Article
Blake in the Marketplace, 2002
By Robert N. Essick

Minute Particulars
The Sound of "Holy Thursday"
By W. H. Stevenson

Erdman's Pagination of The Four Zoas
By Wayne C. Ripley

Reviews
Kathleen Lundeen, Knight of the Living Dead: William Blake and the Problem of Ontology
Reviewed by Jason Snart

Barbara Lachman, Voices for Catherine Blake: A Gathering
Reviewed by Eugenie R. Freed

Newsletter
Honors; Cambridge Companion to Blake

ADVISORY BOARD
G. E. Bentley, Jr., University of Toronto, retired
Martin Butlin, London
Detlef W. Dörrbecker, University of Trier
Robert N. Essick, University of California, Riverside
Angela Esterhammer, University of Western Ontario
Nelson Hilton, University of Georgia
Anne K. Mellor, University of California, Los Angeles
Joseph Viscomi, University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill
David Worrall, St. Mary's College
CONTRIBUTORS

ROBERT N. ESSICK teaches English literature at the University of California, Riverside. He has been collecting and writing about Blake for over 30 years.

EUGENIE R. FREED is a Research Fellow in English Literature at the School of Languages of the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa. Though her current project concerns women’s writing in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, her interest in Blake is still burning bright.

WAYNE C. RIPLEY is a graduate student at the University of Rochester. He is writing his dissertation on the relationship of The Four Zoas to Edward Young and eighteenth-century religious poetry.

JASON SNART currently teaches English at the College of DuPage in Glen Ellyn, Illinois. His research focuses on William Blake’s marginalia and issues of materiality, textuality, and the history of book production. He has had work on Blake accepted in History of European Ideas, Visible Language, the Huntington Library Quarterly, and European Romantic Review. He has held research fellowships for study at the Huntington Library, the Yale Center for British Art, and at collections in London and Cambridge.

WILLIAM STEVENSON, besides editing Blake: The Complete Poems (Longman: 1971 & 1989) and the Blake selection in the Penguin Classics series, among other things, has taught at universities in three continents, but has now retired from the battlefront. He still cannot escape Blake, and is at present working on a revision of the Complete Poems with the 2007 quarter-millennial anniversary in his sights.

EDITORS

EDITORS: Morris Eaves and Morton D. Paley
BIBLIOGRAPHER: G. E. Bentley, Jr.
REVIEW EDITOR: Nelson Hilton
ASSOCIATE EDITOR FOR GREAT BRITAIN: David Worrall

PRODUCTION OFFICE: Department of English, Morey 410, University of Rochester, Rochester NY 14627-0451
MANAGING EDITOR: Sarah Jones sjns@mail.rochester.edu
TELEPHONE: 585/275-3820 FAX: 585/442-5769

Morton D. Paley, Department of English, University of California, Berkeley CA 94720-1030
Email: mpaley@socrates.berkeley.edu

G. E. Bentley, Jr., 246 MacPherson Avenue, Toronto, Ontario M4V 1A2 Canada.
The University of Toronto declines to forward mail.
Email: GBentley@chass.utoronto.ca

Nelson Hilton, Department of English, University of Georgia, Athens GA 30602
Email: nhilton@english.uga.edu

David Worrall, St. Mary’s College, Strawberry Hill, Waldegrave Road, Twickenham TW1 4SX England
Email: worralld@smuc.ac.uk

INFORMATION

BLAKE/AN ILLUSTRATED QUARTERLY is published under the sponsorship of the Department of English, University of Rochester. Subscriptions are $60 for institutions, $30 for individuals. All subscriptions are by the volume (1 year, 4 issues) and begin with the summer issue. Subscription payments received after the summer issue will be applied to the 4 issues of the current volume. Addresses outside the U.S., Canada, and Mexico require a $10 per volume postal surcharge for surface, and $25 for airmail delivery. Credit card payment is available. Make checks payable to Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly. Address all subscription orders and related communications to Sarah Jones, Blake, Department of English, University of Rochester, Rochester NY 14627-0451. Back issues are available; address Sarah Jones for information on issues and prices, or consult the web site.

MANUSCRIPTS are welcome in either hard copy or electronic form. Send two copies, typed and documented according to forms suggested in The MLA Style Manual, and with pages numbered, to either of the editors: Morris Eaves, Dept. of English, University of Rochester, Rochester NY 14627-0451; Morton D. Paley, Dept. of English, University of California, Berkeley CA 94720-1030. No articles will be returned unless accompanied by a stamped self-addressed envelope. For electronic submissions, you may send a diskette, or you may send your article as an attachment to an email message; please number the pages of electronic submissions. The preferred file format is RTF; other formats are usually acceptable.

© 2003 Copyright Morris Eaves and Morton D. Paley

Cover: Cumea. A copy, attributed to Blake, of Michelangelo’s fresco of the Cumean Sibyl in the Sistine Chapel. Photo courtesy of Sotheby’s London.
Blake in the Marketplace, 2002

BY ROBERT N. ESSICK

This was to be the year of The Grave, but it was not to be. As readers of this journal know, nineteen of Blake's original watercolors illustrating Robert Blair's The Grave, last recorded in an 1836 auction, came to light in the summer of 2001. An article by Martin Butlin, accompanied by four illustrations, announced this remarkable discovery in Blake 35 (2002): 68-73. Further details were provided by G. E. Bentley, Jr., in his annual checklist of publications for 2001 in Blake 36 (2002): 13-16. As I reported in Blake 35 (2002): 111, I was told in December 2001 by Dominic Winter—the British auction firm handling the sale of the designs—that they intended to offer them privately as a group. If that proved unsuccessful, then the water colors would be sold individually at auction, probably no later than fall 2002. Neither event has occurred.

In response to inquiries, Winter reported through the summer and fall of 2002 that negotiations for the sale of all the designs were at a delicate stage and no further information could be released. Rumor in the London art world suggested that the potential purchaser was Tate Britain. By mid-summer, another rumor began to circulate: the water colors were tied up in a dispute over their ownership. The part-time book dealer who brought the drawings to Winter for authentication and possible sale had not purchased them in a Yorkshire auction, as previously reported. Rather, he had evaluated them for their private owner as handmade reproductions, and shortly thereafter purchased them at a correspondingly low price. When the owners learned through press accounts that the water colors were Blake's originals and could be worth millions of pounds, they initiated legal proceedings to procure the return of their treasures.

The essential features of this tale were confirmed for me by two knowledgeable sources, one a leading book dealer in England, the other a curator at a major British art museum. Thus, I was surprised to learn, on 8 January 2003, that Libby Howie, a London art dealer specializing in private sales of very expensive works, had just offered the complete group of Grave water colors to the American private collector who has assembled a remarkable group of illuminated books over the last twenty years. The asking price was $20 million. Howie claimed, in a brief telephone conversation with this collector, that all legal hurdles had been cleared and that she had clear title to the designs.

The final chapter of the Grave saga has not been written. The American collectors contacted by Howie do not intend to purchase the water colors; I suspect that the number of people who would even consider them at such a price is very small (less than one). I hope to report something more definitive in my 2003 sales review.

This sales review is saved from disturbing news and (even worse) triviality by three events. The summer 2000 issue of Blake featured on its cover a rediscovered monochrome wash drawing by Blake, The Resurrection (see illus. 5), accompanied by an article by Martin Butlin ("A Blake Drawing Rediscovered and Redated," Blake 34 [2000]: 22-24). In July 2002, the drawing came to auction at Sotheby's London with an estimate of £20,000-30,000. Although the trumpeter makes the design more dramatic than most of Blake's drawings of the mid-1780s, and the verso bears some sketches related to Blake's 1802 Designs to a Series of Ballads by William Hayley, this seemed to me an optimistic estimate for any early work by Blake. I was proven completely wrong when the drawing was knocked down to the winning bidder at £125,000 (£144,150 inclusive of auctioneer's fees). The purchaser was the venerable London dealer Agnew's, almost certainly acting for a private client. Agnew's has not responded to my inquiries about its customer.

Does this extraordinary price set a new benchmark for Blake's drawings? Sotheby's reproduced the black and gray wash drawing in color on the back cover of its 4 July 2002 catalogue. Even in a highly specialized field of collecting, such advertising can boost prices. I'm told that there were only two contestants beyond £30,000—sufficient to send bidding through the roof; but an insufficient indication that there is a sustainable and widely based market for Blake's lesser drawings at such levels. We will need to see a roughly similar work achieve a similar price to confirm a giant leap in evaluations. But even this single auction can have an impact beyond the realm of wealthy collectors. When an institution borrows works for a public exhibition, it must pay insurance costs during both shipment and display. The coverage is determined by estimated values made by the owner; such estimates are based in large measure on the most recent sales prices of similar works. Blake exhibitions could become prohibitively expensive if insurance premiums rise dramatically.

In September, Alexander Gourlay acquired an impression of a previously unknown print by Thomas Butts, Jr., executed during the period when he was being taught etching and engraving by Blake. A second impression turned up in a dealer's stock in the same month. I report a few details below (second entry under "Interesting Blakeana"); an illustrated essay by Gourlay is forthcoming.

Two water colors (illus. 1 and 3) offered at Sotheby's London on 28 November presented a number of attribution problems. I have not seen the originals, and thus my comments here are based only on color transparencies. But the very nature of these works would create difficulties even for scholars fortunate enough to study them directly. Both are based on famous Renaissance frescoes that have been

116 Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly Spring 2003
1. *Cumea*. A copy, attributed to Blake, of Michelangelo's fresco of the Cumean Sibyl in the Sistine Chapel. Pen and black ink and water colors over pencil, 17 x 12 cm. For discussion and further particulars, see the introductory essay to this sales review. Photo courtesy of Sotheby's London.

Copied countless times by many generations of artists. Thus, since neither work is an original design by Blake, some of the criteria by which one can recognize his hand do not apply. Like most copies, the drawn outlines have a studied quality inherently less autographic than a quick sketch not based closely on a model. Both water colors are copies of works by artists (Raphael, Michelangelo) who greatly influenced Blake. Any such copies will look rather Blakean in figure type, musculature, expression, and compositional format. I'm not sure it has ever happened, but I can imagine a British or American tourist visiting the Sistine Chapel and exclaiming, "Looks like Blake to me."

Sotheby's presented the water colors as works by Blake without hesitation or caveat. I was very skeptical at first sight. Copy drawings are generally associated with the early years of an artist's career, and these two examples fit most comfortably into the context of Blake's work of c. 1779-85. But the rich, dark coloring looked all wrong for that period. The provenance information supplied by Sotheby's was unhelpful: "Acquired by the present owner in circa 1960" for the Raphael copy. No history was provided for the Michelangelo design, but I have learned from Sotheby's that it was brought to them by an Italian living in London, which makes one suspicious that the drawing may also be Italian. Yet, after reading the detailed and scholarly catalogue descriptions and comparing the reproductions to some known works by Blake, my suspicions were reduced.

The obvious touchstones for attributing the copy of Michelangelo's Cumean Sibyl (illus. 1) to Blake are his monochrome wash drawings also based on frescoes of the prophets and sibyls in the Sistine Chapel (Butlin #167 and 168-70 rectos and versos, dated to c. 1785). *Cumea*, at 17 x 12 cm., is only slightly larger than the average of the monochrome drawings (15 x 10.5 cm.). The crudely lettered inscription, "CUMEA," is to my eyes rather like the "DANIEL" inscription beneath that figure (illus. 2), although one could argue that the splayed feet of the "A" in the water color are uncharacteristic. Both inscriptions are loosely based on the lettering beneath the originals and repeated in most engravings of them. In the Daniel drawing, Blake has considerably softened the expression of the putto looking over the prophet's left shoulder. This difference is apparent when comparing Blake's work to either the original fresco or the engravings by Adam Ghisi of 1773, the likely source for...
3. The Judgement of Solomon. A copy, attributed to Blake, of Raphael's fresco in the Vatican. Pen and black ink and water colors, heightened with body color, over pencil, 13.5 x 17.5 cm. For discussion and further particulars, see the introductory essay to this sales review. Photo courtesy of Sotheby’s London.

4. The Making of Magna Charta. Pen and water color, 13.2 x 17.9 cm. Butlin #62, there dated to c. 1779. Essick collection.
Blake's copies. A less dramatic softening is evinced by the putti's faces in the Cumea design. The sibyl's hands in the new design are a bit leaner and more angular in outline than in the original fresco and Ghisi's engraving; this is also generally true for the hands in the wash drawings. The somber coloring is the major difference between the new composition and the previously known copies of Michelangelo. Although it is difficult to tell from a reproduction, there may be monochrome washes underlying the colors in Cumea. If so, then it is possible that Cumea was produced c. 1785 as a monochrome wash with the other copies of Michelangelo and colored in the first half of the 1790s when Blake's palette had shifted to darker hues.

The differences between the prototype and Blake's copy are also helpful in supporting the attribution of The Judgement of Solomon (illus. 3). In Raphael's fresco, Solomon does not hold a staff or scepter. This addition, and the way the staff rests against his body, are generally similar to what we find in the wall paintings of King Sebert and Henry III in Westminster Abbey, both copied by Blake c. 1775 while an apprentice to James Basire (Butlin #16, 17). In all three works, the figure's hand closest to the scepter holds it very gently, even limply, rather than grasping it firmly. The head of the man with white beard and hair, fourth from the right in Blake's version, also strays from Raphael's original, but looks a good deal like the man (a bishop?) on the right in The Making of Magna Charta (illus. 4), one of a series of water colors illustrating British history that Blake executed c. 1779. Perhaps the oddest difference between Blake's copy and the original is the addition of a cloth beneath the child lying on the ground lower center. A very similar cloth appears below the (dead?) child in plate 9 of Blake's Europe a Prophecy (1794).

A two-step chronology of composition again recommends itself for the Solomon design. Its small size (13.5 x 17.5 cm.) fits comfortably within the c. 1779 water colors on British history, all of which are heavily indebted to Raphael for their compositional formats. But the dark, rich, and carefully applied colors in The Judgement of Solomon are much closer to Blake's later (c. 1793?) and larger water colors on British themes, such as The Ordeal of Queen Emma and Edward III Presenting the Black Prince to the Barons (Butlin #59 and 66; see his color reproduction of the former). Yet even these works do not contain body color, a medium used to increase color density and, according to the Sotheby's catalogue, found in the Solomon composition. Perhaps the Solomon was first prepared, and possibly left in an unfinished state, early in the 1780s, when Blake was carefully studying Raphael, and colored up by Blake in the early 1790s. It is also possible that both drawings were left uncolored by Blake and that someone else, such as a member of the Linnell family, added the colors at a much later date.

In my comments above, I have tried to make the best case possible for the ascription of both water colors to Blake's hand. But I still find myself sitting on the fence. An examination of the originals might push me toward a more comfortable position, one closer to Sotheby's cataloguer and the confidence evinced by the winning bids the drawings attracted.

The market in Blake's circle and followers was dominated by George Romney. A major exhibition of his paintings and drawings, accompanied by a handsome and scholarly catalogue by Alex Kidson, opened at the Walker Art Gallery, Liverpool, in February, and later moved to the National Portrait Gallery, London, and the Huntington Library, San Marino, California. Several owners took advantage of what amounted to free advertising and brought their Romneys to auction (see illus. 8). More impressively, Agnew's offered its own exhibition and catalogue of twenty-five Romney drawings in June. Most of the better works were on loan and not for sale. The fifteen drawings on offer had very high sticker prices, as the accounting below indicates.

