbecker has pointed out to me that the Neagle who engraved plates for Flaxman's Odyssey designs was James, not "John." "James" appears in the DNB, but all other standard reference works I have consulted, including Redgrave's A Dictionary of Artists of the English School, record "John."

P. 127. Add the following title: Oliver Goldsmith, History of England to the Death of George II, 2 vols., octavo, 1827. According to the c. 1928 "William Blake" catalogue issued by the London bookseller Francis Edwards, Ltd., item 64, this edition contains 37 engravings "sometimes ascribed to Wm. Blake." I have not been able to locate a copy of these volumes but suspect that the attribution has no merit. None of the illustrated editions I have seen contains plates by Blake.

Reviewed by Peter Otto

A part from Kathleen Raine and, perhaps, William Butler Yeats, Blake criticism retains few traces of those energetic and mobile "Spectators" of his work that, Blake assures us, are able to rise from their graves, "meet the Lord in the Air" and "be happy" (VI, E 560). In fact, reading Blake's poems and viewing his graphic productions seems to lead more frequently to the much less apocalyptic discipline of theory: Northrop Frye, Harold Bloom, E. D. Hirsch and, of course, Hazard Adams, have all constructed elaborate theoretical systems in the shadow of their earlier work on Blake. One of the interests of *Antithetical Essays* is that it makes explicit a particular instance of this movement from reading Blake to writing theory: it collects and arranges some of Adams' more recent critical, theoretical, and polemical work in such a way that their relation (and by synecdoche the relation of Adams' entire oeuvre) to his reading of Blake becomes clear. It is almost as if the short essay and occasional address, when read along the grain of a prior engagement with Blake, take on a new identity as sublimated autobiography. The agent for this metamorphosis is the first essay in the collection, "The Dizziness of Freedom; or, Why I Read William Blake," in which Adams proposes not to explicate the text of William Blake, to demonstrate a critical practice, or to treat of literary history, but to witness to my education in his works, to show briefly how it situates me in thinking about literary criticism and theory, and finally how it affects me in the life of teaching. (3)

The first chapter, then, is a witness to the primary experience and subsequent reflection out of which the other essays proceed, a point which is perhaps suggested by the otherwise curious fact that on the contents page the title "Part One" (which contains this single essay) is followed by a zero. (Parts Two and Three do not have a trailing numeral.) The book as a whole moves from recollection to reflection and then, in ever widening circles, from the specializations of criticism through to the more general, ethical, and public responsibilities of teaching.

As witness to his education in Blake, Adams attests to the fact of it taking place but (to my mind regretfully) does not tell us much about the actual experience of reading Blake. Recollection of this primary (and of course ongoing) experience takes up less than a page, and consists of no more than a brief narrative that describes his progression from youthful mystification to mature appreciation. Instead, Adams passes quickly to a summary of what he has found valuable in Blake.

The propositions that are advanced by Adams are no doubt familiar to many readers of this journal. One can find them, in various forms, beneath all of Adams' work (which is, of course, as it should be for a criticism which manages to remain both personal and deeply felt). However, to briefly reiterate the substance of his argument: Adams introduces his readers first to Blake's notion of the contrary, which he understands as a "friendly enemy" to the rigid oppositions of institutional life. Rather than attempting to repress oppositions such as soul/body and object/subject, a contrary redeems them by providing "a context for their appropriate use" (6). For Adams, a contrary is a non-categorical, content-free potentiality which is, at least to some extent, free of or at least other to the political and institutional inertias of the everyday world. It is valuable not in itself but for the "loosening," even iconoclastic, force it exerts when brought into productive (that is to say contrary) interaction with the fixed, for Adams inevitably hierarchical, oppositions of the modern world.

Elsewhere, and particularly in "Canons: Literacy Criteria/Power Criteria," Adams uses a term drawn from Yeats, the "antithetical," to describe a very similar potentiality. The antithetical displaces (and like the contrary "redeems" [6] rather than represses or excludes) hierarchical oppositions by itself forming their productive or authentic contrary. In this movement an at first apparently self-sufficient opposition such as closed/open or institution/individual finds itself displaced and raised to one side of a contrary relation with the antithetical. Blake provides Adams not merely with the experience of contrariety and its analogues, but a set of terms for talking about it.