Readers of the following lists of sales will notice the many references to eBay, the online auction firm. It has now become the major outlet for Blake and Blakeana, ranging from original engravings to postcards. The descriptions of the materials often leave much to be desired, and a good many of the books are stained or damaged. Yet, eBay managed to set what is probably a new auction record for a copy of Flaxman's Hesiod and Aeschylus designs bound together, the former engraved by Blake. One true rarity, the single plate signed by Blake as the engraver in Fenning and Collyer, New System of Geography, 1785-86 (illus. 6), found a buyer on eBay. The auction site can even provide materials for scholarly investigation. The previously unrecorded engraving by Butts, noted above, turned up on eBay, as did an unknown (to me at least) facsimile of Songs of Experience (see under "Interesting Blakeana," below).

The year of all sales and catalogues in the following lists is 2002 unless indicated otherwise. The auction houses add their purchaser's surcharge to the hammer price in their price lists. These net amounts are given here, following the official price lists. The value-added tax levied against the buyer's surcharge in Britain is not included. Late 2002 sales will be covered in the 2003 review. I am grateful for help in compiling this review to Shelley Bennett, G. E. Bentley, Jr., Caroline Bullard, Michael Campbell, Warren Dennis, Jenijoy La Belle, Tim Linnell, Jerome J. McGann, and John Windle. My special thanks go to Alexander Gourlay for his generosity in keeping me abreast of internet auctions. Once again, Sarah Jones' editorial assistance and John Sullivan's electronic imaging have been invaluable.

Spring 2003
Abbreviations

BBA  Bloomsbury Book Auctions, London
cat.  catalogue or sales list issued by a dealer (usually followed by a number or letter designation)
CE  Christie's East, New York
CL  Christie's, London
CNY  Christie's, New York
CSK  Christie's, South Kensington
illus.  the item or part thereof is reproduced in the catalogue
pl(s).  plate(s)
SL  Sotheby's, London
SNY  Sotheby's, New York
st(s).  state(s) of an engraving, etching, or lithograph
Swann  Swann Galleries, auctioneers, New York
#  auction lot or catalogue item number

Illuminated Books

For the Sexes: The Gates of Paradise, copy N (pls. 3-8, 13-15, 17 only) in G. E. Bentley, Jr., Blake Books Supplement (Oxford: Clarendon P, 1995) 78-80. This group of 10 pls., sold at SNY, 9 May 1991, #8 ($115,500), was acquired at the auction by a private American foundation. They were exhibited at the University of Virginia Art Museum, 26 Jan.-31 March 2002. For comments and illus. of pls. 15 and 17, see Blake 25 (1992): 144-46.

Drawings and Paintings

Cumea, a copy of Michelangelo's fresco of the Cumean Sibyl in the Sistine Chapel. Pen and black ink, watercolor, 17 x 12 cm., with a study (medium not described) of one of the Ennudi from the Sistine Chapel on the verso. SL, 28 Nov., #236, recto illus. color (£14,340 on an estimate of £10,000-15,000). See illus. 1 and the discussion in the introductory essay to this sales review.

God Blessing the Seventh Day. Watercolor, 42 x 35.5 cm., datable to c. 1805. Butlin #434. Acquired by early 2002 by Leon Black, New York, through the dealer John and Paul Herring. Rumor in the art trade claims that the price was around £2 million. For illus. and comments, see Blake 34 (2001): 101-02. Black also owns Blake's The Parable of the Wise and Foolish Virgins (Butlin #481).

The Judgement of Solomon, a copy (with variations) of the Vatican fresco of the same subject designed by Raphael. Pen and black ink, watercolor with body color, 13.5 x 17.5 cm. SL, 28 Nov., #235, illus. color (£26,290 on an estimate of £15,000-20,000). See illus. 3 and the discussion in the introductory essay to this sales review.

The Resurrection (recto), with studies of eyes, the head of an eagle, a human face, and a lion (verso). Some of the verso sketches are related to Blake's 1802 Designs to a Series of Ballads by William Hayley. Pen and gray ink, gray wash over pencil (recto), pencil (verso), recto image and sheet 20.5 x 21 cm., recto datable to the mid-1780s. Butlin #610 (listed as untraced since 1863). SL, 5 July, #183, recto and details of the verso illus. color (£144,150 on an estimate of £20,000-30,000 to Agnew's, apparently acting for a private collector). See illus. 5.

The Resurrection of the Dead or The Deluge. Pencil, 18.3 x 24.3 cm., datable to c. 1780-85. Butlin #79. Salander-O'Reilly Galleries, Jan. private offer ($35,000).

Separate Plates and Plates in Series

"Chaucers Canterbury Pilgrims." Maggs Bros., Aug. cat. 1326, #175, 4th st. (1 of 3 recorded), Essick impression 4AA, from the collection of Douglas Cleverdon, left two-thirds of print illus. (£25,000). Donald Heald, Dec. online cat., 5th St., Sessler printing on silk, made into a lampshade and mounted on a neoclassical style lamp, from the collection of Mrs. Charles J. Rosenbloom ($9500); 5th St., Colnaghi printing on laid India, impression 5JJ in Essick, illus. color ($12,000).

"Christ Trampling on Satan," Butts after Blake. Donald Heald, Dec. online cat., printed on paper 54 x 30.5 cm. With a watermark reading "J. Whatman/1886," inscribed by E. J. Shaw, "Proof No 12," impression 1J in Essick, illus. ($3500—a record asking price). This impression has been in Heald's stock for many years.

Dante engravings. Lame Duck Books, April cat. of "Illustrated Books," 4 pls. only as follows, probably from the 1892 printing, all illus. color: #61, pl. 2 ($10,000); #62, pl. 4 ($12,500); #63, pl. 5 ($7500); #64, pl. 3 ($7500). Campbell Fine Art, July private offer, complete set, 1968 printing, sold individually (prices on request). Donald Heald, Dec. online cat., pls. 2 and 4 only on laid India, probably the 1892 printing, illus. ($3000 each).
5. *The Resurrection.* Pen and gray ink, gray wash over pencil, 20.5 x 21 cm. Butlin #610 (listed as untraced since 1863, when it was described by W. M. Rossetti in his catalogue of Blake's art published in Gilchrist's *Life of Blake*). In his 1981 catalogue of Blake's paintings and drawings, Butlin associated this work with Blake's 1805 preparatory designs for Robert Blair's *The Grave*, published in 1808. When the drawing was rediscovered c. 1999, Butlin immediately recognized that this is a work of the mid-1780s, and thus could not be part of the 1805 *Grave* project. In his article on the drawing ("A Blake Drawing Rediscovered and Redated," *Blake* 34 [2000]: 22-24), Butlin states (p. 23) that it "may be linked in subject to two illustrations to *The Grave* not of 1805 but of c. 1780-85," *The Counsellor, King, Warrior, Mother and Child* (Butlin #136) and *Burial Scene* (Butlin #137 recto). He thereby implies that the textual source for the present work is indeed Blair's poem. But I can find no convincing evidence for this source; the drawing reproduced here could just as well be one of Blake's many biblical designs of the 1780s. The work nicely illustrates 1 Corinthians 15:52: "...for the trumpet shall sound, and the dead shall be raised incorruptible, and we shall be changed." The very similar description of the resurrection in *The Grave* (p. 32 of the 1808 edition) is illustrated by Blake's title-page design in the published volume. The whole matter is complicated by the fact that, as part of the 1805 project, Blake recycled some of his earlier designs not originally illustrative of *The Grave*. The title page, for example, is taken from a water color Blake originally executed c. 1795-97 as an illustration to Edward Young's *Night Thoughts* (Night 2, p. 5). Photo courtesy of Sotheby's London.

"Evening Amusement," after Watteau. Hand colored, trimmed close to image. Acquired April by David Bindman from a print stall on Portobello Road, London. The only colored impression known to me.

"The Fall of Rosamond," after Stothard. Campbell Fine Art, Feb. private offer, st. uncertain but probably 1st, color printed in brown and a reddish-brown flesh tone, green and blue washes rather haphazardly applied by hand in the background, cut close to the circular image, framed (£2500).

"George Cumberland's Card." The impression offered CI, 18 Dec. 2001, #83, printed in black ink on wove paper, 6 x 10.8 cm., without watermark, illus. color (not sold), was acquired in Feb. 2002 by the dealer John Windle for stock.

Blair, *The Grave*. Michael Good, Jan. online cat., 1808 quarto, early boards rebacked ($1400). Quaker Hill Books, 1808 folio, some damp staining, three-quarter morocco ($1437.50). Argosy Books, Jan. online cat., 1813 quarto, half morocco worn ($1500). George Robert Minkoff, 1808 quarto, some foxing, early boards worn ($1500). Jeffrey Thomas, Jan. online cat., 1808 "folio" (but probably the quarto), some foxing, original boards (with cover label) rebacked, worn ($1500). Pra Antikvariat, Jan. online cat., 1808 "folio" (but probably the quarto), "half leather" ($2427). George Robert Kane, Jan. online cat., New York undated ed. pub. James Miller, water stained, original cloth worn ($140). James Cummins, Jan. online cat., 1813 quarto, half morocco ($1500). Sims Reed, Jan. online cat., 1808 quarto, modern calf (£1750); same copy and price, Nov. "Nineteenth Century" cat., #45. Peter Stern & Co., Jan. online cat., 1813 quarto, some pls. foxed, contemporary half morocco worn (£1750). eBay online auctions, March, individual pls. from the 1808 quarto as follows, all illus.: pls. 3 ($104.95), 4 ($87.88), 6 ($152.50), 10 ($100.99).

Pacific Book Auction, San Francisco, #23, 1808 quarto, pl. 1 trimmed into image at head and foot, foxed, quarter morocco, frontispiece portrait and pl. 1 illus. (not sold on a brave estimate of $1000-1500). eBay online auction, April, the frontispiece portrait only, Schiavonetti after Phillips, proof before imprint but with all other lettering of the 1808 first published st., the only known impression in this st. (an earlier proof st. before all letters and lacking some work in the image is in the Keynes Collection, Fitzwilliam Museum), sheet of laid paper 40.6 x 28 cm. showing the platemark all around, slight tears and some light staining (offsetting?), illus. color ($455). eBay online auction, April, 1808 quarto, some pls. lightly foxed, original boards worn and rebacked, cover label worn, several illus. (not sold; highest bid $645); same copy, May, illus. ($1250). eBay online auctions, April-May, individual pls. from the 1813 quarto, all illus., as follows: frontispiece portrait ($128.50); pl. 2 (not sold on a required minimum bid of $95, later sold at $45); pl. 3 ($150.27); pl. 4 ($95); pl. 5 ($177.50); pl. 6 ($125.02); pl. 7 ($95); pl. 8 ($95); pl. 10 ($180). SNV, 21 May, #391, 1808 quarto, foaming and staining, contemporary half morocco worn, printed label on front cover, pl. 12 illus. ($1195). eBay online auction, July, 1808 ed., lacking the frontispiece portrait of Blake and pl. 1 (the engraved title page), advertised as the rare "folio" issue but actually the far more common quarto, modern boards, illus. (reserve not met; top bid $720). eBay online auction, Aug., pl. 7 only, stated as coming from a "1911" reprinting (unknown to me) from the original plates, but more probably from the 1926 reprinting, illus. color ($150); pl. 8 only, apparently from the same printing, illus. color (no bids on a required minimum bid of $150). eBay online auction, Aug., pls. 9, 11, and 12 with "1813" imprints, sold separately, illus. ($150, $225, $175 respectively). Swann, 26 Sept., #54, "1813 ... small folio" (actually the 1870 reprint), stained, original cloth very worn (not sold; estimate $800-1200). eBay online auction, Oct., pl. 11 only, 1813 imprint, illus. ($145). John Windle, Oct. cat. for the Boston Book Fair, #7, 1808 quarto, slight staining on some pls., full morocco ($2750); #8, 1813 quarto, half morocco ($2250); #9, 1870 "quarto" (actually a folio), original cloth, hinges repaired ($1750). eBay online auction, Oct.-Nov., 1808 quarto, half morocco (no bids on a required starting bid of $1000). Heritage Book Shop, Nov. private offer, 1870 portfolio of loose pls. complete, original cloth portfolio, spine missing and covers loose ($300).

Boyell, *Graphic Illustrations ... of Shakspeare*, 1803. Charles Agvent, Jan. online cat., contemporary half calf ($3500).

Brown, *Elements of Medicine*, 1795. Simon Finch, Sept. cat., 52, #41, 2 vols., original boards uncut, title page illus. (£750). Only the second copy I have seen on the market in the last 30 years.

Bryant, *New System, ... of Ancient Mythology*, 1775-76. Grant & Shaw, March cat. 54, #11, 2nd ed., 3 vols., suite of pls. (not by Blake or Basire) from the 1807 ed. added, cloth (£325). eBay online auction, Sept., 2nd ed., 3 vols., pls. offset, contemporary calf very worn, illus. (reserve price not met; highest bid $233.50).


Cumberland, *Outlines from the Antients*, 1829. eBay online auctions, Oct.-Nov., Blake's pls. 1-2 (numbered "78" and "79"), illus. ($125.50 each); Blake's pl. 3 (numbered "80"), illus. ($39.95). Howes Bookshop, Nov. cat. 299, #55, Blake's pls. lightly stained with mildew, early (original?) cloth (£275; acquired by the Huntington Library).

Cumberland, *Thoughts on Outline*, 1796. Howard Mott, Jan. cat. 238, no item number, lacking leaf of advertisements, some foxing, uncut in early boards rebacked ($1100).


Fenning and Collyer, *New System of Geography*. eBay online auction, June-July, pl. 2 only, 1st st. from the 1785-86 ed., stained in the margin lower left, illus. color (£360). See illus. 6.

Flaxman, Hesiod designs, 1817. eBay online auction, Feb., spotting and soiling, some paper missing in margins, later cloth worn, leaves loose, illus. (£212.50). eBay online auction, June, pl. 25 only, illus. (£25). eBay online auction, June, bound with Flaxman's Aeschylus designs, 1831, half morocco, illus. (£1000—probably an auction record for these 2 works). Sims Reed, Nov. online cat., slight folds down the centers of the pls., rebound in cloth-backed boards, original cover label retained (£711).


Spring 2003

Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly 123
6. Blake's pl. 2, 1st st., from Daniel Fenning and Joseph Collyer, A New System of Geography, ed. Frederick Hervey (2 vols., 1785-86). 20.5 x 17.5 cm., etched and engraved by Blake after John Webber. Essick collection. This impression sold on eBay, June-July 2002. This is the only time I have seen either of the 2 Blake pls. from Fenning and Collyer on the market; I have never seen a copy of the book for sale. Bentley records 1 copy (British Museum) of the 1785-86 ed. with the 1st st. of pl. 2. In the 2nd st., appearing in the 1787 ed. (3 copies recorded), the single alteration is in the date in the imprint, from 1785 to 1787. Only this plate is signed by Blake; the frontispiece to vol. 1 is attributed to him on the questionable basis of a pencil inscription on a proof in the Balmanno Collection, British Museum.

Scholars interested in Blake's renderings of, and attitudes towards, non-Europeans may find even this minor copy engraving of interest. Webber's portraits of Pacific Islanders were widely known through their publication in James Cook [and James King], A Voyage to the Pacific Ocean (1784). Such images played a role in the British creation of what we now might call "the physiognomy of the Other." There are as well clear resemblances among the "Man of Van Diemen's Land" (lower left) and three of Blake's Visionary Heads: Faulconberg the Bastard, Owen Glendower, and Hotspur (Butlin #730, 743-45). Perhaps the illegitimate son of a king, a Welshman, and a hothead from Northumberland were as foreign to Blake as a Tasmanian.