Adams also draws from Blake an ethic and a view of language. He argues that for Blake the basis of the former is love and mutuality which "is... a going-out from the self to identify with the other" (9). Figures such as Albion, who fear that in love they will lose "selfhood," "subjectivity," and "capacity for mastery" (9), have no notion of the contrary of the opposition between subject and object which is the "idea of identity": "When two things
are identical, they are not the same, they each maintain their own identities but are in a relation of identicality" (10). This sounds a bit like having your cake and eating it too, but nevertheless this relation is for Adams at the "base of Blake's ethic" and, more dramatically, at the heart of tropes (which always "insist on identity") and therefore at the heart of language. Complementing these positions, Adams draws from Blake a view of language as fundamentally expressive, so much so that Adams is able to write that

If the world is the projection of our expression of it, and we are our own acts, as Blake thought (that is, we are what we do), then in some sense the world emanates from us and is, in that sense, identical with us. (10)

Adams immediately qualifies this proposition by admitting that it is in fact "the contrary of equally true propositions that make the world into an object"; but he then qualifies this very different view of language by noting that it is ultimately itself a fiction (see also the discussion of myth and anti-myth on 273-76). As a result, it seems that both sides of the opposition turn out to emanate from the same expressive function of language.

On the evidence of this chapter alone, the "dizziness of freedom" would seem to refer to the vertigo experienced by the self within a space where (precisely because it is literary) economic and political constraints have been relegated to the margins and, in their place, the self feels itself free to posit a world and an identity as an intent of consciousness. Within this space reality and morality, for example, are not externally imposed givens, but are experienced as forms potentially expressive of the self.

The second essay in this collection — "Synecdoche and Method"— extends these views during the course of a reflection on the implications of synecdoche. Steering clear of both marxist and deconstructionist critiques of this trope, Adams distinguishes what he calls Blake's radical and progressive synecdoche from figurative synecdoche ("where the part stands for the whole"); miraculous synecdoche ("the part is invaded by a whole that has emanated or shrunk into it"); closed synecdoche ("both part and whole are spatially considered as fixed in size"); and open synecdoche (which "implies a progressive movement or temporality entirely avoiding any suggestion of completed form"). The Blakean synecdoche "opposes the negations open/closed and miraculous/figurative" (27), loosens the hold of these negations and in this way uncovers their contrary. The radical and progressive synecdoche is "both infinite and bounded, open and closed":

There is a progression, a supplementation, but rather than rolling out into endless night, it returns infinitely to itself, but always in a new and immeasurably greater—or smaller—form. (28)

In place of a simple opposition between openness and closure, or the figurative and the miraculous, this kind of synecdoche inhabits the void between these extremes. If this activity were a function of language, the ferrying to and fro of the radical and progressive synecdoche would be hardly more reassuring than what Adams calls Derrida's open synecdoche, where "the activity is always that of differentiation and dissemination" (27). However, radical and progressive synecdoche turns out to have both boundaries and a center. Rather than displacing the oppositions open/closed and figurative/miraculous, it is a dynamic that unfolds only within the space mapped between them. Moreover, just as contrariety and antitheticality seem to function in large part as levers for opening a vertiginous space in which the self is able to experience its own freedom, so, too, radical and progressive synecdoche finds its center and rationale in the self. If language is fundamentally expressive, then synecdoche is indeed the part which is the whole: radical and progressive synecdoche is that trope which best embodies both the expansive movement from self through creation/emonation to world, and the subsequent contraction from world to the self re-formed by its own creation.

What is perhaps most remarkable about Adams' notions of contrariety, language, the self, and synecdoche is that taken together they describe the form of an apocalyptic and linguistic body. The model for this body is once again drawn from Blake, from the resurrected and expansive bodies described at the end of Jerusalem. Adams is in effect writing (in critical and theoretical discourse) a creation myth which, like Blake's creation myths, strives not to be nostalgic. This apocalyptic body finds its origin not in "a receding then, separate from the present, but a iben-sluumbering now" (43). The movement of radical and progressive synecdoche, with its outer limits defined by the opposition between the whole and the part, and with its center firmly tied to the self, defines this creature's "living" form. One of the many remarkable things about this apocalyptic body is that it is its own creator, its own Adam and, in its alienated or emanated form, it is its own Eve. Despite the linguistic bias of Adams' apocalyptic body, the paradigmatic critique of this kind of "fantasy" is, of course, Mary Shelley's Frankenstein.

One of the strong presences that walk the pages of Antithetical Essays is Kant; indeed, one could, with only a moderate degree of unfairness, note that the paradigm which informs Adams' critical, theoretical, and pedagogical work, and which guides the construction of this apocalyptic body, is strikingly similar to Kant's mathematical sublime. Neil Hertz writes in The End of the Line that the mathematical sublime arises out of sheer cognitive exhaustion, the mind blocked not by the threat of an overwhelming force, but by the fear of losing count or of being reduced to nothing but counting—this and this and this—with no hope of bringing a long series or a vast scattering under some sort of conceptual unity. Kant describes a painful pause—"a momentary checking of the vital powers"—followed by a compensatory positive movement, the mind's exultation in its own rational faculties, in its ability to think a totality that cannot be taken in through the senses.
Or as Adams puts it in “Synecdoche and Method,” “When Immanuel Kant considered the sublime he responded to Edmund Burke’s notion that the sublime was overwhelming by arguing that what we discover ultimately in the sublime is the infinitude of the human mind, by which synecdoche he meant the mind’s satisfaction in discovering its power” (28). Similarly, for Adams the sublime spaces and potentialities of the radical and progressive synecdoche, the contrary and the antithetical (along with Bataille and Blanchot) are exhilarating because they are the flux in which the self discovers “its power.” It is, again, perhaps not unfair to note that there is an uncomfortable degree of congruity between these views and those of “free-market economics.”

The set of terms discussed above are deployed in Antithetical Essays as part of a powerful, sustained, and fascinating intervention in a wide ranging and now long-running debate over the status of the aesthetic. For marxist and new historic critics the aesthetic is a realm in which the poetic image is “able to posit regardless of presence but, by the same token, unable to give a foundation to what it posits except as an intent of consciousness.” For Lacan (along with Bataille and Blanchot) a very similar space is a defence against (and paradoxically an opening to) the absolute master, death.

When juxtaposed with the tragic tone of these reworkings of the Kantian aesthetic, the comic (in the Shakespearean sense of the word) tone of Antithetical Essays is remarkable. Adams always works towards a rational balance and harmony. In “Some Yeatsian Versions of Comedy,” for example, Adams sets himself against the prevailing assumptions in Yeats studies by identifying the comic as “a necessary aspect of Yeats’s art,” the apprehension of which “is necessary to any tragic perception we discover in his oeuvre” (75). Similarly, in “Thinking Cassirer” he notes that one of his aims is to see Cassirer and Heidegger—“concord and discord”—“as a pair never emptied out of time” (220).

The most appropriate model for this balance and harmony often seems to be conversation (a key word in Antithetical Essays), which is imagined as a form in which identity and difference are held in relation (the social form of identity). Moreover, conversation is the vehicle through which reading enters the social and ethical. In opposition to those critics who would see Joyce as the producer of a postmodern, linguistic surface, in the essays on Joyce included in this book Adams tries to move beyond the endless play of difference towards readings that allow the “possibility of conversations about a text” and so towards the experience of “literature as an ethical force in society” (150). In each of these essays the comic is possible precisely because the self (not the bourgeois self but what Adams calls the cultured and social individual) is affirmed as center.