124 Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly

Spring 2003
Hoare, Inquiry, 1806. Adam Mills, Jan. online cat., contemporary boards with modern calf spine ($400). Swann, 26 Sept., #56, recent quarter cloth ($175).

Hogarth, The Beggar's Opera by Hogarth and Blake, 1965. Oak Knoll Books, March online cat., no item #, with an "added title page leaf and laid-in facsimile," original portfolio ($1000). eBay online auction, Oct., original portfolio in fine condition, several color illus. (a great bargain at $90).


Hunter, Historical Journal, 1793. eBay online auction, April, pl. only, apparently from the quarto issue, illus. (reserve not met; highest bid $128.50).

Josephus, Works, c. 1785-86 and later. Krown & Spellman, Jan. online cat., Bentley's "B" issue or later, several tears and stains, cloth ($850). Escargot Books, Jan. online cat., Bentley's "B" issue or later, calf worn ($650). eBay online auctions, Jan., pl. 1 only, illus. ($135); pl. 1 only, marginal staining, illus. ($125). eBay online auction, Nov., Bentley's "E" issue, some tears in leaves, early calf worn, illus. (reserve price not met; highest bid £156). eBay online auction, Dec., Bentley's "C" issue, contemporary calf rebacked, illus. color ($299).


Rees, Cyclopædia, 1820. George Jeffery, Jan. online cat., vol. 1 of pls. only (containing Blake's pl. 1), some spotting, calf worn, front cover detached (£180). Barter Books, Jan. online cat., 4 vols. of pls. only, 152 pls. missing but perhaps some of Blake's still present, light foxing, no description of binding other than "spines missing" (£780). Naughton Booksellers, Jan. online cat., vol. 3 of the pls. only (containing Blake's pl. 3), some staining, half calf worn, spine missing (£275). eBay online auctions, Oct., pls. 1, 4-7 only, sold individually, illus. ($49.95 each).


Salzmann, Elements of Morality, 1791. eBay online auction, Feb., complete pls. only, all 1st st., a few trimmed, mounted in a morocco album, 1 pl. illus. ($676).

Seally and Lyons, *Complete Geographical Dictionary*, c. 1784. eBay online auctions, June, pl. 1 only, 1st st. ($128.50); pl. 3 only, 1st st. ($198.50). eBay online auctions, Oct., pls. 1 and 2 only, sold individually, both 3rd st., illus. ($49.95 each).


Stedman, *Narrative*, 1796, colored copies. SL, 8 May, #292, 2 vols., minor browning, contemporary half calf, joints repaired, pl. 12 illus. color (£5258). SNY, 20 May, #347, 2 vols., minor browning, contemporary Russia (£5975); same copy, Heritage Book Shop, Nov. private offer ($12,500). CSK, 22 Nov., #382, 35 pls. only, apparently disbound, including some by Blake, hand colored (not sold; estimate £600-800).


Stuart and Revett, *Antiquities of Athens*. Sims Reed, Jan. online cat., 5 vols. in 3, 1762-1830, contemporary Russia (vols. 1-2) and modern calf (vol. 3) (£18,000). CL, 13 June, #119, 4 vols., 1762-1818, some browning, early 19th-century morocco, from Beriah Bottfield's Library at Longleat House (£21,510 on an estimate of £7000-10,000). CL, 19 Nov., #49, 5 vols., 1762-1830, some spotting, contemporary Russia, from the collection of Lord Wraxall (£11,352).

Varley, *Treatise on Zodiacal Physiognomy*, 1828. SL, 12 Dec., #246, modern half morocco, original wrappers bound in (£2032 on an estimate of £500-700 to Arthur Freeman, possibly bidding for an institution). The first complete copy to appear on the market in many years.

Virgil, *Pastorals*, 1821. eBay online auction, March, pl. 25 ("The Giant Polyphemus," delineated by Blake after Poussin) only, illus. (£39). Justin Schiller, March cat. 50, #73, 2 vols., labels on inside front covers of both vols. recording the presentation of the book on 6 May 1822 (recipient's name erased, but probably a student at St. Paul's School), contemporary calf, apparently a presentation binding for St. Paul's School, 4 wood engravings and binding illus. color (£6550 — a record asking price for the work). The Schiller copy was previously sold CNY, 10 Dec. 1999, #110 ($18,400 to the London dealer Simon Finch); offered by Finch, Feb. 2000 Los Angeles Book Fair ($21,000; acquired by Schiller). For further comments on the binding, see Blake 34 (2001): 107-08. Fine Art Society, handlist for the June-July "Pastoral" exhibit, #1, Blake's 17 original wood engravings, Linnell impressions on thin paper, from the collection of Frank Rinder, previously sold CL, 30 Nov. 1993, #6, for £4600 (£20,000). John Windle, Oct. cat. for the Boston Book Fair, #11, 2 vols., modern calf (£22,500).


*The Wit's Magazine*, 1784. eBay online auction, May, pl. 2 (2nd version of "The Temple of Mirth") only, light stains, illus. color (£160.27).


Young, *Night Thoughts*, 1797, uncolored copies. William Reese, Jan. online cat., lacking the "Explanation" leaf, 1st st. of the fly-title to Night the Second, early 20th-century three-quarter calf (£6500); same copy and price, Feb. Los Angeles Book Fair. John Windle, Jan. online cat., with the "Explanation" leaf, 2 pls. before imprints, all but top edge uncut, later full morocco, hinges repaired (£8750); same copy and price, Feb. Los Angeles Book Fair (sold to a French book dealer). Heritage Book Shop, Jan. online cat., with the "Explanation" leaf, all but the top edge uncut, half mo-
rocco repaired ($10,000). FineArt, Jan. online cat., lacking the “Explanation” leaf, foxing and browning, contemporary morocco ($10,300). Phillip Pirages, Jan. online cat., with the “Explanation” leaf, contemporary morocco ($19,500). eBay online auction, Oct.-Nov., with the “Explanation” leaf, slight staining, “morocco and cloth boards,” top edge gilt (reserve price not met; top bid $1025).

Interesting Blakeana

Zodiacus Medico-Gallicus, vols. 1-3, Geneva, 1680-82. eBay online auction, Feb., bearing the initials "WB" in ink in an unstated location, old calf rebacked, several illus. including the initials ($995). I very much doubt that the initials are those of William Blake, poet and artist.

T. Butts, Jr. “Man on a Drinking Horse,” etching/engraving signed “T Butts: sc” and dated “22 Jany 1806,” platemark 5.1 x 8.7 cm., said in the eBay listing (see below) to have been printed in an ed. of 250 in the 1920s by the Miniature Print Society of Kansas City, Missouri, from the original copperplate donated by “Colonel W. R. Moss” (possibly an error for the British Blake collector Lt.-Col. W. E. Moss) to the Nelson-Atkins Museum of Kansas City. eBay online auction, Sept., illus. ($4.99; acquired by Alexander Gourlay).


W. Hayley, Memoirs of the Life and Writings, 1823. Adam Mills, Jan. online cat., 2 vols., later half calf (£300). Contains important contemporary references to Blake.

R. Watt, Bibliotheca Britannica, 1824. BBA, 17 Oct., #253, 4 vols., later morocco-backed cloth (£55). One of the few bibliographies published in Blake’s lifetime to include a brief, highly selective list of his works.


J. and A. Taylor, City Scenes, 1828. Hollett and Son, July cat., #272, original cloth rebacked (£450). Contains Blake’s “Holy Thursday” from Songs of Innocence, illustrated with an engraving which, although showing the children being led out of the church by beadles, is not directly related to Blake’s design.


Catalogue of the Printed Books and Manuscripts Bequeathed by Francis Douce, Esq. to the Bodleian Library, 1840. Scott Brinded, Jan. cat. 24, #171, recent cloth (£260). The bequest included copies of The Book of Thel, A Descriptive Catalogue, and Designs to a Series of Ballads, Written by William Hayley (front matter and Ballad 1 only). One of the earlier collection cats. to include Blake material.


J. T. Smith, A Book for a Rainy Day, 3rd ed., 1861. Steven Ferdinand, Jan. online cat., publisher’s cloth worn (£45). A surprisingly rare book, even in its 3rd ed., with a recollection of having “often heard him [Blake] read and sing several of his poems” (83). In a footnote on the same page, Smith claims that Blake took “very few impressions from the plates [of his “works”—presumably meaning his illuminated books] before they were rubbed out to enable him to use them for other subjects.” This seems unlikely, given the nature of relief etching, but might account for the absence of late printings of a few illuminated books (e.g., no copies of The Song of Los, The Book of Los, and The Book of Ahania—the latter two etched in intaglio and thus more easily “rubbed out”—after the first and only printings of 1795).
7. Blake, *Songs of Innocence and of Experience*, William Pickering ed., 1839. Essick collection. Pp. 22-23, the third through the sixth stanzas of "Night." The upper pencil annotation on p. 22 ("sit down by") is in the handwriting of William Michael Rossetti; it correctly restores the reading to Blake's etched text. This and other annotations by W. M. Rossetti were very probably made in preparation for his 1874 *Poetical Works of William Blake*. That edition, and its many reprints, follow this emendation. Several of W. M. Rossetti's other annotations throughout this volume also accord with his 1874 edition, even in those cases where his emended readings are not authorial. For example, in "A Cradle Song," both Rossetti's annotation in this volume and his edition change "While o'er thee thy mother weep" (Pickering ed. and Blake's etched text) to "While o'er thee doth mother weep."

The pencil annotations lower on p. 22 and the two nearest to the top of p. 23 are in a second hand. Jerome J. McGann has confidently identified this hand as Dante Gabriel Rossetti's (private communication, 23 July 2002). None of these annotations is followed in the 1874 edition. But the final pencil annotation on p. 23, changing "name" to "mane," follows Blake's etched text and accords with the 1874 edition. This may look like a third hand, but McGann has also identified it, with less confidence, as D. G. Rossetti's.

T. Taylor, *Handbook of the Pictures in the International Exhibition of 1862*. Charles Wood Bookseller, Feb. cat. 111, #90, original printed wrappers worn, back wrapper missing ($175). Pre-Gilchrist (by 1 year) comments on the art of Blake and his circle, pp. 72-77. “Blake’s works present a marked contrast to Fuseli’s, though they are just as much beyond the pale of good art” (74).


J. Smetham (1821-89), *“Piping Down the Valleys [sic] Wild.”* A water color, 6.1 x 17.2 cm., illustrating (or at least inspired by) the opening line of Blake’s “Introduction” to *Songs of Innocence*. Signed and inscribed with the title. Agnew’s, Feb.-March “Watercolours & Drawings” cat., #94, illus. color (£2250).

Blake, *Jerusalem*, Pearson facsimile, 1877. eBay online auction, Nov., some soiling in margins, ex-library copy, later cloth, illus. color (spirited bidding to $511).

W. Muir facsimiles of Blake’s illuminated books. Swann, 18 April, #20, *America*, 1887, hand-colored copy, modern half calf, Muir’s copy number not recorded, probably because the original wrappers were not preserved ($3680). SNY, 21 May, #390, *Songs of Experience*, 1885, Muir’s copy number 47, quarter morocco, original wrappers bound in, “The Fly” illus. color ($1434); same copy, James Cummins, Nov. cat. 82, #7, general title page illus. ($2500). eBay online auction, July, *Visions of the Daughters of Albion*, 1884, 1 of only 7 copies on “Antique Note” paper (according to a note by Muir with this copy), some marginal foxing, original wrappers rather cockled with “Academy” (probably meaning a review copy sent to the journal of that name) written where the copy number should appear, later paper slipcase (reserve not met; top bid $965). Blackwell’s, Sept. “Summer Miscellany,” #70, *The Marriage of Heaven and Hell*, 1885, “12 etchings by Schiavonetti [sic] from designs by Blake tipped to blank leaves at end” (apparently the illus. to Blair’s *Grave*, Schiavonetti after Blake), foiled, quarter morocco, original wrappers apparently not retained (£320).

Blake, *Songs of Experience* (late 19th or early 20th century?). 27 pls. in hand-colored facsimile of the *Experience* section of *Songs of Innocence and of Experience* copy T in the British Museum, plus “A Divine Image” and a list of the poems included. Apparently bound in blue paper wrappers, similar to those used in the Muir facsimiles. eBay online auction, Oct., all pls. illus. color (highest bid $2100 but withdrawn after about 24 hours). This work does not correspond to any published facsimile known to me. I could not tell from the illus. if there was any printed base, but I suspect not. If completely hand drawn and colored, this might be the one-off production of a talented amateur, possibly someone in the Muir circle of facsimilists. The book was offered again on eBay in Nov., with an equally rambling and annoyingly uninformative description and the same illus. (reserve price not met; highest bid $2950).

Frederick Keppel & Co., New York, *Catalogue of an Exhibition of Drawings & Sketches by Turner Gainsborough Blake and other Contemporary English Masters*, 1892. R. W. Smith, Jan. online cat. ($25). This small exhibition handlist includes 50 drawings and water colors attributed to Blake, plus 8 of Schiavonetti’s engravings of Blake’s illustrations for Blair’s *The Grave* (1808) and 2 pls. engraved by Blake for Hayley’s *Life of Cowper* (1803-04). All 40 drawings from the collection of Dr. Charles E. West are so-called “Camden Hotten forgeries” originally executed as part of a facsimile project by Henry Bellars. Not in Bentley or Butlin (because none of the drawings is genuine?).


“Crimson Joy” (see Blake’s “The Sick Rose,” line 6). Lipstick (3.2 grams, chemical analysis pending) issued spring 2002 by L’Oreal of Paris. Housed in a gold-colored plastic cylinder, 7.5 cm. long, 1.8 cm. diameter. The closest color match for this dark red lipstick with the Pantone Matching System is no. 209C (14 parts ruby red, 2 parts yellow, 4 parts black). Long’s Drugs, Santa Barbara, California, May private offer ($9.69; acquired by J. La Belle for $2 less with a manufacturer’s coupon). Reportedly available worldwide at better drugstores.

**Blake’s Circle and Followers**

Works are listed under artists’ names in the following order: paintings and drawings sold in groups, single paintings and drawings, letters and manuscripts, separate plates, books by (or with plates by or after) the artist.
BARRY, JAMES

Study for "The Glorious Sextumvirate." Pen and ink on blue paper, 57.5 x 43.2 cm. Agnew's, Feb.-March "Watercolours & Drawings" cat., #6, illus. color (£15,000).


CALVERT, EDWARD


The Carfax portfolio of Calvert's engravings and lithographs, 1904. Fine Art Society; handlist for the June-July "Pastoral" exhibit, #4, original wrappers (£25,000).

"The Bride," engraving. Fine Art Society; handlist for the June-July "Pastoral" exhibit, #5 (but #6 on the price list), from the Memoir, 1893 (£3250).

"The Chamber Idyll," wood engraving. Fine Art Society; handlist for the June-July "Pastoral" exhibit, #6 (but #5 on the price list), from the Carfax portfolio ("sold").

FLAXMAN, JOHN

Two Women with a Young Child. Pen and ink with gray washes over pencil, 15.5 x 18 cm. SL, 4 July, #184, illus. color (£2151).

Portrait of Flaxman, engraved by Woodman after Jackson. eBay online auction, Jan., illus. ($15.49).

Aeschylus designs, 1795. Joslin Hall, Jan. online cat., lacking 7 pls., foxed, boards worn ($125). Unsworths Booksellers, March cat. 6, #2, the 31 pls. bound in a copy of Aeschylus, Tragedies, Foulis Press, 1795, foxed, later half calf, 1 pl. illus. (£2300).