In the essays on education included in the third part of this book (“The Fate of Knowledge,” “Biographia Educations Humanae,” “Humanitas and Academic Politics,” “Neo-Blakean Prolegomena to an Unlikely Academic Structure”), the implicit and explicit ideal is that of “the liberally trained individual,” described at one point as “both an aesthetic and ethical ideal” (254), who is to be formed through exposure to the antithetical found in literature. The antithetical becomes a force essential for any pedagogy which “is based on an ethic that refuses to accept tyranny, particularly intellectual tyranny” (238) because it is antithetical that opposes the hegemony of institutional life and so opens the space in which individuals can construct their own lives. Adams defines this notion of education against “the tremendous pressure to generalize individual imaginative power into the abstract notion of ‘mass man,’ who, once so defined, is beheld as a pawn of historical forces and soon becomes what he beholds in himself” (262). For Adams’ power lies “fundamentally with the individual imaginative acts from which the institution appropriates what it, in its fumbling way, can manage to vulgarize” (17).

Does the presence of the comic in Adams’ work mean that, like Blake’s Spectator, he has managed to leave his grave and be happy, albeit through the back door and hard discipline of theory rather than levitation? I would not for a moment pretend to be qualified to judge; so in place of a categorical decision on this matter, let me just say that as intriguing and important as Adams’ attempt, via Blake, to formulate a positive and comic ethics of reading undoubtedly is, I found Antithetical Essays disappointing. First, despite the use of Blake’s notion of contraries as guiding principle, there is in this volume very little actual engagement with the antagonists that, in the course if reading Antithetical Essays, seem to loom behind every page. Characteristic of Adams’ attitude to his opponents is the rather cavalier reference to Kierkegaard in the first essay:

I intend to express my experience of reading Blake as the dizziness of freedom. The phrase is from Kierkegaard. He identified it with existential anxiety. I don’t, and I’ll come back to that point. (4)

By the end of the essay one understands why Adams doesn’t identify the “dizziness of freedom” as existential anxiety, but Adams does not at any point return to the question of Kierkegaard. Unfortunately, Kierkegaard, present in the title as well as this isolated reference, offers his own interpretation of the apparently autonomous self described by Adams, and it is one that threatens to reframe the self of this essay as belonging to one stage, and an early one at that, in the progression to religious understanding. There is a similar “I don’t” implicit in many of Adams’ remarks about deconstruction, where it is at times as if Derrida were being criticized for a failure of nerve (perhaps even a weakness of the self) in the face of the Kantian sublime. For Adams the contrary is a principle of

Reviewed by Nelson Hilton

As the title allusion suggests, this book contends that Blake and Lawrence were not so much the lovers as the adversaries of their mothers, and that their works fundamentally reflect—as they were fundamentally affected by—this fundamental relationship. The argument assumes the pre-oedipal dynamics of early object-relations—i.e., infant and mothering "object"—as posited initially by Melanie Klein. Almost with birth, according to Klein's model, the incipiently organized infant ego is in effect “split” by distinct relations with “good” and “bad” states which concern primarily the breast as metonym for the all-important experience of nourishment. To conceptualize the “bad,” one must imagine that, from an ostensibly infantile perspective, just as the gratification of a successful feeding represents incorporation of a good object, so the frustration of hunger is by analogy not privation, but the active incorporation of a bad object (a prime example of Freud's idea that the unconscious doesn't recognize "no"). Klein labels this earliest state of a split ego threatened in its fantasy with anxiety over annihilation by the bad object the "paranoid-schizoid position" ("position" rather than "stage") to emphasize that these psychological states are never completely passed, but persist in the unconscious throughout life. Attempting in fantasy to eliminate the bad and save the good within a renewed ego-integration, the infant self resorts to a dynamic of "projective identification" by which it aggressively spits out or projects the internal bad feeling and identifies it with an object, like the ubiquitous breast.