Flaxman, Anatomical Studies, 1833. Lucienne Elshout, Jan. online cat., original cloth worn, repaired with tape ($250).


Flora Surrounded by the Four Elements, a drawing for the frontispiece to Darwin's Botanic Garden, 1791, engraved by...
A. Smith. Pencil, 23.8 x 18.2 cm. oval. Lowell Libson, May cat. of “British Master Drawings,” #14, illus. color ($42,000).

**Portrait of Martha Hess.** Pencil, 40 x 23 cm. Thomas Le Chaire, March private offer (price on request). For color illus., see *The Burlington Magazine* 144 (March 2002): xxiii and *Apollo* 155 (March 2002): 9.

**Romeo and Juliet** (the balcony scene). Oil, 141 x 111 cm. SL, 21 March, #48, illus. color (£35,000).


**Bell’s British Theatre,** 1791-97. Hartfield Books, April cat. 60, #21, 28 vols., large-paper issue said to contain “proof” impressions of the pls., contemporary calf worn (£1500).


Boothby, *Sorrows Sacred to the Memory of Penelope,* 1796. Stuart Bennett, April cat. 38, #17, minor spotting, contemporary half sheep worn, pl. after Fuseli illus. ($350).


Lavater, *Essai sur la Physiognomie,* 1782-83. ebay online auction, June-July, 8 pls. after Fuseli sold individually, illus. (price range $19.99 to $127.50).


Young, *Catalogue of the ... Collection of ... Angerstein,* 1823. ebay online auction, July-Aug., outline engraving of Fuseli’s *The Deluge* only, illus. ($8.95). R. G. Watkins, Oct. cat. 49, #91, large-paper issue, lacking 1 pl. after Rembrandt, half calf rebacked (£100).

**LINNELL, JOHN**

**An Apple Tree.** Water color, 14.6 x 10.2 cm., signed with initials and dated 1811. CL, 6 June, #54, illus. color (£21,510 on an estimate of £8000-12,000).

**The Dusty Road.** Oil, 71 x 99 cm., signed and dated 1869/72. SL, 19 Dec. 2001, #14, illus. color (not sold; estimate £6000-8000).

**LINNELL, JOHN**

An Apple Tree. Water color, 14.6 x 10.2 cm., signed with initials and dated 1811. CL, 6 June, #54, illus. color (£21,510 on an estimate of £8000-12,000).

The Dusty Road. Oil, 71 x 99 cm., signed and dated 1869/72. SL, 19 Dec. 2001, #14, illus. color (not sold; estimate £6000-8000).
A Farmhouse at Shoreham. Pen and brown wash, 20.3 x 32.3 cm., datable to c. 1830. Lowell Libson, May cat. of "British Master Drawings," #22, illus. color ("sold"). One of those rare drawings by Linnell that shows Palmer's influence during the Shoreham period.

Finchley Common. Black and white chalk on blue paper, 23.2 x 33 cm., inscribed "Finchley common 1805. J. Linnell." CL, 21 Nov., #30, illus. color (£3585).

The Ford. Oil, 45.7 x 61 cm., signed and dated 1872. Christopher Scott auction, Yarmouth, 19 Jan., #154 (£5,250).

Ivy Cottage, Shoreham. Water color, 15 x 19.5 cm. SL, 21 March, #211, illus. color (£4080 on an estimate of £600-800).

Kensington Gravel Pits. Oil, 25 x 39 cm., signed and dated 1857. CL, 26 Nov., #64, illus. color (not sold on a modest estimate of £12,000-18,000).

Kensington Gravel Pits. Oil, 14 x 22.9 cm., dated to c. 1811-12. CL, 26 Nov., #71, illus. color (£10,157 on an estimate of only £2000-3000).

Lakeland Scenes, 3 signed pencil and chalk drawings, 1 with water colors, sizes not given, datable to c. 1817. G. A. Key auction, Aylsham, Norfolk, 14 Dec. 2001, #290 (£246).

A Moonlit Landscape, attributed (rather hopefully) to Linnell. Brown ink and brown wash, 23 x 31 cm. SL, 28 Nov., #224, illus. color (not sold; estimate £800-1200).

Portrait of Jane Puxley. Oil, 90 x 70 cm., signed and dated 1826. SL, 21 March, #40, illus. color (£12,575).

Portrait of Miss Puxley. Oil, 90 x 70 cm., signed and dated 1826. SL, 21 March, #41, illus. color (£10,800).

Portrait of Mrs. Henry Stephen. Oil, 26.5 x 21.3 cm., signed and dated 1830. CL, 26 Nov., #49, illus. color (£4182).

Reverend Edward Bury. Pencil heightened with white on buff paper, 24.7 x 15.2 cm., signed "J Linnell." CL, 21 Nov., #33, illus. color (£1314).

Studies of a Donkey. Pencil, 11 x 17.5 cm., signed and dated 1824. Bonham's auction, 24 Sept., #66, illus. (£500).

Study of the Sun Setting over the Sea. Water color, 6.7 x 11 cm. SL, 21 March, #209, illus. color (£4320 on an estimate of £1500-2000).


A Wooded Landscape with Herdsmen and Cattle. Oil, 20.5 x 13.9 cm., dated to 1828. CL, 26 Nov., #72, illus. color (£4541).

"The Nest," engraving by Cousen after Linnell, 1873. eBay online auction, May, illus. ($13.50).


"Sheep at Noon," etching. Weston Gallery, Sept. online cat. 3, with the imprint, laid India, illus. (£1300).


MORTIMER, JOHN HAMILTON

"Banditti Regaling," etching, Ireland after Mortimer, 1785. eBay online auction, April, printed in brown, illus. color (no bids on a required starting bid of $99.95).

"Banditti Returning," etching, Blyth after Mortimer, 1780. eBay online auction, April, printed in brown, illus. color ($99.95).

"Man Struggling with Monster," etching, Blyth after Mortimer, 1805. eBay online auction, May, illus. color ($99.95).


"Reposo," etching. BBA, 18 July, #110, with "A Captain of Banditti and His Family," Ireland after Mortimer, "Silenus" and "Enjoying Domestic Happiness," 2 pls. by Blyth after Mortimer, all with some damage (not sold; estimate £80-120).

Shakespeare Character Heads. Michael Finney Books & Prints, May online cat., 8 heads, cut close and remargined, probably Palser printings, 2 illus. (1 at £200, 7 at £220 each).

PALMER, SAMUEL

A Bridge over a Stream, attributed to Palmer. Water color, 15.5 x 16.6 cm. SL, 28 Nov., #336, illus. color (£1434).

A Cliff Top View in Cornwall. Black chalk, 10.4 x 17.4 cm., datable to 1858. CL, 6 June, #60, illus. color (not sold on an estimate of £5000-7000).

In Cusop Brook near Hay-on-Wye, Wales. Water color, 18.5 x 27.5 cm., dated 1837. SL, 21 March, #193, illus. color (£25,800).

The Monastery, Corpo di Cava, Looking towards Paestum. Water color, 27 x 38 cm., datable to c. 1837-39. SL, 21 March, #195, illus. color (£12,000).

The Porta di Posillipo and the Bay of Baiae, Italy—with Ischia and the Promontory of Misenum. Water color and body color, 19 x 41 cm., datable to 1845. SL, 28 Nov., #269, illus. color (not sold; estimate £10,000-15,000).

Sunrise over the Sea, Cornwall. Water color, 13 x 18 cm., datable to 1848. SL, 21 March, #208, illus. color (£6600).

La Vocatella near Corpo di Cava in the Neighbourhood of Salerno and Naples. Water color, 27.3 x 37.8 cm., datable to 1838. Agnew's, Feb.-March “Watercolours & Drawings” cat., #53, illus. color (£30,000).

A Windmill near Pulborough, West Sussex. Water color, 12 x 16.3 cm., datable to c. 1851. CL, 21 Nov., #31, illus. color (£6572).


Figure Studies. Brown ink, 28 x 17.8 cm. Abbott and Holder, June cat. 347, #98 (£225).

Spring 2003
A Heavily Bearded Man. Black chalk, 20.3 x 12.7 cm. Abbott and Holder, March cat. 345, #95 (£250).

Mother and Child. Pencil, 22.9 x 17.8 cm. Abbott and Holder, June cat. 347, #100 (£125).

Mr. Haydn, a Recollection from Nature. Pencil, pen and ink, heightened with white, 22.9 x 15.3 cm., signed and dated to 1831. Abbott and Holder, June cat. 347, #99 (£850).

Self Portrait. Oil, 60 x 49.5 cm. SL, 28 Nov., #191, illus. color (£26,290 on an estimate of £8000-12,000).

Study of Julia Tatham, Aged 13. Black, white, and red chalk, 15.5 x 11.5 cm., another sketch of the sitter on the verso. SL, 21 March, #109, illus. color (£3360).

Study of a Shepherd; Study of a Child. 2 pen and brown ink sketches on 2 sheets, 1 with verso study of a sleeping woman, 15 x 10 cm. and 17 x 11 cm., signed. SL, 21 March, #219, Study of a Child illus. color (£1800).

"The Fatal Bellman," engraving. Fine Art Society, handlist for the June-July "Pastoral" exhibit, #3, black ink on laid India, from the collection of Mrs. John Richmond (£7500).

"The Shepherd," engraving. Fine Art Society, handlist for the June-July "Pastoral" exhibit, #2, black ink on laid India, from the collection of Mrs. John Richmond (£15,000).

ROMNEY, GEORGE

Romney Drawings, exhibition and cat., Agnew's, June. In part a loan exhibition, but the following lots (all illus. color) were for sale: #2, Study of a Naval Officer, 41.6 x 28 cm. (£25,000); #3, Two Young Children Seated, 28.6 x 46.4 cm. (£35,000); #4, Study of a Woman Sitting on the Ground, 30.5 x 29.2 cm. (£25,000); #7, Study of Ann Parry, 23.5 x 17.6 cm. (£15,000); #8, A Mother and Child, 27.8 x 20.7 cm. (£25,000); #10, Study of Captives in a Prison, 34.8 x 49.5 cm. (£35,000); #11, John Howard Visiting a Prison or Lazaretto, 14 x 22.8 cm. (£5000); #12, Macbeth Confronts Banquo's Ghost, 32.7 x 49.5 cm. (£20,000); #14, Viola Surviving Shipwreck, from Twelfth Night, 29.9 x 48.9 cm. (£25,000); #15, Satan, Sin and Death, 15.6 x 19.3 cm. (£5000); #17, Figures Gathered around the Bed of a Dying Woman, 17.5 x 25.1 cm. (£15,000); #18, Figures Gathered round a Woman on Her Deathbed, 17.8 x 24.5 cm. (£15,000); #19, Figures Grieving round the Bed of a Dead Woman, 10.8 x 18.1 cm. (£12,000); #22, The Destruction of Niobe's Children, 48.5 x 69.2 cm. (£20,000); #24, Two Mythological Figure Studies, 20.7 x 32.4 cm. (£12,500). #2, 3, 4, 8, 10, brown ink over pencil; #7, 11, 15, pencil; #12, pen and ink and ink wash; #14, 22, pencil and black chalk; #17, 18, brown ink and brown and gray wash; #19, brown ink and brown wash; #24, pen and ink.

Eve Expelled from the Garden. Black chalk heightened with white, 22.9 x 17.8 cm. Abbott and Holder, Jan. online cat. 344, #75 (£250).

Iphigenia Waking. Pencil, pen, black and gray wash, 38.9 x 51 cm. Datable to the early 1780s. Apparently based on an incident in the story of Cimon and Iphigenia in Boccaccio's Decameron, 5th day, novel 1. When Iphigenia awakes from her woodland slumber, she is surprised to find Cimon watching her and she begins to fear that he will violate her honor. Romney's large and vigorous drawings picturing young women under duress may have influenced Blake's writings on similar themes, including the "Little Girl Lost" and "Found" poems (Songs of Innocence, 1789), The Book of Thel (1789), and Visions of the Daughters of Albion (1793). For discussion and illustrations, see Jean Hagstrum, "Romney and Blake: Gifts of Grace and Terror," Blake in His Time, ed. Robert N. Essick and Donald Pearce (Bloomington and London: Indiana UP, 1978) 201-12. Photo courtesy of Christie's London.

8. George Romney, Iphigenia Waking. Pencil, pen, black and gray wash, 38.9 x 51 cm. Datable to the early 1780s. Apparently based on an incident in the story of Cimon and Iphigenia in Boccaccio's Decameron, 5th day, novel 1. When Iphigenia awakes from her woodland slumber, she is surprised to find Cimon watching her and she begins to fear that he will violate her honor. Romney's large and vigorous drawings picturing young women under duress may have influenced Blake's writings on similar themes, including the "Little Girl Lost" and "Found" poems (Songs of Innocence, 1789), The Book of Thel (1789), and Visions of the Daughters of Albion (1793). For discussion and illustrations, see Jean Hagstrum, "Romney and Blake: Gifts of Grace and Terror," Blake in His Time, ed. Robert N. Essick and Donald Pearce (Bloomington and London: Indiana UP, 1978) 201-12. Photo courtesy of Christie's London.

Iphigenia Waking. Pencil, pen, black and gray wash, 38.9 x 51 cm. CL, 6 June, #16, illus. color (not sold on an estimate of £15,000-20,000). See illus. 8.

Milton and His Daughters. Oil study, unfinished, 62.8 x 76.2 cm., datable to c. 1791-92. Lowell Libson, May cat. of "British Master Drawings," #8 ($120,000). For a color illus., see The Burlington Magazine 144 (March 2002): xvii.

Serena, based on the character in Hayley's The Triumphs of Temper, with other figures on the verso. Pencil, 33.6 x 26 cm. CL, 21 Nov., #3, illus. color (£4541).
Study of a Lady Sewing and Study of Lady Macbeth (2 sheets). Pencil, 17.2 x 11.5 cm. and 15.8 x 13.4 cm. CL, 6 June, #17 (£956).

Study for “The Misses Hill.” Brown ink, 33 x 27.3 cm. CL, 21 Nov., #5, illus. color (£7170).

Study of Medea Contemplating the Murder of Her Children (recto); Satan Confronted by an Angel (verso). Pencil (recto), pen and ink (verso), sheet 25.5 x 24 cm. SL, 4 July, #122, recto illus. color (£1673).

Study of Satan for “The Fall of the Rebel Angels.” Pencil and gray ink and wash, 25.4 x 17.1 cm. CL, 21 Nov., #8, illus. color (not sold; estimate £4000-6000).

The Toilet of Venus. Pencil, 16 x 18 cm., datable to 1768. Lowell Libson, May cat. of “British Master Drawings,” #7, illus. color ($9000).

The Unfortunate Children of Jason and Medea. Pen and ink, 15.2 x 15.2 cm., datable to 1776. Abbott and Holder, Nov. online cat. 350, #70 (£2000).

STOTHARD, THOMAS

Figure Studies, including Falstaff Fighting. Pen and ink on sheet 15.2 x 14.6 cm., inscribed “By Stothard R. A.” in another hand. eBay online auction, March, framed, illus. (reserve not met; highest bid $102.50).

Ulysses and the Syrens. Oil, 39 x 50 cm. SL, 4 July, #48, illus. color (not sold; estimate £2000-3000); SL, 2 Dec., #17, illus. color (£1175).

Young Lovers Emerging to the Surprise of Friends. Oil, 30.5 x 38.1 cm. Abbott and Holder, March cat. 345, #9 (£2500).

“John Gilpin,” Worthington after Stothard, 1825. eBay online auction, March, illus. color (no bids on a required minimum bid of $99.95); same impression, eBay, Oct.-Nov., illus. color (£69.95).