But if reality is at least barely adequate, at the age of three or four months this schizoid adaptation runs into the new perception that good and bad breast belong both to the same "whole object" mommy. In the ensuing "depressive position," the infant begins the life-long attempt to work through ambivalence as it encounters helplessness, jealousy, anxiety that its aggression now could potentially annihilate the object on which it hates to depend,
and, at last, guilt over its aggressive fantasies. With, again, at least barely adequate reality, the depressive position gives rise to dynamics of "reparation" or efforts to spare the object or compensate it for, restore it from earlier fantasized attacks. Creative activity such as art can be seen as the attempt of the later, more coherent ego to make reparation to the archaic internalized object—an activity which, given the always ongoing, co-existing "positions," includes the recurring expression of aggressive fantasies as well.

Ambivalence is thus the hallmark of Melanie Klein's theories and the states they serve to address. And reading Blake with a psychoanalytic understanding of "denial," it is hard not to see his "Definite & Determinate" dicta as covering a fear of the amorphous and ambivalent. So Storch can find in Blake an "urgent concern with concrete containment, working against another set of images that reflect a fear of being contained and a dislike of what seems vague or undefined" (78). Edward Larrissy reaches much the same point in his post-structuralist reading, and suggests "that Blake's firmness is meant to conceal what it in fact reveals: a fear that all firmness, like all definite form, is limiting because it excludes other possible views or forms" (William Blake [Oxford: Blackwell, 1985] 6). It is then an interesting question to what extent "anxiety about the activity of making form in a fallen world" (Larrissy 133) might be correlated with ostensible anxiety about making love on the part of an artist who, reports Storch, "rarely deals with mature adult love, and [whose] male characters are incapable of mature love" (73). If the resolution of ambivalence entails the embrace of limits to reality and expression, perhaps such maturity would be a contradiction in terms for "the greatest radical poet in England" (Larrissy 3). But, having located in Blake "a 'bad' bound and a 'good' bound" (Larrissy 88), it is tempting, certainly, to posit a radical ambivalence relating to primal bonds. Already 25 years ago Beverly Field argued that for Coleridge, as for Blake and Lawrence and Elliot, all women are one woman; it is only their disparate aspects, as projections of his ambivalence, that people the drama of his verse: the women are either "good" mothers or "bad" mothers or involuntary confusions of the two, and their "goodness" or "badness" is always intensified beyond any concern with the representation of reality. (Reality's Dark Dream: Dejection in Coleridge [Inp: Kent State UP, 1967] 64)

Storch believes that "Kleinian theory" has the capacity "to probe the most fundamental layers of the psyche" (xiii), and her concern with the elemental and basic shows up at every turn (emphasis added throughout this paragraph): "The male experience of the female as cold and rationalizing," for example, "is a repetition in the adult sphere of the fundamental pain and fear experienced by the infant at the loss of close sensory contact with the mother" (6); these are related to "fundamental feelings of attachment and dependence" (114) since "the fundamental situation giving rise to anxiety is the mother's withdrawal of nurturance and the infant's own overwhelming feelings of aggression against its mother in a state of frustrated desire" (8). Though art does not "reveal its fundamental impetus so readily," "Kleinian theory... leads us to the truest meaning" (98) and the realization that "creative art is the most genuine and accurate reflection of the inner psyche" (xiv)—though "greater artistic assurance tends to mask the raw state of the feelings" (25). With regard to Blake, Storch sees everywhere, as in Night 7 of The Four Zoas, "the more fundamental power of the mother" (82), and, as in "The Mental Traveller," "the truer and more fundamental infant... full of aggression" (88). All of this works toward the conclusion that Blake "is fundamentally concerned with male well-being; his redeemed people arise in the image of man, within whom the female is safely contained" (66).

Storch introduces what she terms the "mechanism of inversion" (7) as the "fundamental" psychodynamic behind the many conversions and trans-formations of affect that underlie her argument. "Inversion"—which doesn't appear in any of the indexes to Klein's works—appears to be standing in for Klein's key concept of "projective identification," whose importance earns it the lengthiest entry by far in R. D. Hinshelwood's Dictionary of Kleinian Thought (London, 1989). Curiously, even though the term "inversion" is used throughout Storch's book, neither the word nor its cognates appear in the book's index. "Projective identification," on the other hand, does not appear on any of the ten pages indexed for it (including five specified in connection with Klein). Through the operation of "inversion, resentment for the aggressive mother is transformed into the feeling that it is she who is insubstantial and abstract" (7). But, similarly, the infant "inverts the experience [of his hatred] and forms a primitive image of a vengeful maternal superego who inflicts upon him the punitive aggression that matches his own" (47). So, in the Songs, recurrent images of lost children and children suffering parental cruelty "are a reflection not so much of direct cruelty on the part of the parents as of the child's inversion of his own unbearable aggression against them" (25). But given "the fundamental situation" already described, the infant's aggression is itself an inversion of its anxiety over frustrated desire and lack of nurturance. The "inner psyche" which creative art reflects so genuinely and accurately (xiv) dissolves into inversions and their inversions. Just as Storch can find the "apparent meaning" of a novel "inverted" (130), one might be tempted to invert her work and find creative art the "genuine and accurate reflection" of achieved conscious insight.

A book whose subtitle promises to consider "Women in William Blake" and which privileges the poet's early childhood experience confronts a lack of contemporary data for both concerns. So the index gives only two references to "Blake, Catherine," without even specifying whether the woman
in question is Blake’s mother, sister, or wife (the first reference is to the wife, the second to both wife and sister). Reference to the mother who actually did (or didn’t) nourish wee Willy seems limited to the passing statement that she “angrily punished” (11) him for running in & saying that he saw the Prophet Ezekiel under a Tree,” and, oddly, Gilchrist’s account of young Blake’s seeing “a tree filled with angels” and “through his mother’s intercession” being spared “a thrashing from his honest father, for telling a lie” (Bentley, Blake Records 519, 7). Noting in Blake’s work recurrent “groups of three women . . . associated with the Female Will,” Storch contends that “they are a split or disintegrating image of women arising from the dissolution of reality contingent upon the infant’s disappointed urge for union with the good maternal object” (75). But even avoiding parallels with the three Norns, Fates, Graces, Parcae, Weird Sisters, contenders for the judgment of Paris, et al., one might speculate that a man with three significant women in his family drama each named Catherine might particularly be drawn in his identifications with the other sex to a threefold image: female Will(iam)—he Kate, in effect, the triple goddess. In which connection one might note that “inversion” as used by psychologists (more in the past than present) refers to homosexual and assumption of the role of the opposite sex. (Richard Willmott’s recent “Oxford Student Text” edition of the Songs blandly asserts “Blake’s almost ‘feminine’ sympathy with the simple delights of mothers or nurses in young children” [Oxford, 1990] 115).

The possibility of such inversion of sexual roles makes it difficult to hypothesize “the essential nature of Man and Woman” (19), not to mention the nature of the “Women in William Blake.” If “[t]here is a sense in which the categories Male and Female constitute the whole of reality for . . . Blake” (19), as Storch quotes from a 1972 dissertation by Michael G. Ballin, there is another in which this polarization and these categories are so broad—so fundamental—as to be useless. Then too, the interacting complexities of biological sexual difference and cultural gender difference, difficult enough in themselves to formulate synchronically and diachronically, become still more knotted in the case of Will Blake, who writes “For the Sexes” at the same time as he imagines that “Man in the Resurrection changes his Sexual Garments at Will” (61.51—note the capital “W,” not in Erdman, Bentley, or Keynes, but obvious in photographic copies and printed by Sloss and Wallis).