“Mary Queen of Scots Receiving the Death Sentence,” Edwards after Stothard, c. 1800. eBay online auction, March, hand colored, illus. color (not sold on a required starting bid of $99.95).


“Pilgrim & Herdsman,” Strutt after Stothard, 1796. eBay online auction, March, repaired tear in margin, stained, illus. (£36).


“Runaway Love,” Knight after Stothard. eBay online auction, June, with a companion pl. after Singleton, both pls. color printed, framed, illus. (£32).


Aksenside, Pleasures of the Imagination, 1796. Stuart Bennett, April cat. 38, #1, contemporary calf (£50).


Book of Common Prayer, 1794. eBay online auction, Oct., contemporary morocco, illus. color (reserve not met; top bid $103.50).

Boydell, Collection of Prints ... Illustrating ... Shakspeare, 1803. “Othello, Act II, Scene I,” only, Ryder after Stothard, eBay online auction, wrongly attributed to Fuseli as the designer and Thew as the engraver, illus. (£113.61). “King Henry the Eighth, Act I, Scene IV,” only, Taylor after Stothard, illus. (£9.99). See also Boydell under Fuseli, above.

Bray, Life of Stothard, 1851, extra-illus. copies only. Korn & Towns, Feb. Los Angeles Book Fair, with 105 added pls. (none by Blake), quarter morocco (£500).

Bunyan, Pilgrim's Progress, series of engravings by Strutt after Stothard, 1793. eBay online auction, May, pl. 1 (frontispiece) only, printed in dark brown, water stained, illus. color (no bids on a required minimum bid of $29.95).

Burns, The Works of Robert Burns; with His Life, by Allan Cunningham, 8 vols., London: Cochrane and M'Crone, 1834. eBay online auction, Feb., vol. 1 (Cunningham's Life) only with title page vignette of Burns' birthplace, Booth after Stothard, not previously recorded, disbound, stained, illus. (£4.99).

Catullus, Tibullus et Propertius, Pickering ed., 1824. G. W. Stuart, March cat. 102, #24, original cloth worn (£195); #25, another copy, original cloth worn (£185). Howes Bookshop, Nov. cat. 298, #172, original cloth repaired (£55).


Rogers, *Poems*. Bertram Rota, Sept. cat. 300, #603, 1812 ed., contemporary half calf (£180); #604, another copy, contemporary calf (£180); #605, another copy, "New Edition" on the title page, contemporary calf worn (£60); #606, 1816 ed., fine contemporary morocco, binding illus. color (£150); #607, 1820 ed., contemporary morocco (£60); #608, 1822 ed., presentation inscription from Rogers, contemporary morocco (£200). eBay online auction, Oct., 1852 ed., publisher's calf, illus. color (£46). Howes Bookshop, Nov. cat. 299, #157, 1834 ed., fancy full morocco (£150).


Walton, *Complete Angler*, Pickering ed., 1836. BBA, 2 May, #304, large-paper copy with illus. on laid India, some spotting, fine contemporary morocco binding illus. color (£1000).


**VON HOLST, THEODOR**

*Judith and Holofemes*. Gray washes over pencil, 22 x 17.5 cm. SL, 4 July, #123, illus. color (not sold; estimate £2000-3000).
Appendix: New Information on Blake’s Engravings

Listed below are substantive additions or corrections to Roger R. Easson and Robert N. Essick, *William Blake: Book Illustrator*, vol. 1, Plates Designed and Engraved by Blake (1972); Essick, *The Separate Plates of William Blake: A Catalogue* (1983); and Essick, *William Blake's Commercial Book Illustrations* (1991). Abbreviations and citation styles follow the respective volumes, with the addition of “Butlin” according to the List of Abbreviations at the beginning of this sales review. Newly discovered impressions of previously recorded published states of Blake’s engravings are listed only for the rarer separate plates.

**The Separate Plates of William Blake: A Catalogue**


P. 69, “Chaucers Canterbury Pilgrims,” impression 4AA. For the attempted sale of this impression, 1 of only 3 recorded in the 4th St., see the first entry under “Separate Plates and Plates in Series” in the sales review, above.


P. 150, “Rev. John Caspar Lavater;” impression 1A, a unique proof state. Given July 2002 by Leo Steinberg to the Jack S. Blanton Museum of Art, University of Texas, Austin, Texas.

Pp. 191-200, “Mrs Q;” after Villiers. For a previously unrecorded impression, see under “Separate Plates and Plates in Series” in the sales review, above.

**MINUTE PARTICULARS**

**The Sound of “Holy Thursday”**

**BY W.H. STEVENSON**

*William Blake and Joseph Haydn make an odd pair. Quite possibly they passed one another in the street. Great Pulteney Street, where Haydn came to stay with Salomon on 7th January 1791, is only five minutes’ walk from Blake’s house in Poland Street—but the Blakes had almost certainly left for Lambeth not long before. Artistically, their paths are worlds apart. Blake, idiosyncratic and rebellious, inventing his own forms, openly hostile to all things classical; Haydn, content to use the classical forms of his age as the groundwork of his genius. The two men come together, however, over one event, the annual service of the London charity-school children in St. Paul’s, recorded in Blake’s two “Holy Thursday” poems:

Twas on a Holy Thursday their innocent faces clean
The children walking two & two in red & blue & green
Grey headed beadles walkd before with wands as white as snow
Till into the high dome of Pauls they like Thames waters flow

Now like a mighty wind they raise to heaven the voice of song
Or like harmonious thunderings the seats of heaven among . . . . (Songs of Innocence)

At different times, both witnessed this service. Haydn, in his notebook for 1792, wrote that “no music ever moved me so deeply in my whole life as this, devotional and innocent” (no small thing for Haydn to say). “All the children are newly clad, and enter in procession. The organist first played the melody very nicely and simply, and then they all began to sing at once.”

What is more, he wrote down the tune that so moved him. It was composed by John Jones (1728-96), organist at St. Paul’s for many years, and published as no. 24 in his *Sixty Chants* (1785) (illus. 1).

1. H.C. Robbins Landon, *The Collected Correspondence and London Notebooks of Joseph Haydn* (London: Barry and Rockliff, 1959) 261, where the tune is reproduced as Haydn heard it. Landon carefully heads the page “1791-1792: *New Grove* (see next note) dates the event 1791. But though the entries are not in date order, all those around this entry that are dated are from 1792.

2. John Jones, *Sixty. I. Chants, Single and Double* (London: Longman and Broderip, 1785) 78-79. The copy in the National Library of Scotland (cat. no. Cwn 432) retains “1785” as the title page date, but self-evidently must have been printed no earlier than April.
This is not a metrical psalm tune. Metrical psalms, though unlike the prose psalms not included in the statutory services of the 1662 Book of Common Prayer, enabled the congregation to take an active part in worship, and had become popular in the Church of England in the eighteenth century. This is an Anglican chant, a form (different from plainsong though derived from it) which evolved after the Restoration for the singing of prose psalms and canticles, and so a musical form markedly different from the ballad stanza used for metrical psalms. In his edition, Jones proudly heads this chant with the words “performed at St. Paul’s Cathedral on the General Thanksgiving April 23rd, 1789”—a special service on that St. George’s Day to mark the King’s recovery from his illness. It is a relatively simple tune, but with celebratory harmonies, and unusual, dramatic bare octaves at the opening of each phrase. Haydn did not note the harmonies, though of course he could easily have done so; it appears (from various contemporary references) that the children sang in unison.

But what words were sung to it? Jones gives no indication which psalm he designed this tune for, merely marking, by a capital R (for Rejoicing), the mood of the tune; he leaves the choice of psalm to the choirmaster.

At least one eyewitness account of the King’s thanksgiving service seems to give an answer. Sir Gilbert Elliott reported the event to his wife, saying of the charity children’s singing that he “found it by far the most interesting part of the show”:


... when the King approached the centre all the 6,000 children set up their little voices and sang part of the Hundredth Psalm. This was the moment that I found most affecting; and, without knowing exactly why, I found my eyes running over, and the bone in my throat, which was the case with many other people. The King himself had asked for “a good old Te Deum and Jubilate”—the latter being the traditional name for the 100th Psalm. We might suppose, then, that at this service Jones’s Double 24th was the tune used for the prose 100th Psalm, “O be joyful in the Lord, O ye lands,” and also that the charity children were gathered to sing it on this special occasion (quite distinct from their own annual service, which was not due for another month).

But this does not settle the question. There are two ways in which the 100th Psalm might have been sung: as a chanted prose psalm, or in the popular metrical version by William Kethe (d. 1594), to its contemporary tune, the “Old Hundredth.” Both sets of psalms were commonly included in editions of the Book of Common Prayer at this period. It is true that Haydn’s note (and perhaps Blake’s poem) suggests that the service opened with the children singing a chant, and the 100th Psalm would have been appropriate. But two documents in the Guildhall Library in London tell a more complex story.


5. The text of the psalms in the 1662 Book of Common Prayer in general follows the 1537 Great Bible, rather than the 1611 Authorized King James version, “Make a joyful noise unto the Lord.”

6. “Psalms and Anthems to be sung at the Anniversary Meeting”
One, dated 1797, is a handbill, "Psalms and Anthems to be sung at the Anniversary Meeting," consisting of the order of service. This begins: "Before Prayers the 100th Psalm;" the text of Kethe's metrical psalm, "All people that on earth do dwell," follows. Next: "The Reading Psalms to be Chanted by the Gentlemen of the CHOIR,—the Children to join in the GLORIA PATRI to each Psalm." At this point the second document, "The ANTHEMS & PSALMS . . . . ." a collection of the music of the service, annotates "Double Chant," and prints Jones's 24th.

The children also took part in three anthems. In the first, "the Coronation Anthem" (Handel's "Zadok the Priest"), the children were to join in the dramatic repeated phrase, "God Save the King! Long live the King! May the king live for ever!" at the climax of the piece, and "Hallelujah! Amen" at the end. The second was a short 16-bar chorus to the word "Hallelujah!," which the children sang throughout, the girls alone being marked to sing four bars in the middle. The last was Handel's "Hallelujah! Amen" in which, again, "the Children [are] to join in such Parts as are marked"—in this case, substantial passages at the beginning and the end, more than a third (the easiest third) of the whole.

As to the opening psalm: on these occasions, then, it was not Jones's prose chant, but the metrical version, the Old Hundredth. This service found places for two more metrical psalms: Nahum Tate's 113th before the sermon, and four verses of Kethe's 104th (to William Croft's tune, "Hanover") after it. The prose "reading psalms," on the other hand, were part of the formal body of the service, and, depending on circumstances, in parish church or cathedral, might be literally read by the minister, or chanted, either by him or by the choir (if any). Here the cathedral choir alone chanted the "reading" psalms to Jones's 24th, the children joining in only at the end.

What was the most moving point of the service for Blake and Haydn? Elliott is quite plain; for him, it was the children's singing of the Old Hundredth, the dramatic beginning of the special thanksgiving service. The Innocence poem suggests that Blake felt the same effect at the charity service. But it was Jones's chant tune later in the service that Haydn wrote down. Perhaps he was moved most powerfully at the point of a second raising "to heaven the voice of song," "devotional and innocent," when the thousands of children broke into "Glory be ..." to Jones's tune, after the more attenuated monotone chanting of the text of the psalm. This could well have led Haydn to note down the tune they sang.

Dr. William Vincent, trying by his little book to improve congregational singing in parish services, certainly found the chant inspiring. Almost in a parenthesis—in a footnote, that is, he says that, for untrained singers, "...no chant is better calculated than that which the charity children sing at the conclusion of each psalm at St. Paul's.—It is composed by Mr. Jones . . . . ." Vincent makes other enlightening comments about the quality of the singing at the annual charity-school service. The singing of the Anglican chant requires a certain skill; there is no rhythmical pattern to follow, as in an ordinary song, and untrained singers can easily fall into a gabble. Vincent laments the general standard of singing in the chapels of several hospitals and public charities in the metropolis, where "they universally sing at the utmost height of their voices, and fifty or an hundred trebles strained to their highest pitch, united to the roar of the full organ, can never raise admiration of the performers ..." (p. 8). Instead of that coarseness—perhaps because the children of Coram's Foundling Hospital (which "appears to have obtained all that is desirable in this point") formed a tenth of the whole, and because there were public rehearsals—"the effect is just the reverse in the general assembly of the charity children at St. Paul's ... . The union of five thousand trebles, raises admiration and astonishment ..." (p. 9).

We should not really ask, "What point was most moving?" since it would be a total effect that people would take away with them. It is plain from all allusions to this service that the similar emotional response of such very dissimilar people as Blake, Haydn, and Elliott was widespread. In 1800, John Page, the choirmaster, claimed for this service, in eighteenth-century style, that amongst the many laudable Charities with which this Munificent Kingdom abounds, there is none . . . . can fill the mind with such affectionate sensation and religious awe . . . . [T]hat public display of Benevolence, has been eagerly attended by crowded Congregations annually, for nearly a Century past . . . .

The self-congratulatory tone grates today, but it does seem that the feeling at that time for the charity-children's service was not unlike the modern popular affection for the annual carol service at King's College, Cambridge.

What song the sirens sang may be beyond conjecture; but we know what the "Holy Thursday" children sang. And

(1797) is a single-sided handbill resembling, and catalogued as, a broadside. The second document is John Page, "The ANTHEMS & PSALMS / as Performed at / ST. PAUL'S CATHEDRAL / On the day of the Anniversary Meeting of the / Charity Children ... 3/-" (London: Ann Rivington). The Library dates it 1800. Page, "Conductor of the Music," has arranged the music in two staves for keyboard, and marks in detail where the children are to sing. I am indebted to Mr. J.J. Wisdom, Librarian of St. Paul's, for finding these documents for me in the Guildhall Library.

7. Rev. William Vincent, D.D., Considerations on Parochial Music, 2nd ed. with additions (London: Cadell, 1790) 10n. He was Head­master of Westminster School from 1788, and Dean of the Abbey from 1802.

8. Vincent, 11n. Charles Dickens alludes to the continued quality of the musical training at Coram's Hospital in Little Dorrit (1855-57), ch. 2.
though we cannot be certain at what point in the service Blake's and Haydn's eyes began to fill, we know what sound it was that could so raise Blake's emotions: whether immediately and simply, as in *Innocence*; or, as in *Experience* years later, to make him challenge us to be satisfied with a lump in the throat when the children sing:

Is that trembling cry a song?
Can it be a song of joy?
And so many children poor?
It is a land of poverty! (*Songs of Experience*)

---

**Erdman’s Pagination of The Four Zoas**

**BY WAYNE C. RIPLEY**

In their 1987 facsimile of *The Four Zoas*, David Erdman and Cettina Magno rearrange the pages of the manuscript "in the sequence now recognized as least departing from the textual sequences called for by Blake's own marks of instruction" (16). This change in sequence involved the renumbering of twenty-four pages over twelve leaves, which Erdman presents in the following chart:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Old Numbers</th>
<th>New Numbers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>19 [21]</td>
<td>87 [95]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 [22]</td>
<td>88 [96]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21 [19]</td>
<td>89 [97]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22 [20]</td>
<td>90 [98]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>95 [87]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>96 [88]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>97 [89]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>98 [90]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>105 [113]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>106 [114]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>107 [115]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>108 [116]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>109 [109]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>110 [106]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>111 [107]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>112 [108]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>113 [109]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>114 [110]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>115 [111]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>116 [112]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The numbers outside the brackets are those of Erdman and Magno’s new arrangement, used by their facsimile, while those inside the brackets represent the older arrangement, used most notably by Bentley's 1963 facsimile.2 Again presenting this chart in the 1988 new revised edition of *The Complete Poetry and Prose*, Erdman acknowledges that to apply this new numbering in “the present text would be confusing since Blake's poem moves about (because of his own revisions) in a sequence that does not correspond exactly to any sequence of the manuscript leaves” (E 818).3 Yet, despite his recognition of the potential confusion that could result from applying these new page numbers to the poem, Erdman in practice inconsistently adopts the new numbers in his text, which drastically complicates the reader's ability to refer back to either of the poem's facsimiles, and this confusion is only augmented by Erdman's decision to leave his textual notes completely in the old numbering.

To facilitate, therefore, references back to the facsimiles from the now standard 1988 edition, four tables are provided below rectifying Erdman's inconsistencies and offering a few touchstones for negotiating between Erdman's text and the facsimiles. The first table corrects the page numbers found in the text so that Erdman's new numbering is consistently applied. The second changes the headings in the textual notes so that they correspond to Erdman's text as corrected by Table 1. More difficult to rectify in the textual notes are the references to the pages that occur in Erdman's prose. These are concentrated chiefly on page 827, for pages 19-22, and between pages 836-41, for Nights VII and VIII. As the prose of 836-41 provides in large part Erdman's reasoning in renumbering and rearranging the manuscript pages, it may be simpler to explain this rearrangement in terms of Erdman's new numbering. In this arrangement, which is often made to sound more difficult than it is, the pages of VIIa1 begin the Night, standing unaltered as 77-85;22. What once provided the close for VIIb2, 95-98, follows, renumbered by Erdman as 87-90. This section commences on the second portion of 87 [95] where Blake has written in the margin “Beginning of Night VII” and in the text “Beginning of the Book Seventh Night” (Erdman and Magno 201). VIIib1 follows the last page of VIIb2, 90 [98], retaining its original numbers 91-94. The first portion of 87 [95] succeeds 94, followed by 85:23-47. Although it is shown in Table 1, because this page begins VIIa2, it should be noted that Erdman mislabeled what should be 85 (SECOND PORTION) as 95 [87] (SECOND PORTION) (E 367). 86 follows 85:23-47 unaltered, succeeded by the remainder of VIIa2, originally 87-90 but renumbered 95-98. These pages are made up of the Edward and Elenor print; hence, only 95 [97] and 98 [90] have text. Erdman concludes the night with the “End of the Seventh Night” from page 90 [98]. This arrangement in both numbering systems is summarized in Table 3.

Table 4 lists those manuscript pages whose texts are split up. This will preclude, I hope, fishing for where the other portions of a particular manuscript page may be in the text’s arrangement. Note here that the first portion of 91 is the title of VIIib and is not used by Erdman.

---


4. Erdman's arrangement is that put forward by Mark S. Lefebvre's "A Note on the Structural Necessity of Night VIIb" in *Blake: An Illustrated Quarterly* 46 (fall 1978):134, an issue devoted to *The Four Zoas*. Erdman's reasoning for accepting Lefebvre's argument is found in his "Night the Seventh: The Editorial Problem," which follows Lefebvre's piece, 135-39. John Kilgore's and Andrew Lincoln's articles in the is-
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page Number from Erdman 1988 / Page of FZ as Listed There</th>
<th>Correction</th>
<th>Manuscript Page Begins (Citing Erdman and Magno Page Number)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>E 310 / PAGE 21</td>
<td>PAGE 19 [21]</td>
<td>Then those in Great Eternity met in the Council of God (133)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 311 / PAGE 22</td>
<td>PAGE 20 [22]</td>
<td>Luvah replied Dictate to thy Equals. am not I (134)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 337 / PAGE 56</td>
<td>PAGE 56 (FIRST PORTION)</td>
<td>Lord. Saviour if thou hadst been here our brother had not died (170)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 360 / PAGE [95] (SECOND PORTION)</td>
<td>PAGE 87 [95] (SECOND PORTION)</td>
<td>For far &amp; wide she stretchd this all the world of Urizens journey (201)³</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 362 / PAGE 90 [98] (SECOND PORTION)</td>
<td>PAGE 90 [98] (FIRST PORTION)</td>
<td>And must not I obey the God thou Shadow of Jealousy (204)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 363 / PAGE 91 (SECOND PORTION)</td>
<td>PAGE 91 (SECOND PORTION)</td>
<td>Vala / Night the Seventh (205)⁴</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 367 / PAGE 95 [87] (SECOND PORTION)</td>
<td>PAGE 85 (SECOND PORTION)</td>
<td>Astonishd filld with tears the Spirit of Enitharmon beheld (199)⁷</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 368 / PAGE 87</td>
<td>PAGE 95 [87]⁸</td>
<td>But Enitharmon trembling fled &amp; hid beneath Urizens tree (209)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 371 / PAGE 90 [98] (SECOND PORTION)</td>
<td>PAGE 90 [98] (SECOND PORTION)</td>
<td>And must not I obey the God thou Shadow of Jealousy (204)⁹</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 376 / PAGE 113 (FIRST PORTION)</td>
<td>PAGE 105 [113] (FIRST PORTION)</td>
<td>We behold with wonder Enitharmons Looms &amp; Los's Forges (219)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 381 / PAGE 106 (SECOND PORTION)</td>
<td>PAGE 110 [106] (SECOND PORTION)</td>
<td>Thus was the Lamb of God condemn'd to Death (224)¹⁰</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 386 / PAGE 110 (SECOND PORTION)</td>
<td>PAGE 114 [110] (SECOND PORTION)</td>
<td>The Lamb of God has rent the Veil of Mystery soon to return (228)¹¹</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

sue are important for coming to terms with some of the complexities of the manuscript. Lincoln's mastery of the manuscript is more recently demonstrated in his *Spiritual History* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1995), which puts forth the best theory so far as to how the poem developed. As he notes in his Appendix 4, W. H. Stevenson, in the second edition to *The Complete Poems* (UK: Longman House, 1989), adopts Blake's instructions on page 9 of the manuscript and inserts pages 19-22 at 9:33. Stevenson, it should be noted, uses the older page numbers but adopts the same arrangement of the pages as Erdman: 19 [21], 20 [22], 21 [19], and 22 [20].

5. This second portion begins: "But in the deeps beneath the Roots of Mystery in darkest night" (E 360).
6. This page is marked correctly in Erdman's text, but it should be noted that the first portion to this page is "Vala / Night the Seventh" and is not included in Erdman's text. This page is the beginning of Night VIII.
7. This second portion begins: "Then took the tree of Mystery root in the World of Los" (E 367).
8. This page is the reverse of the Edward and Elenor print, right-hand segment. Erdman's number for this print is 96 [88]. The number of the left-hand segment is 97 [89].
9. This second portion reads: "End of The Seventh Night" (E 371), and is beneath two lines of textual instructions in Blake's hand.
10. This second portion begins: "Darkness & sorrow coverd all flesh Eternity was darkend" (E 381). The first portion of this page is labeled correctly and is found on E 379.
11. This second portion reads: "[End of (The) Eighth Night]" (E 386), with the text erased and drawn over by Blake.

Spring 2003

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Manuscript Page Begins (Citing Erdman and Magno Page Number)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Then those in Great Eternity met in the Council of God (133)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Luvah replied Dictate to thy Equals. am not I (134)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord. Saviour if thou hadst been here our brother had not died (170)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For far &amp; wide she stretchd this all the world of Urizens journey (201)³</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>And must not I obey the God thou Shadow of Jealousy (204)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vala / Night the Seventh (205)⁴</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Astonishd filld with tears the Spirit of Enitharmon beheld (199)⁷</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>But Enitharmon trembling fled &amp; hid beneath Urizens tree (209)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>And must not I obey the God thou Shadow of Jealousy (204)⁹</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>We behold with wonder Enitharmons Looms &amp; Los's Forges (219)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thus was the Lamb of God condemn'd to Death (224)¹⁰</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Lamb of God has rent the Veil of Mystery soon to return (228)¹¹</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2. The Page Numbers of Erdman’s Textual Notes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page Number from Erdman 1988</th>
<th>Page of FZ as Listed</th>
<th>Correction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>E 827</td>
<td>PAGE 21</td>
<td>PAGE 19 [21]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PAGE 22</td>
<td>PAGE 20 [22]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PAGE 19</td>
<td>PAGE 21 [19]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PAGE 20</td>
<td>PAGE 22 [20]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 837</td>
<td>PAGE 95 (SECOND PORTION)</td>
<td>PAGE 87 [95] (SECOND PORTION)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 838</td>
<td>PAGE 96</td>
<td>PAGE 88 [96]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PAGE 97</td>
<td>PAGE 89 [97]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PAGE 98</td>
<td>PAGE 90 [98]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PAGE 95 (FIRST PORTION)</td>
<td>PAGE 87 [95] (FIRST PORTION)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 839</td>
<td>PAGE 87</td>
<td>PAGE 95 [87]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PAGE 90</td>
<td>PAGE 98 [90]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 841</td>
<td>PAGE 113 (FIRST PORTION)</td>
<td>PAGE 105 [113] (FIRST PORTION)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 842</td>
<td>PAGE 105</td>
<td>PAGE 109 [105]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PAGE 106 (FIRST PORTION)</td>
<td>PAGE 110 [106] (FIRST PORTION)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PAGE 113 (SECOND PORTION)</td>
<td>PAGE 105 [113] (SECOND PORTION)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PAGE 115</td>
<td>PAGE 107 [115]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 843</td>
<td>PAGE 116</td>
<td>PAGE 108 [116]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PAGE 106 (SECOND PORTION)</td>
<td>PAGE 110 [106] (SECOND PORTION)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PAGE 107</td>
<td>PAGE 111 [107]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PAGE 108</td>
<td>PAGE 112 [108]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PAGE 110</td>
<td>PAGE 114 [110] (FIRST PORTION)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PAGE 111</td>
<td>PAGE 115 [111]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PAGE 113</td>
<td>PAGE 114 [110] (SECOND PORTION)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

12. See n. 8 above.
13. The reverse of this page, 106 [114], is an engraving of Christ splitting the clouds and, therefore, has no text (Magnn and Erdman 220).
14. Note, an error in page number.

142 Blake/An Illustrated Quarterly

Spring 2003
### Table 3. The Arrangement of Night VII

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>VIIa1</th>
<th>VIIa2</th>
<th>VIIb</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Original Page Numbers:</strong></td>
<td>77-85:22</td>
<td>85:23-90</td>
<td>91-98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Erdman’s Page Numbers:</strong></td>
<td>77-85:22</td>
<td>85:23-86, 95 [87], 96 [88], 97 [89], 98 [90]</td>
<td>91-94, 87 [95], 88 [96], 89 [97], 90 [98]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Arrangement Original Numbers:</strong></td>
<td>77-85:22 (VIIa1); 95:15-98:31 (VIIb2); 91-95:14 (VIIb1); 85:23-90 (VIIa2); 98:32</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Arrangement Erdman’s Numbers:</strong></td>
<td>77-85:22 (VIIa1); 87:15-90:31 (VIIb2); 91-94, 87:14 (VIIb1); 85:23-86, 95-98 (VIIa2); 90:32</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 4. First and Second Portions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>E 360 / PAGE 85 (FIRST PORTION)</th>
<th>E 367 / PAGE 85 (SECOND PORTION)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>E 360 / PAGE 87 [95] (SECOND PORTION)</td>
<td>E 367 / PAGE 87 [95] (FIRST PORTION)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 362 / PAGE 90 [98] (FIRST PORTION)</td>
<td>E 371 / PAGE 90 [98] (SECOND PORTION)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 372 / PAGE 100 (FIRST PORTION)</td>
<td>E 373 / PAGE 100 (SECOND PORTION)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 373 / PAGE 101 (FIRST PORTION)</td>
<td>E 374 / PAGE 101 (SECOND PORTION)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 376 / PAGE 104 (FIRST PORTION)</td>
<td>E 377 / PAGE 104 (SECOND PORTION)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 376 / PAGE 105 [113] (FIRST PORTION)</td>
<td>E 379 / PAGE 105 [113] (SECOND PORTION)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 379 / PAGE 110 [106] (FIRST PORTION)</td>
<td>E 381 / PAGE 110 [106] (SECOND PORTION)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E 385 / PAGE 114 [110] (FIRST PORTION)</td>
<td>E 386 / PAGE 114 [110] (SECOND PORTION)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reviewed by JASON SNART

Kathleen Lundeen’s basic argument in *Knight of the Living Dead* is that Blake’s “disregard of the conventional aesthetic parameters that are thought to separate one [artistic] medium from another,” image from text for example, also plays out in his “trespassing the boundaries between here and the hereafter,” that is, Blake’s claim to have communicated with the dead (13). Jerome McGann, in “William Blake Illuminates the Truth,” writes of what he calls “the three principal ‘lines’ of Blake criticism” (18). These are: (1) studies which pursue Blake’s “political and social engagements” (like Erdman’s *Blake: Prophet Against Empire*), (2) those which pursue Blake’s “symbolistic/allegorical methods” (like Damrosch’s *Symbol and Truth in Blake’s Myth*), and (3) those which pursue Blake’s “work as an artist and engraver” (like Viscomi’s *Blake and the Idea of the Book*) (18; the examples are mine, not McGann’s). However, there is a fourth “line” coming into greater and greater focus—of which Lundeen’s work is a part—though it is a line that I’d argue has not, until recently, run parallel to these others, so much as it has run a sort of zigzag pattern through them all, intersecting at different angles in different instances. This fourth line could be termed something like “Blake’s textuality.” Not that earlier studies did not attend in varying degrees to Blake’s textuality, but textuality was always subsumed in broader arguments; it was always one of many means to an end. Through the mid-1980s, the 1990s, and especially in the late 90s, this fourth line of criticism began to run a course of its own. That is, studies of Blake’s textuality became less concerned with explicating a political or symbolic aspect of Blake’s work, and more content to (and confident enough to) begin pursuing questions of textuality for their own sake. The best parts of Lundeen’s *Knight of the Living Dead* are very definitely part of this fourth line; other work that constitutes the fourth line includes that by Donald Ault, V.A. de Luca, the Santa Cruz Blake Study Group, Molly Anne Rothenberg, Nelson Hilton, Fred Dortort, and Thomas Vogler.

Lundeen’s basic goal is to pursue the intersections between the insistent materiality that Blake’s work negotiates and what she calls Blake’s “spiritualistic practices” (13). She looks to show how *ontological* boundaries (between dualisms) are revealed in Blake’s work to be *perceptual* boundaries, and that to understand Blake’s claims to have communicated with spirits, we must first understand his epistemology as one “that escapes dualistic reasoning” (162). Where a great deal of early criticism looked to stabilize Blake, to systematize even those works most resistant to systematization, recent work has tended to move in the opposite direction, or at least has professed to move in the opposite direction, looking to destabilize Blake’s texts, and in some cases to preserve their instability instead of correcting it, by attention to the very details which so often were swept under the carpet in earlier systematizing criticism. Lundeen’s willingness to move through a variety of Blake’s texts, her attention to the play of both verbal and graphic elements, and her willingness to suspend multiple, and sometimes conflicting, readings of Blake’s work, place her firmly in the textualist camp. In chapter 2, for example, “Urizen, Milton, and the Problem of Forged Identity,” Lundeen pursues the metaphor of “quaking” (64) in *Urizen* in relation to “the semantic instability of language” (66); she attends to Blake’s illustrations as they try to “break out of the frame of the plate” (75). This textual breaking is deeply linked, argues Lundeen, to the various kinds of semantic breaking that occur throughout the poem.