Given the “hint” Storch retrieves from the song about “old corruption” in An Island in the Moon concerning “a phallic mother whose breast appears to the child to be a penis” (33), one might contemplate a reciprocal inversion which would see the more nurturing papa who prompts the hint as a delphic father (Gk. delphus “womb”) whose penis appears a breast. At any rate, meditating on Klein’s “equation breast=penis” (“The Oedipus Complex in the Light of Early Anxieties”) offers an effective introduction to the world of object relations. These possibilities are particularly relevant in reading Milton, whose two designs intimating fellatio (45 and 47 in The Illuminated Blake, noted by W. J. T. Mitchell in 1973) jibe with the poem’s seminal matrix of Ololon as “a sweet River, of milk & liquid pearl” (Storch’s argument suffers from following the 1982 Erdman text which misprints “mild” for “milk”). Storch describes the central theme of Milton as “the son’s assimilation of strength from an ideal father” (157), an assimilation which can entail the fantasy of “phallic union” between the two (166). We might hypothesize further that this split-off idealization is in part a defense against and a compensation for the “loss of close sensory contact with the mother” (5)—as Klein writes, “the father . . . is accused of having taken away [i.e., and possessed himself of] the mother’s breast and the mother” (Emmy and Gratitude, sect. iv). And if this “Maternal Loss” (the “Patterns” of which are the subject of two chapters) could itself be thematized, personified, and consciously recognized by the creative artist for the fantasy, imagination, and solace it can engender, perhaps one would not be surprised to see it called . . . Los. As Storch also says of Milton, “a crucial moment of self-realization for Blake” occurs “when the spirit of Los . . . becomes one with him” (21-22). To transform a sense of loss into “the creative power” (143) would be an inversion fundamental enough to open possibilities of a Maternal Los and a Female Will, a clitoral imagination in Blake’s vision of words, and, finally, a world where “Sexes must vanish & cease / To be. When Albion arises from his dread repose” (J92.13-14).

In its fundamentalizing, categorizing, and essentializing; its recourse to special pleading (see, for example, pertinent Concordance citations against the claim for “[t]he unusual use of the word ‘parent’ . . . to refer to a place” [132]; in its theoretical reconsiderations using schemes where one thing too easily inverts to another; in its lack of hard scholarship (neglecting the colloquial reference of “Old Corruption,” for instance), of textual exactness, and of wide reference to contemporary object-relations theory, this is, as regards Blake, a provoking piece of work. But for the issues it raises and the implications these suggest, Sons and Adversaries is unambivalently provocative indeed.
NEWSLETTER

INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE
AT VICTORIA UNIVERSITY IN
THE UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

THE LEGACY OF
NORTHROP FRYE
29-31 OCTOBER 1992
Friday, 30 October — Afternoon
Conference Session III: Northrop
Frye and Imaginative Literature

Some papers on Blake and related subjects:
Gerald E. Bentley, Jr. (University of
Toronto), “Blake on Frye and Frye on
Blake”; Angela Esterhammer (University
of Western Ontario), “The Constitution
of Blake’s Innocence and Experience”;
Michael Fischer (University of New Mexico),
“Northrop Frye and the Politics of English
Romanticism”; Monika Lee (University of
Western Ontario), “Shelley’s Defence
of Poetry and Northrop Frye: A Theory
of Synchronicity.”

THE NORTHPROP FRYE CENTRE
AND THE FRYE MEDAL

The Northrop Frye Centre officially
opened at Victoria University in
September, 1989. Its aim is to enable
promising scholars to carry out re-
search in the humanities or reflect
upon that work in the spirit of the
tradition of Frye. The Centre offers
small research grants, invites visiting
scholars from abroad, and has begun
to support lecturerships. A selection
committee chooses the projects to be
supported. Send inquiries to the
Northrop Frye Centre, c/o Dr. Eva
Kushner, President, Victoria Univer-
sity, 73 Queen’s Park Crescent, Toron-
to, Ontario M5S 1K7.

A special commemorative medal
cast individually in bronze, silver, ver-
meil or gold, featuring the late
Northrop Frye, by Canada’s foremost
sculptor and medal designer, Dora de
Pédery-Hunt, is now available for pur-
chase for a limited time. Proceeds will
be shared by the Northrop Frye Centre
and Victoria University. Send inquiries
to Frye Medal, Victoria Alumni Office,
150 Charles Street West, Toronto, On-
tario M5S 1K9.