Admittedly though, Lundeen’s sensitivity to textual, material conditions in Blake’s work does not always get pushed as far as it might. For example, in her discussion of quak-
the highly unstable plate orders of the extant copies of the book itself. Of particular importance to Lundeen's discussion should be plate 4 (numbered 4a in some systems, and as I'll refer to it here) of Urizen from which Lundeen, like many Blake critics, quotes ("I have sought for...a solid without fluctuation" [63]). Almost perversely, this plate, in which Urizen expresses what has become that most "Urizenic" of desires for fixity (the solid without fluctuation), is present in only 3 of the 8 extant copies (A, B, and C as listed in Worrall's The Urizen Books [148-49]). Consider that when plate 4a is absent, the narrative moves from "Shrill the trumpet: & myriads of Eter / -nity" (plate 3, lines 44-45) to "In living creations appear'd / In the flames of eternal fury" (plate 4, lines 1-2, copy D). With plate 4a in place (as in copies A, B, and C), "Shrill the trumpet: & myriads of Eter / -nity" is followed by "Muster around the bleak desarts" (plate 4a, line 1). Further, plate 4a ends, "All the seven deadly sins of the soul," followed by the next text plate, plate 4, "In living creations appear'd / In the flames of eternal fury." The presence or absence of plate 4a drastically alters the possibilities for who, or what, performs certain actions.

Up to the point in copy D at which plate 4a would otherwise appear (as it does in A, B, and C), Urizen has been trying to survive his expulsion (or withdrawal, depending on whose perspective we believe) from Eternity by organizing, building and creating. With plate 4a excised (a material "falling away" for Urizen), the Eternals arrive and chase Urizen into the "desarts and rocks." (plate 4, line 20) with their flames of fury. They drive him to "howlings & pangs & fierce madness...till hoary, and age-broke, and aged. / In despair and the shadows of death" (plate 4, lines 24-27).

If we recall that the "of" in the title, Book of Urizen, might suggest that the book is, in fact, by him, as much as it is about him, then I think we must consider the possibility that Urizen is telling this story, not just having it told about him, and is thus potentially looking to elicit the reader's sympathy. After all, in copy D (plate 4a is absent) the Eternals chase Urizen into seclusion for little apparent reason. It is the Eternals who are jealous, vindictive, and arbitrary with their anger. With plate 4a in place, we get a chance to see Urizen proclaim his laws in books of metal, and as such we are given some reason to explain the Eternals' reaction to him. Again, the presence or absence of the plate has dramatic implications for our reading; the quaking metaphor that Lundeen pursues would thus seem to extend itself well beyond the content of the plates and into our material encounter with them. Further, Lundeen's argument that Blake and Urizen participate in a number of the same bookish activities (what she calls "Blake's occupational kinship with Urizen" [81]) could well benefit from a consideration of the role plate 4a plays in our conception of Urizen, for it is the plate on which he announces the writing of his books of metal (or, more correctly, his books of "me- / -tals" [plate 4a, lines 23-24]).

Also absent from Lundeen's analysis is any mention of the position of the "Preludium" in copy E; it does not precede the poem at all, but rather appears as the fifth plate. Following from Lundeen's assertion that "the entire universe of Urizen quakes destructively" (65), and her attention to the "ever-shifting narrative" (68), a detailed discussion of the ever-shifting plate order would seem to be required. Most intriguing from a textual standpoint is that in copy E the "Preludium" appears between text plates 5 and 6 (following Bentley's authenticated plate order; he has personally examined copy E), with an intervening illustration after plate 5 (Bentley). Plate 5 concludes, "And Los round the dark globe of / Urizen / Kept watch for Eternals to confine, / The obscure separation alone; / For eternity stood wide apart" (37-41; my italics), while plate 6 begins, "As the stars are apart from the earth / 9. Los wept howling round the dark / Demon:" (1-3; my italics). Indeed it is plate 2 itself, the "Preludium," which is made to stand materially "wide apart" from where it should be if it is to precede the poem. It becomes, in copy E, very literally an "obscure separation." In copy C there are two plates of the "Preludium" text; the first appears as the second plate in the book (where it properly precedes the poem). The next "Preludium" occurs immediately after the first. This second plate 2 has all but the word "Urizen" erased from the title as it appears on the first "Preludium": "Preludium to the [First] Book of Urizen." To be accurate then, the second plate "2" (that is, the third actual plate in the series) is not titled "Preludium" as such, though it repeats the text of the first "Preludium."

However much Lundeen's work attends to certain textual detail, her study is still rooted in some of the (potentially problematic) goals of earlier criticism. Not least of these is the tendency to ignore entanglements which arise from close reading, especially those which complicate the argument at stake. In her discussion of tautology in chapter 3, "Disappearing Boundaries in Prophetic Geography," for example, Lundeen accepts the traditional association of the child in the "Introduction" to Songs of Innocence with the poetic muse: the "child/muse" she calls it (126). This fails to account, however, for the fact that the Piper is piping his songs before encountering the child. Thus the artist is not without some form of inspiration prior to the child's appearance in the poem. The point is absolutely not that Lundeen is "wrong." In fact her analysis of the poem is particularly insightful. However, this detail is one that probably should not have escaped the author's notice, since it does complicate how we can interpret the relationship between the child and the Piper. Another example occurs in Lundeen's discussion of Milton in "Urizen, Milton, and the Problem of Forged Identity." She develops an analysis of
"the celebrated image of the foot" (92) in Milton (and in other of Blake's work), and again her explication is astute; she moves ably among a variety of Blake's works, from Milton itself to Jerusalem to a letter Blake wrote to Flaxman. She makes clear the connection between word and foot, writing/creating and walking, and thus writing as bodily action (96). Nowhere does Lundeen make what would seem the obvious connection, though, between the physical feet of the body and the metrical feet of poetry—a connection that would seem only to strengthen the link between writing and walking.

In addition to these omissions are a couple of points at which Lundeen, in her efforts to show how problems of ontology pervade all of Blake's work, stretches interpretive possibilities in one direction without considering others. For example, in her discussion of the Laocoon, Lundeen writes that "the central figures . . . appear to be struggling to burst out of [their] scripted bonds" (38). She reiterates the point on page 84: "the figures struggle to break out of the all-pervasive textuality on the page." Lundeen employs the Laocoon as one of "Blake's vigorous attempts to escape representation" (84) but at the same time (paradoxically?) to show the "claustrophobia of a universe in which 'il n'y a pas de hors-texte' [there is no outside the text]" (38). However, the figures do not seem particularly concerned at all with the words around them. Indeed, they occupy the center of the page, and it is their outline that constrains what forms the text can take. Their struggles seem to be focused on elements of the "sculpture" itself (particularly the serpent), not with the surrounding text. In fact, for a composite page of text and picture, there is little ground given by the figures to the text. In other of Blake's work, figures will often point directly to key textual moments (for example, Gwendolen points directly to mirror writing on plate 81, copy D, of Jerusalem). In the case of the Laocoon, what strikes me as odd is not the degree to which the figures participate with the text, or must "reckon" with it, as Lundeen writes (38), but the degree to which they ignore it entirely. Lundeen does not choose to explore what seems this equally viable interpretive option. Similarly, in her discussion of Blake's use of textual frames to enclose his poems, Lundeen writes that "every engraving resembles a window or, with a bit of a stretch, an open eye" (145). The general point is a good one: to link reading with seeing, and thus to complicate the ontology of seeing and of the textual frame itself. However, Blake's angular frames look nothing like eyes. And it would seem this difference is crucial; in fact, the artificiality of the frame may participate very deeply with those material elements (like the metal plate itself) which Blake struggled to reconcile as he communicated his vision in the inescapably resistant medium of his art. Unlike the human eye, which can manage that which is peripheral, a frame on the page serves to delineate supposedly important space (within the frame) from unimportant space (outside the frame), calling our attention to the artificiality, the framed-ness, of the poem.

Blake's marginalia (the subject of my own research) work against this convention of unimportant space in the text, not so much in that Blake writes important content in the margins, but in that he forges an alternate text (or alternate texts) in spaces left over when books are printed using a standardizing printing process (in which the economics of book production determine the final product). Marginalia, by operating in space that cannot be reached by standardized text, tend to reassert the materiality of "the book" (the artificiality of its layout, for example) which often otherwise disappears, however much it may play a crucial role in asserting and maintaining the authority of what is written. McGann notes in Towards a Literature of Knowledge that "the printed book is one of the most illusionistic of human works, imputing as it does an aura of permanence [and, I argue, authority] to the discourses we manipulate" (12).

Importantly though, despite certain omissions and "stretches," Lundeen's general argument for the way in which language operates in Blake to unseat traditional Western dualisms by metaphorizing the ground and grounding the metaphorical is not seriously at risk. In fact, it is Lundeen's analysis of Blake's use of metaphor and rhetorical devices that makes her work most valuable. In addition, her ability to connect such usages to what must have been a ubiquitous influence for Blake—the Bible—is particularly revealing. And while Lundeen shows how Blake participates in biblical traditions and forms, she does not hesitate to show ways in which he also subverts those traditions.

Problems become more substantial, however, when Lundeen tries to extend her textual analysis into the area of Blake's spiritualism. Consider Northrop Frye's assertion that his book Fearful Symmetry, published in 1947, "offers an explanation of Blake's thought" (3; my italics). In Knight of the Living Dead, Lundeen, despite her efforts to preserve ontological instabilities, even paradoxes, that arise in Blake's work, ultimately frames her argument in terms of Blake's thought. She writes, "In Blake's mind, the artist and the spiritualist coexist on a continuum. Hence, spiritualism for him is not merely a suitable theme for art and literature; it is a modus operandi" (17; my italics). From the start then, Lundeen prepares her reader to be told what Blake had in mind as he worked. What is most problematic about this aspect of her study is that it appears an unnecessary rhetorical framework, given that her analytical work proves to be so energetic, resourceful, agile and revealing. That is, her analysis of Blake's "word-image art" and of the "limitations of analogical language" as they are revealed by Blake's work are, I think, of more primary concern than what might have been "in Blake's mind," if for no other reason than the issues Blake's art forces us to confront (in terms of textuality and the operation of meaning-
creation and authorization) persist, regardless of what Blake might have "meant."

Intentionality itself seemed a dubious concern for Blake. He writes that "not a line is drawn without intention & that most discriminate & particular <as Poetry admits not a Letter that is Insignificant so Painting admits not a Grain of Sand or a Blade of Grass <Insignificant> much less an insignificant Blur or Mark>" (E 560, "A Vision of the Last Judgment"). Yet we know that one aspect of Blake's color-printing process (as evidenced in a work like "Newton" particularly) incorporates the chance, random formations created as paint is transferred from millboard (or metal plate) onto paper (Hamlyn and Phillips 194). How does intention function here? I'd argue that the "intent" is to invite chance into the work of art, but not that each line, blur or mark is to signify something in its own right. If faces emerge (or are made to emerge at some point in the creative process) in certain copies of color-printed works, for example (as Lundeen notes is the case in Urizen plate 7, "in which the design between the figures yields faces, if one looks closely" [149]), I think it is because Blake's artistic process creates the conditions under which such events are possible, not always because Blake "intended" faces from the outset. What Blake had in mind is much less important than the field of possibility that is generated as we encounter each work of art. (I am not entirely sure which copy or numbering system Lundeen is working from here.)

Thus, however successfully Lundeen's work enters into the debates surrounding Blake's textuality—and I think, despite certain omissions, her book enters very successfully into such debates—there remains part of her work tied to earlier critical notions that studying textuality is simply not enough. One must do more. The "more" that Lundeen chooses, then, is to try and tie her study of Blake's textuality (his various responses to the problem of how we encounter verbal and visual graphic marks, the page, and the book) to what she calls Blake's "spiritualism." (162).

Specifically, Lundeen sets out to answer the question: "is there a correlation between his [Blake's] textual and his spiritualistic practices?" (13). As Lundeen notes, there is no shortage of anecdotal evidence telling of Blake's encounters with "spirits," his "experiments in mediumship," his "otherworldly communication" (13,16). Henry Crabb Robinson's Reminiscences provide multiple reports of Blake proclaiming to have conversed with spirits. Most (in)famous of Blake's so-called spiritual encounters might be that reported by John Thomas Smith: "his brother Robert stood before him in one of his visionary imaginations, and so decidedly directed him in the way in which he ought to proceed" (Blake Records 460). This "way" would become Blake's relief-etching process—a process which inverted the standard intaglio method and thus now represents, for Blake critics at least, one of his most "contrary" of material choices. Bentley assures us that "the facts [as reported by Smith] are quite uniformly reliable ... [he had] known Blake personally for over 40 years" (455). But this does not preclude the rather tempting possibility that Blake was, at any given time, putting on a kind of show for whomever he happened to be talking to (perhaps playing the part of the "mystical poet" for those who may have been most eager for and/or susceptible to such a display). Nelson Hilton shows, in Literal Imagination, Blake's capacity for punning and word play (opening up what Hilton refers to as the polysemous, or multidimensional, aspect of Blake's words [10]). Might this predilection for textual play not indicate a temperament capable of many other kinds of humorous, polysemous, play? Certainly there were contextual pressures at work when, for example, Blake signed William Upcott's autograph album, "William Blake one who is very much delighted with being in good Company Born 28 Nov 1757 in London & has died several times since" (Keynes 179). In addition to the text, Blake has drawn a figure touching a scroll-like design that winds overtop and around the words, suggesting the degree to which even the "autograph" was a public performance. Also important to note is Blake's poor physical health at the time and also that Upcott owned a number of Blake's works (and thus Blake may have wanted to play the part of mystical poet as best he could).

That such possibilities are unprovable is exactly the problem I'm pointing to. Lundeen herself admits (almost a third of the way into her book) that many scholars ''dismiss these extravagant claims [about Blake communicating with the dead] as little more than antics which Blake performed on impressionable acquaintances," while others, she notes, "argue for madness." For Lundeen, "neither explanation seems satisfactory" (57). Ultimately, her attempt to connect Blake's thought to his practice requires her to fix in place what that thought might be.

In addition to the problems that biographical reportage entails, as Lundeen extends her textual analysis into Blake's spiritualism, she also opens up the very precarious area of defining just what spiritualism means (to us or to Blake). Her basic argument is, again, to suggest ways in which Blake complicates our traditional sense of how meaning is generated, that is, how the status (or "ontology") of visual and verbal cues both plays into yet disrupts certain fixed, systematic codes like those of grammar or analogic language. In order to move this discussion so that it overlaps with her arguments about Blake's spiritualism, Lundeen chooses, at times, to use the word "spirit" to stand for anything non-material. In one sense, direct discussions of spiritualism disappear from large portions of Knight of the Living Dead, in that Lundeen does not pursue Blake's interaction with the "dead." Yet in another sense, Blake's spiritualism never leaves the discussion, since "spiritualistic practice" is made to encompass all of Blake's work as a poet and engraver; Lundeen even argues that Blake's "implied readers are angels," but that to understand such an assertion, we need to...
understand Blake's definition of angels (22). For Lundeen, every time Blake works he is practicing spiritualism, since, as Knight of the Living Dead tries to show, Blake is constantly looking to undermine "the whole matter/spirit du­alism upon which Western culture is based" (17). In her "Introduction," Lundeen employs the term "spirits" in what strikes me as the conventional sense; that is, spirits as the souls of the dead. Thus she speaks of Blake's "sightings of spirits," his "trespassing the boundaries between here and the hereafter" (13) and his "paranormal communications" (17). However, on page 16 she explains that in the argument to come she will be following Blake's "self-defined spiritualistic practices." (On page 32, she goes, for example, to the Descriptive Catalogue: "A Spirit and a Vision are not, as the modern philosophy supposes, a cloudy vapour or a nothing: they are organized and minutely articulated beyond all that the mortal or perishing nature can produce.")