SHELLEY BICENTENARY UNISA
INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE

CALL FOR PAPERS

The Department of English at the
University of South Africa will
hold a three-day international con-
ference from 15 to 17 October 1992 to
mark the bicentenary of the birth of
Percy Bysshe Shelley. The title of the
conference, “The Most Unfailing
Herald,” refers to the role of poetry as
the precursor of enlightenment and
reform. According to the organizers,
there will be scope for those who wish
to relate Shelley’s thought to condi-
tions prevailing in South Africa. Well-
known scholars from overseas will be
participating in the conference. The
conference fee, which includes lunch
and tea, will be R100 (approx. $35) per
delegate. Those interested in deliver-
ing a paper should contact the con-
vener, Dr. Alan Weinberg, at: Dept. of
English, PO Box 392, University of
South Africa, 0001 Pretoria, South
Africa. Tel: (012) 429-6294. Fax: (012)
429-3221.
NORTH AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE STUDY OF ROMANTICISM (NASSR)

A scholarly, interdisciplinary society has been formed to provide a forum for the discussion of romanticism and to encourage a wide variety of approaches to romantic works of all genres. The society plans to hold its first conference, provisionally titled “Romanticism and the Ideology of Genre,” in the spring of 1993. For further information, write to Tilottama Rajan, North American Society for the Study of Romanticism, Dept. of English, University of Western Ontario, London, Ontario, Canada N6A 3K7.

ROMANTICISM ASSOCIATED

In December 1991 a committee met to establish the British Association for Romantic Studies. BARS has now published the second issue of the BARS Bulletin & Review under the editorship of Stephen Copley. The Bulletin does not include complete information about membership, but it contains reviews of recent books, a list of several upcoming conferences, and an editorial on “Romantic Studies” by David Worrall. For information, write to the editor at the School of English, University of Wales College Cardiff, PO Box 94, Cardiff CF1 3XE Wales.

ROMANTICISM & POP CULTURE

David Worrall is organizing a one-day conference on romanticism and popular culture to be held on 5 September 1992 at St. Mary’s College, Strawberry Hill. The format of the conference will be dictated by the papers received. To propose a paper, send a 200-word abstract. The conference fee is £20. To register, send £5 (balance payable on 5 September) to David Worrall, English Department, St. Mary’s College, Waldegrave Road, Strawberry Hill, Twickenham, TW1 4SX England.

CAROLINAS SYMPOSIUM ON BRITISH STUDIES

CALL FOR PAPERS

The nineteenth annual Carolinas Symposium on British Studies will be at Duke University, Durham, North Carolina, on 17 and 18 October 1992. The symposium is an annual forum for exchange of ideas relating to all aspects of British studies, including literature, history, art, architecture, government, pedagogy, dance, and music. While the symposium is regionally based in the Southeast, participants are welcome from all parts of the country. The program committee invites proposals for individual papers, full sessions, and panel discussions. All papers are to take no more than 20 minutes; full sessions are to have either a chairperson and three papers, or a chairperson, two papers, and a commentator. Please mail all proposals or papers by 15 April 1992 to Elgin W. Mellown, English Department, Duke University, Durham NC 22706. All who submit proposals will be notified of the decision of the program committee by early June. The symposium also invites submissions for the Student Session from both graduate and undergraduates. Those interested should write by June 1992 to Sophia Blaydes, English Department, West Virginia University, Morgantown WV 26506.

WILLIAM BLAKE TAROT TRIUMPHS

Ed Buryn, author of Vagabonding in the USA and Vagabonding in Europe & North Africa has “collaborated” with William Blake in the creation of a new Tarot deck, the William Blake Tarot Triumphs. Ed Buryn has collaged together 47 of Blake’s etchings, paintings, and drawings into a ‘what-if’ Blakean Major Arcana Tarot deck. Consisting of 24 oversized cards, and packaged with an interpretative booklet, the William Blake Tarot Triumphs contain the power of Divine Ideas which can be activated within oneself. The result is a unique instrument of personal power that can be used for contemplation, meditation, and divination.

Printed on 5½" x 8½" linen-finish boards in rust-red and deep-blue inks, the cards can be found in some bookstores for $19.95 and are available from the publisher for $22.95; TAROT, PO Box 720, Nevada City CA 95959.