What emerges from Lundeen's initial question—"is there a correlation between [Blake's] textual and his spiritualistic practices?"—is this: not only are they correlated, but they are, in fact, merely different aspects of the same practice. Both challenge the ontology of the so-called material versus the non-material by way of unseating the dualism upon which one (the material, the empirical, the substantive) is thought to ground the other (the non-material, the visionary, the intangible). The extension of her textual analysis into matters of spiritualism is in part made possible by taking up a very broad, and shifting, definition of what the spiritualistic entails; indeed Lundeen takes up Blake's definition which, as her own study shows, challenges traditional notions of which activities are spiritual and which are not. Inevitably, everything becomes spiritual practice (or practical spiritualism), and anybody can be an angel (Lundeen notes that Blake refers to John Flaxman in a letter, "You O Dear Flaxman are a Sublime Archangel My Friend & Companion from Eternity" [22]).

At the close of her study, Lundeen writes, "we can never extricate ourselves from the net of Urizenic textuality." But by "peering through the seams in Blake's text—the verbal and visual borders—we may discover, as Blake evidently did, that ontological boundaries are actually perceptual boundaries, which dissolve with improved vision" (162). Lundeen does an excellent job of exploring those boundaries, and moves among many of Blake's works, both major and minor, without feeling bound to explicate any one work exhaustively, thus suggesting perhaps the artificiality of the boundaries that we normally assume separate any one of Blake's works from any other, let alone any one element within a work from any other. Lundeen notes Blake's "agility as an intermedia artist" (13), and she herself proves agile as a critical reader.

However much Lundeen's analysis allows us to discover about the "problem of ontology" as it operates in Blake's work, though, the question of intentionality persists throughout. Yet it is a problem that Lundeen herself does not interrogate, asserting, as above, that Blake "evidently" was aware of what his work was doing (162). The problem of intentionality, finally, is not a crippling one in this case, but it does point to an interesting, larger problem emerging in Blake criticism, especially for those, like Lundeen, entering the field with a first book. That is, how to frame an argument so that it participates in discussions as they've been formulated by previous scholars but also so that it says something new. It may very well be that there is still enough anxiety about the "fourth line" of Blake criticism that scholars feel compelled to say something about Blake himself, not just about what kinds of problems the materiality and textuality of his work force. Lundeen's study is an excellent one, and should take its place among those which further illuminate the issues at stake in the detail of Blake's work.

Works Cited

Bentley, G.E., Jr. Email correspondence with Donald Ault. 9 March 1999.
Reviewed by Eugenie R. Freed

Barbara Lachman's "Gathering" of "Voices for Catherine Blake" intends to offer a tribute long overdue. In spite of growing feminist interest in Blake's oeuvre from the 1970's onward, Blake scholarship has only perfunctorily recognized the significance of the role Catherine played in the conception and creation of the bulk of her husband's extant work. In this limited-edition book Lachman has tried to make amends by giving a voice—several voices—to the not-especially-articulate woman whom her husband, after many years of marriage, compared to "a flame of many colours of precious jewels ..." (E 709).

Little has been recorded concerning the historical Catherine. Apart from cursory anecdotes arising from the four years of her widowhood, few facts other than her name and the dates and places of her baptism, marriage and death are known about Catherine as distinct from her husband. Hardly anything is known that she is actually supposed to have said was thought worth reporting by her husband's acquaintance, and though Blake himself and those who knew him record her active participation in the production of his works, only three drawings—one an idealized portrait of her husband—have been authenticated as her own work. To produce a factual biography of Catherine Blake would take the skill and pertinacity of a social historian of the caliber of the late E.P. Thompson (who did not attempt it). To fictionalize the biography or autobiography of an historical personage is a perilous undertaking, the more so when the person concerned lived in such intimate propinquity as Catherine did to a milieu continuously raked over, mined, and sifted through by scholars with diverse special interests. Whether Barbara Lachman has succeeded in avoiding all or most of the inherent hazards, or whether her "Gathering" falls inadvertently into the trap of self-projection, amongst other possible pitfalls, must be for the individual reader to decide.

Lachman's interest in visionaries has already been directed towards Hildegard of Bingen, on whom she has published two studies. In the present fictionalized autobiography, Lachman attempts to recreate imaginatively Catherine Blake's unique experience of loving and living with the visionary William Blake for forty-five years. Catherine, a "spiritual believer in all [Blake's] visions," was involved throughout her married life in many of the practical phases of their realization in her husband's works, and ultimately—Lachman suggests—learned from him to enter into the "Spiritual World" (E 702) herself.

This "Gathering" includes a diversity of narrative voices. They speak through Catherine or support her point of view, tell about her, and speak to her. The narrative structure of the book is complex, at times confusingly so. Mostly, Catherine tells her own story, but periodically the voice of an omniscient narrator takes up the tale, speaking of Catherine in the third person. This narrator sometimes distances herself from her protagonist by directly addressing the reader as well. Sometimes the narrative switches disconcertingly from first to third person, or vice versa, in mid-paragraph. Sporadically yet another voice interjects, addressing Catherine directly (at first formally as "Mrs. Blake"), and drawing her out about aspects of her life in the question-and-answer style of a series of radio or TV interviews. During her sojourn in Felpham Catherine begins to write long letters to her "Friend in Imagination," a woman friend of her own creation who eventually "replies" in letters through which Lachman provides Catherine with yet another voice, emanating from "parts of myself I don't know about" (51) in reflections upon her own subconscious motivations and responses. And on occasion the voice of a "dream-Catherine" (42) speaks, in an account of an obsesively recurring dream experience. Recollecting such dreams, her husband assures her, will take her to "the very next closest neighbourhood [to dreams],... that of visions" (42-43).

Lachman invents the fiction of a "note book" (26), presumably rather like William's, in which Catherine jots down observations, musings, "bits and pieces" (85) of her extraordinary life with William, thereby offering "several windows, through which you have a glimpse of what Will and I together have lived" (7). Sometimes the notebook provides a "welcome ear" (26) for thoughts Catherine feels she cannot share with her husband. The interviewer who appears at intervals, and whom we're encouraged to identify with the author, claims to have had access to these "autobiographical fragments" (47).

When the book begins Catherine is an old woman. She summons up misty memories of her hard but unremarkable life prior to William's entrance into it, before beginning to recreate that first meeting and the early years of their marriage, when her husband taught her to read and write and insisted upon her becoming fluent in literature. The final pages describe the years of Catherine's widowhood, her daily conversations with the spirit of her departed hus-


...event of the Felpham memories, both subsequent events; the Felpham period seems to return continually to Catherine's mind as a kind of watershed between the earlier and the later periods of their marriage.

Certain vignettes that Lachman evokes or invents in order to distinguish Catherine's own viewpoint from the intertwined lives of the couple have the ring of authenticity. The recurrent intrusion of the Felpham memories, both inspiring and traumatic, is eminently plausible. So is Catherine's self-conscious awareness of the intellectual background she lacks, her misgivings that her husband may be dissatisfied with her "ever-wanting intelligence" (40). Such insecurities give rise to the jealousy mingled with fear that rears up to plague Catherine—and consequently, her husband—from time to time throughout her married life. As a working-class woman not only devoid of formal education but also barren, she feels overwhelmed by a sense of her own inferiority to the cultured and accomplished Mary Ann Linnell, wife of Blake's latter-day disciple and benefactor John Linnell, and mother of several young children whose company Blake loved.4 "Mrs. Linnell and her lovely Family" (E 779) make Catherine wince: "It was as if Mrs. Linnell still wanted Will to open his eyes to the subtle qualities he might have missed in a woman by tying his life to mine" (123). In the earlier years of the marriage Catherine's jealousy extended not only to relationships like her husband's friendship with the brilliant "adventuress" (17) Mary Wollstonecraft, but also to his total immersion in his work.4 There are moments of irrational fear when Catherine feels threatened by what appears to her in her husband's demeanor as an "indifference that specifically excluded her . . . ." (39). At other times she knows with certainty that under William's guidance she is "surely expanding in size and understanding" (44), that he recognizes her "as real, a live addition to the world of beauty we served" (44).

Catherine speaks persuasively and with frankness of her sexual relationship with her husband. He "has always admired my body in a way that would scandalize my own mother and most of Battersea if I had any reason to tell them" (17). On the "sacredness of physical love" (95) they are in complete accord. She confides to William the imagery of her own sexual dreams and "coupling visions" (46), some of which he appropriates and transposes to the pages of Milton."The Four Zoas" (74-75). To the question of their childlessness, Catherine alludes to her own exhausted mother's "seven birthings in ten years . . . . Another beast of burden. A workhorse always delivering..." (22). Such early memories may well have left the historical Catherine with little inclination to bear children of her own, even if she had had the choice, as wives never did have in her lifetime. Yet Catherine is so upset by rumors of her "failure as a wife" (22) that she gathers up the courage to tell her husband "if he was wanting a natural son, to lie with some cow like Hagar in the Bible" (22). He roars with "laughter and amazement," reassuring his wife that his passion "is for expression... but it does not demand issuance in broods of children" (22). But that profound sense of stigma was never to leave Catherine, haunting her even after William's death in her suspicion that John Linnell and his fertile wife were united in "their mutual sympathy over Will's misfortune at having spent a lifetime with me" (123).

In this connection Lachman is unable to resist elaborating that "long-exploded story of Blake and his wife basking in the nude in the tropical sunshine of London," Adam and Eve in their Edenically secluded garden in Lambeth. Catherine explains their nudity as part of a sexual "ritual that celebrated a kind of innocence deepened through experience... enhancing pleasure by flooding the senses" (23). She offers her own prosaic version of the exquisite sunrise passage in Blake's Milton,7 to make the point that a sexual relationship like hers with her husband "might be in the cause of something other than propagation, might serve to deepen the appreciation two human beings had for one another and the world of nature" (24).

Catherine describes many of the events that marked the Blakes' married life. Most of her accounts rehearse incidents already well documented, often in Blake's own letters; Catherine's versions here seldom offer a fresh perspective. Nevertheless, Lachman does succeed at times in conveying the frightening emotional intensity of some of these situations through the experience of a woman whose whole world turns about the man she loves:

3. "His widow . . . saw Blake frequently after his decease; he used to come and sit with her two or three hours every day," Anon., The Monthly Magazine xv (March 1833): 245; Blake Records 373.
4. Blake Records 304-05; David Linnell, Blake, Palmer, Linnell & Co.: The Life of John Linnell (Lewes, East Sussex: Book Guild, 1994) 87. A year before Blake's death John and Mary Linnell insisted upon naming a newborn son William in honor of Blake—rather to his distress, since he felt that he was usurping the rights of Mrs. Linnell's father Thomas Palmer (E 779-80).
5. Seymour Kirkup recorded that Catherine had "told me seriously one day, 'I have very little of Mr. Blake's company; he is always in Paradise'" (Blake Records 221).
All is bitter taste when he is sad. The round world squares and makes corners of despair. Fright hides in the corners. Angles packed with demons spitting filth, eyes that drool. ... And when he dies, I wonder will even the lamplighter neglect his rounds and leave us all in darkness? (21)

Their mutual joy in the creation of The Marriage of Heaven and Hell and of America; their sense of London as a city that "reeks with fear, hunger, foment" (20) after news comes from Paris of horrific events following the French Revolution; William's friendships with Tom Paine, with Captain Stedman, with Fuseli; the couple's brief encounter with the Swedenborgian New Jerusalem Church—all pass under review, as well as events of their later life in London and the autumnal blooming of the William Blake cult created by the young disciples who called themselves "The Ancients."

In Felpham, between these early and later periods, Catherine has to deal with frequent illness as well as the importunities of their patron Hayley, whom Blake accused of trying to "act upon my wife" (E 506). To Catherine, Hayley is "sweet syrup, slippery butter" (32) as he tries by his manipulative arts to use her as a conduit through which to convey to her husband his treacherous "concern" that "Mr. Blake will not continue to find work among H's friends if he insists on indulging his own fancies" (32). Later they have to endure the ordeal created by the "untrue fabrications" (35) of the soldier Scofield, who charged Blake with "assault and seditious words" and obliged him to stand trial at Chichester.

Catherine tells of their return to London from Felpham to take up residence in South Molton Street; of her husband's coming back home from the Truchsessian Gallery, preoccupied, after viewing the great works of the masters of his youth, and describes herself, next day, listening in awed, indeed terrified, incomprehension as he bursts forth in exultation at "having emerged from twenty years of darkness" (49). Ultimately Catherine ventures to identify for herself that "spectrous Fiend . . . the ruin of my labours for the last passed twenty years of my life. . . . the enemy of conjugal love . . . " (E 756). That "Fiend," she concludes shrewdly, is "the marketplace, where works of art are bought & sold, and artists bought & sold . . . " (52). From that moment Blake gives up engraving the designs of other artists, or soliciting such work, and plunges into the creation and realization of Milton and of Jerusalem.

I find it difficult to make an overall assessment of this "Gathering." On the credit side, in trying to imagine herself into the mind and heart of a woman whose love for and relationship with her artist husband were her whole life, Lachman often convincingly evokes Catherine's emotional responses—her complexity of feelings about herself, for her husband, and about their shared work. A welcome new dimension emerges as well in projections of Catherine's intellectual growth under the stimulus of her husband's encouragement, and suggestions of her burgeoning interest in reading.

On the other side: at some points Barbara Lachman's own late-twentieth-century, North American, feminist assumptions intrude too obviously into her version of Catherine Blake. A reviewer better qualified than myself has noted the "novelty" of Catherine's supposed work for the blind as "a proper middle-class North American housewifely virtue somewhat surprising in the wife of an obscure London artisan in 1790." That Catherine is "most eager to affirm" Swedenborg's principles about "the right of women to enfranchisement" (65) may reveal more about Lachman's priorities than those of Catherine Blake. And I have to confess that two of the "voices" of this "Gathering" jar in my ears—those of the TV-style interviewer and the pop-psych analyst who writes the letters from Catherine's "Friend in Imagination." In my view these devices threaten to overshadow the sensitivity and genuine empathy with which the author enters her protagonist's consciousness at other points. For instance, in establishing a sense of everyday realism in the Blakes' lives it is certainly appropriate to learn what kind of food William and Catherine might have eaten for dinner, where Catherine might have shopped for the ingredients, and how she contrived to cook in the increasingly confined spaces of the couple's successive lodgings. But is it really appropriate to receive this information through the interrogation of a talk-show host?

Barbara Lachman's venture is a brave one, but from where I stand, only intermittently successful. A writer who attempts to get into the head of an historical personage, sympathetically and in good faith, as Lachman does, should at least get the historical parameters right. Like many of those interested in Blake's work, I do feel the need to know a great deal more about Catherine Blake, an unsung heroine who has yet to be acknowledged as the courageous woman of many parts that she had to be in real life. But these Voices for Catherine Blake leave me still largely unsatisfied.


NEWSLETTER

At the Modern Language Association convention for 2002, Morton D. Paley was honored with the Distinguished Scholar Award of the Keats-Shelley Association of America.


For other news, please visit the newsletter section of our web site at www.blakequarterly.org.
PROPHETIC CHARACTER

Essays on William Blake in Honor of John E. Grant
Edited by Alexander S. Gourlay


LOCUST HILL PRESS
Box 260, West Cornwall, CT 06796 USA
860-672-0060 (Tel) 860-672-4968 (Fax)
email: locusthill@optonline.net